

AGENDA # 10

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: September 24, 2008
TITLE: 100 North Hamilton Street – Building/Façade Addition and Site Alteration in the C4 District. 4 th Ald. Dist. (12028)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: William A. Fruhling, Acting Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: September 24, 2008	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Lou Host-Jablonski; Chair, Todd Barnett, Richard Slayton, Ald. Marsha Rummel, Ron Luskin, Dawn Weber, Bruce Woods, and John Harrington.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of September 24, 2008, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL** of a building/façade addition and site alteration in the C4 District. Appearing on behalf of the project were Ruth Shelly, Mike Huffman, Mark Lefebure, and Fred Lind. Shelly gave an overview of the project and stated that they will be restoring the openings for the original door and storefront windows. She stated that the project will incorporate a useable rooftop and that they will be seeking LEED certification. Lefebure further described the architecture and stated that a rear elevator/stair tower is required and they are proposing to clad it in a more brightly colored EIFS. Huffman stated that they will come back to the Commission to seek approval of signage and banners and that they are not part of this request.

The Commission discussed the following points:

- Whether the structures on the roof should compliment the historic character of the building, or be more colorful.
- EIFS is not an appropriate material on a major civic building, so alternative higher quality materials (such as metal panels) should be explored.
- The need to see some additional images of the barrier around the perimeter of the roof so the Commission can better understand how that element, and the landscaping, etc. behind it, will be perceived.

ACTION:

On a motion by Barnett, seconded by Rummel, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL** of a building/façade addition and site alteration in the C4 District, subject to the following conditions:

1. That a alternative materials for EIFS on the stair/elevator tower be explored with the goal of not adding any new EIFS to the building;

2. That the rooftop elements be revisited to either make them more in keeping with the architecture of the building or more playful;
3. That the project be referred to the Preservation Planner, or the Landmarks Commission if she deems it necessary.

The motion passed on a vote of 6-0-2 with Host-Jablonski and Luskin abstaining.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 7, 7, 7.5, 7.5 and 9.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 100 North Hamilton Street

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	7.5
	-	7	6	-	-	-	7	7
	-	7	-	7	-	-	8	7.5
	-	6	-	-	-	-	7	7
	7	6	-	-	-	-	7	-
	-	9	9	9	-	-	9	9

General Comments:

- Reusing a historic building is great. Please do roof element right. It should be fun and address architecture. Restoring prow of building and entries is exciting. No EIFS!
- Exciting – keep it lively.
- Fence treatment is important.
- Terrific! But no EIFS or fiber cement.