

AGENDA # 5

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: September 19, 2007
TITLE: 702 North Midvale Boulevard – Hilldale Redevelopment SIP #3 – Amended PUD(SIP) for a Hotel and Open Space Areas in Urban Design District No. 6. 11 th Ald. Dist.	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: September 19, 2007	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Paul Wagner, Chair; Jay Ferm, Richard Slayton, Bruce Woods*, and Marsha Rummel, Lou Host-Jablonski and Todd Barnett.

*Woods abstained on this item.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of September 19, 2007, the Urban Design Commission **RECEIVED AN INFORMATIONAL PRESENTATION** on a PUD(GDP-SIP) located at 702 North Midvale Boulevard. Appearing on behalf of the project were Mike Sturm, Adam Fink, Scott McLamore, Ray White, and Steven Siehr. Prior to this presentation, staff noted that project provides for the relocation of a proposed hotel, the main component of the recently reviewed Hilldale Redevelopment SIP No. 3 to be relocated as an amendment to the previously approved Hilldale Redevelopment SIP No. 2. The amendment relocates the hotel to a site on which a 90-unit condominium tower was approved as part of the Phase II Hilldale Redevelopment which also included the approval of Whole Foods, another condominium tower, additional retail/commercial, interconnected by a parking structure. The amendment provides that the former hotel site and associated open space lands is now designated for mixed-use development. The relocated hotel provides for the development of a 140-room, 6-story hotel which still overly two levels of retail commercial including a previously proposed health club. The overall design of the hotel features a lower-level drop-off hotel lobby adjacent to Hilldale Way with the housing component hotel located on the upper terraced at the end of an enhanced upper plaza connecting the Whole Foods building and the remaining residential tower. The revised plans featured an enlarged upper plaza with green amenities such as a more expansive green roof areas and landscaping, along with a lower level formal entry to the hotel which provides a new face to a formerly visible precast parking structure. A memo distributed to the Commission from Ald. Gruber was noted by Wagner. Ald. Gruber expressed his support of the project and requested that the Urban Design Commission look at the lower hotel drop-off area relevant to conflicts with pedestrian movement and the relocation of the drop-off needing to be on the building side of the hotel.

Following the presentation the Commission noted the following:

- Provide covered bike parking on the upper deck next to the hotel, including a covered area at the drop-off. Incorporate an 8-inch wide ramp by the handrail with stairs in the lower ramp to provide for more functional access for bikes to the upper plaza area.

- The planter treatment along the east side of Hilldale Way could be consistent with the curb side planter location along the west side of Hilldale Way adjacent to the hotel drop-off.
- The drop-off area's architecture needs a lot of study in regards to providing further details on how cars move through with consideration that the support column at the drop-off needs to be more of an architectural feature.
- The footprint of the hotel on the upper plaza needs to be restudied, the curved roof elements are provided for mechanicals but not on areas of the building's façade where there are people.
- The architecture needs to engage upper building features with the lower building façade.
- The plaza at the front of the hotel could be really nice for its occupants and the adjacent tower.
- Need to find a way to bring people around to the front plaza from the rear as well as to bring them down to the entry grade at the front of the lower level of the hotel building.
- Need to create a visual connection from the lower drop-off hotel element and the upper plaza.
- Need to bring details of the previously approved restaurant's architecture as well as details of the other features of the Phase II SIP in coordination with the architecture of the new hotel lower entry façade with the need to resolve the split personality between the various elements; disjointed and disconnected.
- Provide context with previous approvals especially architecture. Think about the restaurant building's potential for design changes due to the new hotel and possible tenant changes.
- Consider an oval opening in the façade architecture hotel to see through a connect to the other elements of the upper plaza.
- Restudy the trellis views on the upper plaza in addition to pulling back the drop-off at the lower level to relieve pinching with the adjacent Hilldale Way.

Following the presentation the Commission generally emphasized the need to provide context as well as coordination of the revised hotel proposal with the elements, especially the architecture of the other components approved with the Phase II development such as the adjacent residential tower, the underlying retail/commercial below the upper hotel, the adjacent restaurant and parking structure.

ACTION:

Since this was an **INFORMATIONAL PRESENTATION**, no formal action was taken by the Commission.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 4/5, 5, 6 and 6.5.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 702 North Midvale Boulevard

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	6.5
	5	5	-	-	-	4	5	4/5
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
	6	6	-	8	-	5	7	6
	5	5	-	-	-	5	5	5

General Comments:

- Very good start. Look at:
 - Drop-off architect.
 - Integrate drop-off and hotel proper.
 - Connect east terrace with Whole Foods/Condos.
 - Use curve in “valued” manner, that is where habitable space is. Recognize axial relationship off upper parking deck.
- Address entrance, connection between buildings – hotel tower and drop-off. Address street level connections to 2nd floor plaza. Context plan next time; linkages to Bldg. M and Whole Foods. This iteration/new location solves some problems but loses view and relation to park location. Good start. Look forward to your next presentation.
- Interesting beginning. Concepts, access, and circulation elements need further study. Need better presentation of the architectural context too.
- East wall along Hilldale Way massive and cold.
- Need to visually and physically connect beautiful plazas to hotel entry and Hilldale Way. Hotel entry is too crowded between parking structure, lobby and back of Sentry.
- Vehicle drop-off/entry needs more study so as to become an architectural feature and look more like an entrance. Need to see context with small corner retail building.