



**Project Name & Address:** 1104 Jenifer Street

**Application Type(s):** Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations in the Third Lake Ridge historic district.

**Legistar File ID #** [55456](#)

**Prepared By:** Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

**Date Prepared:** April 30, 2019

## Summary

**Project Applicant/Contact:** Scott B. Thronton

**Requested Action:** The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for an addition and construction of a new garage structure.

## Background Information

**Parcel Location/Information:** The site is located at 1104 Jenifer Street in the Third Lake Ridge Local Historic District.

### Relevant State Statute Section:

**Wisc SS 62.23(7)(em)2m.** In the repair or replacement of a property that is designated as a historic landmark or included within a historic district or neighborhood conservation district under this paragraph, a city shall allow an owner to use materials that are similar in design, color, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities.

### Relevant Landmarks Ordinance Sections:

#### **41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.**

- (2) Demolition or Removal. In determining whether to approve a certificate of appropriateness for any demolition or removal of any landmark or structure within a historic district, the Landmarks Commission shall consider all of the following, and may give decisive weight to any or all of the following:
- (a) Whether the structure is of such architectural or historic significance that its demolition or removal would be detrimental to the public interest and contrary to the general welfare of the people of the City and the State.
  - (b) Whether a landmark's designation has been rescinded.
  - (c) Whether the structure, although not itself a landmark structure, contributes to the distinctive architectural or historic character of the historic district as a whole and therefore should be preserved for the benefit of the people of the City and the State.
  - (d) Whether demolition or removal of the subject property would be contrary to the policy and purpose of this ordinance and/or to the objectives of the historic preservation plan for the applicable historic district as duly adopted by the Common Council.
  - (e) Whether the structure is of such old and unusual or uncommon design, method of construction, or material that it could not be reproduced or be reproduced only with great difficulty and/or expense.

- (f) Whether retention of the structure would promote the general welfare of the people of the City and the State by encouraging study of American history, architecture and design or by developing an understanding of American culture and heritage.
- (g) The condition of the property, provided that any deterioration of the property which is self-created or which is the result of a failure to maintain the property as required by this chapter cannot qualify as a basis for the issuance of a certificate of appropriateness for demolition or removal.
- (h) Whether any new structure proposed to be constructed or change in use proposed to be made is compatible with the historic resources of the historic district in which the subject property is located, or if outside a historic district, compatible with the mass and scale of buildings within two hundred (200) feet of the boundary of the landmark site.

Prior to approving a certificate of appropriateness for demolition, the Landmarks Commission may require the applicant to provide documentation of the structure. Documentation shall be in the form required by the Commission.

#### **41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.**

- (8) Standards for New Structures in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use. Any new structures on parcels zoned for mixed-use and residential use that are located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways: (Am. by ORD-16-00082, 9-15-16)
  - (a) Gross Volume.
  - (b) Height.
  - (c) The proportion and rhythm of solids to voids in the street facades.
  - (d) Materials used in the street facades.
  - (e) The design of the roof.
  - (f) The rhythm of buildings and masses.
  - (g) Directional expression.
  - (h) Materials, patterns and textures.
  - (i) Landscape treatment.
- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.
  - a) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned residential use that are located within 200 feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
    - (i) Height
    - (ii) Landscape treatment
    - (iii) Rhythm of mass and spaces
  - b) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical proportion and rhythm of solids to voids.
  - c) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical materials.
  - d) Alterations of the roof of any existing structure shall retain its existing historical appearance.
  - e) Alterations of the street facade(s) shall retain the original or existing historical proportional relationships of door sizes to window sizes.

## Analysis and Conclusion

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to create an addition on the rear of the house that will include partial demolition of a previously enclosed rear porch and to construct a garage at the rear of the property. The discussion will analyze the work on the principal structure and the new garage separately.

### Rear Addition

While the house was constructed in 1880, the Sanborn maps do not include it until 1898. At that point, the rear porch appears to already be enclosed. Although it is possible this was always an enclosed single-story addition to the house, it reads like a rear porch that was subsequently enclosed due to it having a shed roof rather than a gable as the rest of the house does. The rear wing of the house is small in size and does not possess significance in and of itself. The single-story addition that will replace it will also cover portions of the rest of the house, but will not cover any architecturally significant features.

A discussion of the relevant ordinance section of Chapter 41.23 follows:

### **41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.**

- (2) Demolition or Removal. In determining whether to approve a certificate of appropriateness for any demolition or removal of any landmark or structure within a historic district, the Landmarks Commission shall consider all of the following, and may give decisive weight to any or all of the following:
  - (a) While the overall structure is significant due to being an early house in the historic district, the rear wing of the house is not a character-defining feature of the house.
  - (b) N/A
  - (c) The home contributes to the character of the Third Lake Ridge Historic District, but the rear wing of the house is not a part of that significance.
  - (d) Removal of the rear wing of the house will not contravene the ordinance or objects of the City.
  - (e) The rear wing is not of exceptional architectural significance or construction.
  - (f) Retention of the rear wing would not promote the general welfare of the people of the City and the State by encouraging study of American history, architecture and design or by developing an understanding of American culture and heritage.
  - (g) Removal of the wing of the house is not due to neglect, but rather the desire of the property owner to rehabilitate the existing structure in order to accommodate its ongoing use.
  - (h) The new single-story wing proposed to replace the existing rear wing will be in keeping with the character of the property and of the Third Lake Ridge Historic District, including the properties within 200 feet.

Staff does not believe that the rear wing of the house requires additional documentation prior to demolition.

### **41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT**

- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.
  - a) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned residential use that are located within 200 feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
    - (i) Height: The proposed rear addition is in keeping with the height of the current rear wing of the house. It is also in keeping with the height of other structures within 200 feet.

- (ii) Landscape treatment: As a new addition to a historic structure, it is located to the rear corner and therefore is in keeping with the configuration of the building on the landscape. The applicant has not submitted a landscaping plan, but this does not seem necessary for a rear addition.
  - (iii) Rhythm of mass and spaces: By creating a single-story addition to the rear corner of the house, it is both in keeping with the previous evolution of the house and with additions on other houses within 200 feet.
- b) While a portion of the rear addition will be visible from the street, this work will not alter the historic street façade of the house.
  - c) Again, this is not an alteration to the street façade, but the addition will utilize materials that are currently utilized on the rest of the house.
  - d) The roof of the addition will incorporate the mixed roof form that currently exists on the house. It will include a gable on the east side and a hip roof on the north. The hip roof mimics the roof currently in place on the front porch.
  - e) The addition will include period-appropriate doors and windows, with a placement that matches the historic rhythm of those on the historically located on the house. The windows will be a 2/2 double-hung window that is aluminum clad on the exterior, which will match the windows on the rest of the house. The siding of the addition will be vinyl, which is what is currently installed on the house.

#### New Garage

The property currently does not have a garage. The applicant has proposed two options for construction of a new garage. The first proposal mimics the house form with a gable-front and wing. The other proposal would mimic a barn. Of the garages located within 200 feet and within the district, they are a mix of gable-front, side-gabled, and flat roofed. There is one historic barn that is now being used as a garage (see applicant's submission).

While the gable form of the barn style alternative is more in keeping with the style of accessory buildings within the district, staff is concerned about created a false sense of history. However, the height of the barn style garage would be more in keeping with the rhythm of the structures that face onto Ingersoll St. The cross-gabled alternative would mimic the overall form of the house, but reads less like a traditional garage and there are no other garages of this style within 200 feet. However, as a building that would face onto Ingersoll, it is different from other garages, which are typically hidden behind the principal building and nested into the rear corner of a narrow and deep lot.

#### **41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT**

- (8) Standards for New Structures in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use. Any new structures on parcels zoned for mixed-use and residential use that are located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways: (Am. by ORD-16-00082, 9-15-16)
  - (a) Gross Volume. The volume of the garage is in keeping with the garages within 200 feet.
  - (b) Height. The height of the garage is in keeping with the height of other garages within 200 feet.
  - (c) The proportion and rhythm of solids to voids in the street facades.
  - (d) Materials used in the street facades. As a corner lot, this garage will be more visible than other garages within 200 feet, but as either design would utilize materials found on the house, it meets this standard.
  - (e) The design of the roof. The barn-style proposal is in keeping with the gable-front accessory buildings within the 200-foot visual compatibility area. It does not appear that other garages have a cross-gabled roof as proposed in in the first alternative.

- (f) The rhythm of buildings and masses. As a garage on a corner lot, it will be visible from Ingersoll St. The garage is set back to accommodate Zoning-required onsite parking. The form of either building even with the required setback to accommodate parking will allow the garage to both replicate the rhythm of buildings and masses for accessory buildings located at the rear of a lot and of the street-face along Ingersoll.
- (g) Directional expression. As a single-story accessory building with a gable roof, the barn-style building provides the verticality of the gable-front accessory buildings within 200 feet. The cross-gabled option provides a mix of horizontal and vertical expression, which is in keeping with the varied forms of buildings (both accessory and principal) within 200 feet.
- (h) Materials, patterns and textures. The materials on the garage will match those found on the house.
- (i) Landscape treatment. The driveway leading to the garage doors is in keeping with the hardscape style of landscape treatment for other garages.

## Recommendation

Given the context of the site, staff does not have a preference for either of the garage proposals, with the caveat that the barn style could create a false sense of history, but the overall front-gable form is in keeping with the character of buildings within 200 feet. Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the demolition of the rear wing of the house, construction of a rear addition to the house, and construction of a new garage have been met and recommends the Landmarks Commission approve this request subject to the following conditions:

- Approval of the roofing, siding, trim, window, and door specifications be approved by staff