



# Bay Creek Neighborhood Association

To: City of Madison Urban Design Commission

From: Bay Creek Neighborhood Association, Planning & Economic Development Committee

Re: Proposed Plans for Development at 1109 South Park Street

Date: October 25, 2016

---

While this proposal has improved in some respects over previous iterations, the neighborhood believes that it still has **problems related to its density and height**, which put it **at odds with BCNA's Position on Development on Park Street Between Haywood and Wingra** and **previous city-approved planning guidelines**. Given the residential nature of the adjoining streets, the model that neighbors envisioned for this location and discussed multiple times with the Jade Garden development team was that of the 3-story mixed-use buildings along Monroe Street and in particular the development on Willy Street at Baldwin.

While neighbors advocate mixed-use development for the Park Street corridor, we insist upon a maximum of 3 stories at this location because of the proximity of the lot to adjacent residential properties and because of the 10' rise along the last block of Emerson to Park Street. On the east side of South Park Street in the area around the proposed development, buildings are one and two stories.

The proposed development, then, would be much taller than its surroundings, out-of-scale, and both **incompatible and overwhelming with the lower-rise, single-family homes to the east**. It would not blend with the existing reality of Park Street immediately north and south and would importantly **cast shade over neighbors' solar panels throughout the year**.

The building further would present **an abrupt transition to neighboring properties**, which is out of keeping with UDD7 guidelines, BCNA's Position on Development on Park Street, and other new developments along Park Street. It is detrimental to the visual integrity of the street. The **presence of storefronts along Emerson Street constitutes a further intrusion of the urban corridor/commercial space into the adjacent residential space** and detracts from rather than enhances the neighborhood and neighboring properties (a requirement of any conditional use for additional stories in this TSS zone).

The fact that the **residential units of this development targets short-term renters**, who have no incentive to integrate with the neighborhood, is yet another way in which this building is out of character with its surrounding and has no place in a neighborhood prized for its stability, cohesiveness, and its single-family occupancy character.

Lastly the proposed development would **dramatically increase the traffic flow along Emerson and nearby residential streets**. The placement of the entrance and exit to the parking lot be is potentially dangerous to the children living on the street and **disruptive to the quiet, residential character of the neighborhood**. The parking lot itself needs is configured so that nearby neighbors will suffer the **intrusion of headlights and noise from cars and garbage trucks** which the proposed screen of plantings along the alley will do nothing to hide.

In sum we feel that the proposed Jade Garden development will **compromise the quality of life, aesthetic harmony, and human scale of Bay Creek's stable, established community**. Thank you for taking these concerns into consideration.



To: City of Madison Urban Design Commission  
From: Bay Creek Neighborhood Association  
Re: Redevelopment of the 1100 block of South Park Street  
Date: October 23, 2016

---

*In October 2016, Bay Creek neighbors reviewed the plans before you for the redevelopment of the 1100 block of South Park Street and found the proposed development incompatible with the Bay Creek Neighborhood Association (BCNA) position statement in support of development along Park Street. The BCNA statement, passed unanimously in April 2016, specifies aspects of development that would enhance the character of single-family, owner-occupied Bay Creek and sets limits on those aspects of developments that threaten to compromise or render vulnerable its integrity.*

**The plan to redevelop the 1100 block of Park Street is at odds with several of the development principles articulated in the “Bay Creek Position on Development on South Park Street between Haywood Drive and Wingra Creek.”**

**Item 2:** Development along Park Street should respect and protect the established uses and enjoyments of existing properties. To the contrary, the proposed development will have a negative impact upon existing homes by intruding upon them with shade (compromising energy generation from solar panels); with light from the five-story stairwell, store windows, and headlights in the surface parking lot; noise from cars and garbage trucks in the surface parking lot; new lines of sight from apartments into yards and rooms; and an overall level of busyness unsuited to a quiet, residential street.

**Item 3:** Building(s) located on the Park Street corridor immediately adjacent to existing homes should transition smoothly to the neighborhood. By exceeding a 3-story limit, being of a mass and scale that overwhelms the adjacent 1.5 and 2-story homes, and not stepping down to the height of adjacent dwellings, and, in addition, not emphasizing four-sided architectural design, the proposed building creates an abrupt disjunction with residences on Emerson.

**Item 7:** Density guidelines as set forth in the Comprehensive Plan and the Wingra BUILD Plan should be respected and conditional use permits for more residential density should not be allowed without a clear benefit to neighboring residents. Wingra Build was intended to introduce higher density, mid-rise housing to the west side of Park Street only; it pinpointed the former Dean/Morningstar Dairy site for the greatest density it proposed and limited that to 30-50 dwelling units per acre.

The lot for the proposed Jade Garden development is 0.641 acres. By Wingra Build standards, it should hold around 25 units, rather than the proposed 38 (15 studios, 17 1-bedrooms, and 6 2-bedroom units. However the Jade Garden site is on the east, residential side of Park Street, hard up against homes. So density should be lower than that recommended by Wingra Build for the “island” that is now the Wingra Point II site. The Jade Garden site is appropriate for low-density, low-rise housing. It will be to the detriment rather than the benefit of neighbors to erect a high-density housing development on this site.

**Item 10:** The design of new developments/redevelopments should harmonize with the aesthetic character of existing homes and the community. The proposed four-story development will feel like a five-story building—because of the 10-foot rise to Park Street at Emerson—from the vantage point of adjacent residential properties. It threatens to dwarf and overwhelm its nearby neighbors both visually and practically. It will create a locus of transiency, with its emphasis on small, high-turnover units, in a neighborhood prized for its stability. While located along an urban corridor, its primary entrance and even additional store fronts face the homes on Emerson. It is not at all suited to the character of the neighborhood.

**For these reasons, while we heartily support redevelopment of the 1100 block of South Park Street, BCNA opposes the proposed development of the 1100 block of South Park as currently designed.**

We advocate instead a development plan that would:

1. Keep the building to 3 stories to avoid the corollary problems of:
  - a. Shading nearby residential solar panels
  - b. Visually overwhelming adjacent homes
  - c. Large numbers of parking spots for tenants.

2. Move the parking entrance and exit to Park Street to avoid:
  - a. Routing additional commercial and residential traffic east on Emerson and into the neighborhood
  - b. Disturbing nearby homeowners with parking noise and headlights from parking cars.
3. Transition smoothly from the building's 3 stories along Park Street to 2 stories on Emerson and thereby integrate with the 1.5- and 2-story homes of the neighborhood.
4. Include family-sized units to encourage long-term residency rather than the high-turnover of efficiencies and 1-bedroom units targeting parents of foreign students to avoid eroding the stable character of Bay Creek.

In summary, it is very important for us to ensure that this development enhance and complement, rather than detract from, our residential neighborhood. We feel that this development as proposed will not be a positive addition to Bay Creek even as it sets a precedent for future development along the east side of Park Street in Bay Creek and beyond. Development that meets both residential and commercial criteria and integrates with existing land uses has been done successfully in other neighborhoods (in particular in the Williamson-Marquette neighborhood), and we feel that a great neighborhood such as Bay Creek deserves nothing less than the best development we as a community can provide.

Respectfully,

Members of Bay Creek Neighborhood Association's Planning & Economic Development Committee



## Bay Creek Neighborhood Association

To: City of Madison Urban Design Commission

From: Bay Creek Neighborhood Association, Planning & Economic Development Committee

Re: Proposed Plans for Development at 1109 South Park Street

Date: October 25, 2016

---

Resolution passed at BCNA General Meeting, September 12, 2016:

The Bay Creek Neighborhood Association finds that the proposed development at 1109 S. Park Street (from plans dated 8/16) does not conform to the guidelines and principles for Park Street development (Position on Development on Park Street between Haywood and Wingra) as passed by BCNA in April 2016.

Plans for the proposed development have since changed. However with respect to those factors enumerated in the position statement, the proposed development is still non-conforming.

**BAY CREEK NEIGHBORHOOD ASSOCIATION  
POSITION ON DEVELOPMENT ON SOUTH PARK STREET  
BETWEEN HAYWOOD DRIVE AND WINGRA CREEK**

Bay Creek residents have actively participated in preparing planning documents to guide development in our neighborhood. These documents include the Bay Creek Neighborhood Plan, the Wingra BUILD Plan, the South Madison Neighborhood Plan, and the Park Street Urban Design Guidelines. As a neighborhood association, we support redevelopment of the Park Street Urban Corridor and look forward to the enrichment such development holds for Bay Creek, South Madison, and the city as a whole.

Bay Creek is an established residential, largely owner-occupied community bisected by South Park Street. The Park Street Corridor lies within Bay Creek's boundaries from Haywood Drive to Wingra Creek. It is thus important that development and redevelopment within the Park Street Corridor respect the life and values, integrity, and character of our community in balance with the demands and requirements of growth. Development along Park Street should not be allowed to adversely affect nearby residentially zoned areas, both those east and west of South Park Street between Haywood Drive and Wingra Creek. This is especially true for those blocks between Haywood Drive and Cedar Street where the commercial lots along South Park Street to the east have a relatively shallow and angled footprint with adjacent residential lots as immediate neighbors.

Drawing on many of the recommendations of the above-mentioned plans as a starting place and on recent conversations among neighbors, Bay Creek Neighborhood Association unanimously voted in favor of the following criteria for development along Park Street at its April 11, 2016 meeting:

- 1) Bay Creek's residential-zoned properties or parts thereof should not be rezoned for higher-density residential or commercial use. The City of Madison designates properties bordering on Park Street as Community Mixed Use, with Traditional Shopping Street (TSS) zoning from Haywood to south of Emerson to the east and with Commercial Corridor-Transitional (CC-T) zoning south of Emerson to the east and from Midland to Wingra to the west. The adjoining residential neighborhood to the east and along Midland and South streets to the west is low-density residential with TR-C2 zoning and should not be changed for purposes of development or redevelopment.
- 2) Development along Park Street should respect and protect the established uses and enjoyments of existing properties. Where a new or redeveloped building, or changed use of an existing building, would have a negative impact upon existing homes/businesses, its intrusion(s) must be remedied during the project development phase. Intrusions include shade, glare, noise, invasion of privacy (new lines of sight into yards and rooms), light pollution, smoke/fumes/noxious odors, traffic congestion, parking, etc. If remedy is not possible, then the proposed building is not appropriate for the site and should not be approved.
- 3) Building(s) located on the Park Street corridor immediately adjacent to existing homes should transition smoothly to the neighborhood. This is especially true between Emerson and

Spruce streets where Park Street rises above the other streets immediately to its east and west by up to 10 feet. New/redeveloped buildings on the east side of Park Street should:

- a. Hold to a 3-story limit. The City should not grant conditional use permits for extra height as this would not meet the criteria of added benefit to residential uses.
- b. Be of a mass and/or scale appropriate to the footprint of the lot and to the adjacent residential lots so as to not present an overwhelming presence.
- c. Step down to the height of adjoining neighborhood homes.
- d. Maintain setbacks. The City should not grant zoning variances of setback standards.
- e. Emphasize four-sided architectural design.

4) Commercial properties along Park Street should have designated loading zones along Park Street for deliveries in order not to block residential driveways or cause noise pollution to nearby residential properties. These must be established during the planning stages of a development.

5) Adequate underground or off-street parking for higher-density residential and commercial uses is critical because of a general parking shortage in the neighborhood. There must be adequate and marked ingress and egress to and from parking areas along Park Street in order not to unduly increase traffic along residential streets or disrupt traffic to or from, or along Park Street and nearby side streets.

6) Refuse storage and collection should be adequately managed and appropriately located so that garbage, garbage odors, and garbage collection do not adversely affect nearby neighbors

7) Density guidelines as set forth in the Comprehensive Plan and the Wingra BUILD Plan should be respected. Conditional use permits to allow for more residential density should not be allowed without a clear benefit to neighboring residents.

8) Conditional use permits for commercial development that will benefit the nearby neighbors and reduce traffic and parking demand should be encouraged. Conversely, commercial or other uses that will disturb neighbors' uses and enjoyments of their properties should be denied. Emphasis should be placed on making Park Street a destination street with adequate green spaces, trees, and pedestrian, public transit, and bicycle amenities rather than a high-speed corridor for commuters passing through. A balance of business types (retail, services, commercial, and restaurant) is encouraged.

9) Redevelopment of the open sites zoned CC-T along the west side of Park Street south of Olin Avenue should include an adequate street network and sufficient on-site parking, particularly if larger and higher-density buildings are planned. Such development must respect the principles and protections articulated above regarding the residentially zoned properties along South and Midland Streets.

10) The design of new developments/redevelopments should harmonize with the aesthetic character of existing homes and the community.