

**PLANNING UNIT REPORT
DEPARTMENT OF PLANNING AND DEVELOPMENT
of November 29, 2006**

RE: LD. # 04597: Zoning Map Amendment LD. 3226 To Rezone 1516 – 1610 Gilson Street & 1507 Beld Street from C3 (Highway Commercial District) to PUD-GDP-SIP

1. Requested Actions: Approval of a request to rezone 1516 – 1610 Gilson Street & 1507 Beld Street from C3 (Highway Commercial District) to Planned Unit Development, General Development Plan/ Specific Implementation Plan (PUD-GDP-SIP) to allow demolition of a single-family residence and a barbershop and the construction of a new mixed-use building containing 5,200 square-feet of retail space and 13 rental apartment units.
2. Applicable Regulations: Section 28.07 (6) of the Zoning Ordinance provides the requirements and framework for Planned Unit Developments; Section 28.12 (9) provides the process for zoning map amendments; Section 28.04 (22) provides the guidelines and regulations for the approval of demolition permits.
3. Report Prepared By: Timothy M. Parks, Planner.

GENERAL INFORMATION

1. Applicant & Property owner: Clarence Brown, BESHM Investment Group, LLC; 1610 Gilson Street; Madison; Ed Banks, representative.
2. Development Schedule: The applicants wish to commence construction as soon as all regulatory approvals have been granted, with completion scheduled for November 2007.
3. Location: Approximately 0.58 acres located at the northeast corner of Beld and Gilson streets, Aldermanic District 13; Madison Metropolitan School District.
4. Existing Conditions (from west to east): A single-family residence at 1507 Beld Street, a two-story barbershop at 1610 Gilson Street, and a one-story shop/ warehouse at 1516 Gilson Street, all zoned C3 (Highway Commercial District).
5. Proposed Land Use: A two-story mixed-use building with 13 rental apartment units and approximately 5,200 square feet of retail space.
6. Surrounding Land Use and Zoning:
North: One and two-family residences on Pine Street, zoned R2 (Single-Family Residence District);
S & E: Various warehousing and light industrial uses, including a South Central Library System service facility, all zoned M1 (Limited Manufacturing District);

West: J &K Security Solutions, Midas Muffler and Arby's Restaurant on S. Park Street, zoned C3 (Highway Commercial District).

7. **Adopted Land Use Plan:** The Comprehensive Plan identifies this site and the area generally east of Beld Street and north/ west of Gilson Street area for low-density residential uses. The South Madison Neighborhood Plan calls for the transition of the heavy commercial and industrial uses primarily present along the south and east sides of Gilson Street to a mix of single and multi-family residential uses. The plan also encourages the fronting of new buildings toward Gilson Street and the retention of existing small and mid-sized neighborhood businesses in the area.
8. **Environmental Corridor Status:** The property is not located within a mapped environmental corridor. The southern edge of the property as well as properties along the south side of Gilson Street are located within 300 feet of the ordinary high-water mark of Wingra Creek.
9. **Public Utilities & Services:** The property is served by a full range of urban services.

STANDARDS FOR REVIEW

This application is subject to the demolition standards of Section 28.04 (22) and the Planned Unit Development District standards.

PLAN REVIEW

The applicant is requesting approval of planned unit development zoning to allow an existing single-family residence and the two-story Style and Grace Salon barbershop generally located at the northeast corner of Beld and Gilson streets to be demolished and a new mixed-use building containing 13 residential apartments and approximately 5,200 square feet of retail space to be constructed. A one-story concrete block shop/ warehouse building located at 1516 Gilson Street owned by the applicant will also be included in the requested planned unit development district with a note reserving that portion of the L-shaped 0.58-acre site for future redevelopment on a subsequent specific implementation plan and demolition application.

Background

The subject site comprises most of a half-block generally bounded on the south and east by Gilson Street and Beld Street on the west with the exception of a one-story warehouse structure located at 1602 Gilson Street that is in separate ownership. A one-lane, partially improved mid-

ID #04597:
1516- 1610 Gilson St.
& 1507 Beld Street
November 29, 2006
Page 3

block alley separates the site from mostly single-family residences located on the south side of Pine Street. The site is located north and west across Gilson Street from a variety of commercial, light industrial and storage uses that generally back onto the Union Pacific Railroad located further east. The site is generally located behind a mix of predominantly highway commercial uses fronting onto S. Park Street, which is located a half-block west of the property.

The single-family residence to be demolished is addressed 1507 Beld Street and was constructed in 1909 according to City records. The residence stands two-stories and includes a two-car garage located east of the residence with access from the mid-block alley that forms the northern boundary of the PUD. The barbershop is addressed 1610 Gilson Street and is a two-story frame building with a flat/ hip roof that was originally built as a residence. A shed and surface parking area are located to the rear of the barbershop. The rest of the site south of the residence and west of the barbershop is open undeveloped land occupied by a handful of mature canopy trees and two conifers.

The developer suggests that both the single-family residence and barbershop building are both candidates for demolition, noting in particular that the barbershop "is in an advanced state of disrepair," including structural failings, outdated electrical fixtures and water damage. No specific data on the condition of the residence is provided. The Planning Unit has not toured the buildings, but has conducted a windshield survey and found the barbershop to appear to be in below average condition, while the house appears to be in a condition commensurate with its age.

The South Madison Neighborhood Plan calls for the redevelopment of the commercial and industrial uses primarily present along the south and east sides of Gilson Street to a mix of single and multi-family residential uses. Lands generally north and west of Gilson Street are largely encouraged to remain single-family in nature. However, this site provides an opportunity to transition from the higher density development to the south and east. The plan also encourages the fronting of new buildings toward Gilson Street and the retention of existing small and mid-sized neighborhood businesses in the area. The Comprehensive Plan identifies this site and the area generally east of Beld Street and north/ west of Gilson Street area for low-density residential uses, with medium-density residential uses identified along the south and east sides of Gilson to support the redeveloped envisioned in the neighborhood plan.

Project Description

The proposed mixed-use building is an L-shaped building that will be generally located adjacent to the Beld and Gilson street property lines. The retail-commercial components of the building will occupy the southern portion of the ground floor, with a 2,848 square-foot space to replace the existing barbershop along the eastern wall. A 2,395 square-foot leaseable "coffee shop" space

ID #04597:
1516- 1610 Gilson St.
& 1507 Beld Street
November 29, 2006
Page 4

will comprise the remainder of the proposed commercial space and will be located at the bend in the building. Entrances to the retail spaces will be provided along both adjoining streets. Five of the 13 proposed apartments will occupy the remainder of the first floor, with the remaining units to be located on the second floor. An exercise room, meeting room and storage spaces for use by the project's tenants will be provided on the second floor. Each unit will be provided a ground-floor patio or second-story balcony. Access to the residential units will be shared with the retail access from Gilson Street proposed.

Parking for the project will be provided in a total of 28 underground spaces to be accessed from a driveway and ramp from the alley to the north of the site. Seven of the proposed spaces will be set aside for use by commercial customers, with the remaining stalls to be allocated for tenants through a controlled entry in the garage. Bike parking will be provided on the Beld Street façade of the building as well as in two spaces in the basement garage. The project is requesting that a waiver to the requirement to providing off-street loading be granted as part of the approval of this planned unit development. An amendment to the Zoning Ordinance passed earlier this year allows a waiver to providing off-street loading to be considered as part of a PUD approval similar to other facets of a development such as yards, building height, usable open space or off-street parking.

The building will be faced with a combination of brick, masonry block and fiber cement siding and will be topped with a flat roof. The building is generally styled to evoke an older two-story commercial building from the early part of the Twentieth Century. A landscaping plan for the project shows the planting of a variety of shrubs and perennials along the street walls of the building in the limited space proposed between the building and property line. Additional plantings will be provided along the rear side walls and adjacent to a trash enclosure that will be located adjacent to the driveway. The remainder of the rear area will be lawn space and is intended as usable open space for the residential tenants.

Note: This project was submitted for consideration after the State Court of Appeals decision voiding the rental component of the Inclusionary Zoning Ordinance and as such is exempted from its provisions.

ANALYSIS & CONCLUSION

The applicant is proposing demolition of a single-family residence and the Style and Grace Salon barbershop located in a converted two-story residence located at the northeast corner of Beld and Gilson streets and PUD zoning to facilitate redevelopment of the site as a two-story mixed-use building with first floor retail uses and 13 rental apartment units. The proposed building represents a greater utilization of the site than what is currently present elsewhere in the

ID #04597:
1516- 1610 Gilson St.
& 1507 Beld Street
November 29, 2006
Page 5

neighborhood east of Beld Street and north of Gilson Street. However, the Planning Unit believes the proposed mixed-use building represents the development pattern recommended for this site and the lower Gilson Street area in the South Madison Neighborhood Plan. According to the plan, the commercial and light industrial uses located primarily along the south and east sides of Gilson Street are envisioned to transition into a mix of single-family and multi-family residential uses with an emphasis on buildings fronting onto Gilson Street. Although the building proposes retail uses on a portion of the first floor where no such uses are identified in the neighborhood plan, the Planning Unit believes the inclusion of the barbershop in the proposed development provides a new home for a long-serving neighborhood use, which is consistent with the plan recommendation to retain small business in the neighborhood. The barbershop and second ground-floor commercial space should also add to the envisioned vitality of the lower Gilson Street area as residential redevelopment occurs over the next many years.

Overall, staff feels that the proposed building is well designed, relates well to the sidewalk, and should result in a greater amount of pedestrian activity at the corner of Gilson and Beld streets. While the mass of the proposed building is greater than the existing neighborhood context, the scale proposed generally reflects the scale of the one to two-story residential buildings elsewhere in the neighborhood to the north as well as the scale of the residential redevelopment envisioned to the east and south over time. Through revisions to the architecture of the building requested by staff and the Urban Design Commission, the exterior relation of the building to Beld and Gilson streets has been improved, resulting in a well-designed urban infill building that should relate well to the adjoining streets.

The Urban Design Commission recommended initial approval of the project on November 15, 2006 (see attached report).

Concerning the demolition, Kitty Rankin, the City's preservation planner, indicates that neither building has any known architectural or historical significance. Although a detailed report of the condition of the buildings was not submitted with this application, the Planning Unit feels the demolition standards can be met with this project. The new mixed-use building will be more in keeping with the land uses recommended for the subject site and properties to the south and east by the South Madison Neighborhood Plan and will be more economically productive than preserving the existing buildings.

In closing, the Planning Unit believes the proposed demolitions and resulting mixed-use building meet the standards for demolitions and planned unit developments and aid in the implementation of the recommendations of the South Madison Neighborhood Plan.

RECOMMENDATION

The Planning Unit recommends that the Plan Commission forward Zoning Map Amendment 3188, rezoning 1516 - 1610 Gilson Street & 1507 Beld Street from C3 (Highway Commercial District) to Planned Unit Development, General Development Plan/ Specific Implementation Plan (PUD-GDP-SIP) to the Common Council with a recommendation of **approval**, subject to input at the public hearing and the following conditions:

1. Comments from reviewing agencies.
2. That the applicant submit a screening and buffering plan for this project for approval by Planning Unit staff that mitigates impacts from vehicle headlights accessing the ramp to the underground parking level from the adjoining residential properties north of the alley.
3. That the zoning text be revised per Planning Unit approval as follows:
 - a.) that the list of uses be revised to include the following:
 - residential uses as permitted in the R6 zoning district and any accessory uses related thereto (includes the meeting room, and tenant workout/ health club spaces proposed on the second floor);
 - offices, restaurants, drugstores, valet shops, retail food shops, beauty shops, barber shops, art galleries, photography shops, book shops, gift shops, tailor shops, shoe repair shops, primarily for walk-in trade, located in a building where the principal use is residential, provided that each business establishment shall not exceed three thousand (3,000) square feet of floor area;
 - b.) the family definition shall coincide with the R4 family definition;
 - c.) the floor area ratio shall be "as shown on the approved plans";
 - d.) signage shall be limited to the maximum permitted in the C1 zoning district and as approved by the Urban Design Commission. The signage should include directional signage for the underground parking facility.

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION**PRESENTED:** November 15, 2006**TITLE:** 1610 Gilson Street – PUD(GDP-SIP),
Mixed-Use Development. 13th Ald. Dist.
(04758)**REFERRED:****REREFERRED:****REPORTED BACK:****AUTHOR:** Alan J. Martin, Secretary**ADOPTED:****POF:****DATED:** November 15, 2006**ID NUMBER:**

Members present were: Paul Wagner, Chair; Lou Host-Jablonski, Todd Barnett, Michael Barrett, Cathleen Feland, Lisa Geer, Ald. Noel Radomski, Bruce Woods and Robert March.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of November 15, 2006, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL** of a PUD(GDP-SIP) located at 1610 Gilson Street. Appearing on behalf of the project were Ald. Isadore Knox, Bob Bouril, Barry Lauffer and Clarence Banks. Appearing in opposition to the project was Laura Zirngible. Prior to the presentation, Bouril distributed updated revised plans in response to the previous review of the project, which featured the following:

- Eliminated the use of the second colored brick in favor of a rusticated brick, applied more extensively on the revised elevations. In addition, stucco as an upper elevational treatment has been replaced with cement board siding, along with cast stone panels with front porches added that now connect to the adjoining public walkways.
- A corner entry has been provided at the intersections of Beld and Gilson Streets, including a tower element.
- A lower pitch has been provided on projecting roofs on elements of the second floor elevations.
- A parapet element has been eliminated as a focus of the main entry of the building off of Gilson Street.

Following the presentation of the plans, Laura Zirngible spoke in opposition to the project, noting issues with neighborhood concerns regarding density, issues with the driveway connection to the adjoining alley, as well as its proximity to adjacent single-family homes. Following the presentation, the Commission noted the following:

- Previous planning initiatives are supportive of the redevelopment proposal.
- The modified plans reflect a significant change; the corner entry appreciated. The changes to architecture in the right direction; simplified.
- The development has quality design and materials, will attract quality clientele.
- The plan for screening of lights from lower level parking adjacent to the alley and single-family residences provides that the screening appears minimal; need more screening. Resolve issue with neighbors relative to the screening of light from the lower level parking access ramp with a more extensive screening along the perimeter of the alley.
- Appreciate windows on alley elevation, help with eyes on the street.

- Appreciate architectural changes; need to address signage and potential signable area issues.
- Need to provide a railing detail as well as how the face of the ramp elevation is handled. Both need more attention so as not to look like an after thought.
- The three-sided trash enclosure needs a side or door facing the alley.
- Material and color samples need to be provided for review, in addition to the lighting plan and fixture cutsheets not submitted within the application packet.
- The lighting plan has a few hot spots, resolve with lowering the wattage of bulbs.

ACTION:

On a motion by March, seconded by Barrett, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a unanimous vote of (9-0). The motion required the submission of required material colors and samples, the provision of railing and ramp details, including lighting and photometric plan, the provision of a more effective screen between the lower level access ramp, the adjoining alley and adjacent residences where the screen needs to be tall enough to efficiently off-set the angle of uplighting from vehicles exiting the ramp. A more defined signage package, as well as a reexamination of the façade of the east elevation relative to the expansive unarticulated façade.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 6, 6, 6, 6.5, 6.5, 7, 7 and 7.5.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 1610 Gilson Street

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	6	7	6	5	-	6	7	6
	7	7	6	5	-	8	8	7
	6	6	5	-	-	5	6	6
	6	6	-	-	-	6	6	6
	6	8	7	-	-	6	9	7.5
	7	6	6	6	-	7	8	6.5
	6	7	6	5	-	7	6	6.5
	7	7	-	-	-	-	7	7

General Comments:

- Thanks for the exterior improvements per our requests.
- Very nice project. Materials are superior! The engaging corner entry will be a boon for the businesses as well as street life!
- Big improvement. Applicant did a great job responding to initial comments. Please address neighboring property to allow screening of headlights.
- Much improved, could become a nice neighborhood center.
- Corner entry will be, hopefully, a big success.
- Provide screening of the drive for lots from auto lights as they exit on the sloped drive. Add doors on the trash enclosure to hide dumpsters. Light hot spots.
- Much improved architecture.

PETITION

Whereas, Clarence Brown and BESHM Investment Group has hereby proposed to Demolish 4 Structures & Build Mixed use Development with 13 Apartment Units, 5,243 sf Commercial & Retail Space. Whereas, property taxes would increase; whereas, structure would not blend with current neighborhood; whereas, drug trafficking would increase; whereas, other illegal activities would increase; whereas, traffic would increase; whereas; access to current property owner's garage would be taken away; whereas, noise would increase; whereas, vagrancy would increase. Therefore we the undersigned are strongly opposed to this proposal.

	<u>SIGNATURE</u>	<u>ADDRESS</u>	<u>DATE</u>
1.	Jim Wright	621 Pine St.	11-2-06
2.	Frederick [unclear]	610 Pine St.	Nov 2, 2006
3.	Doreen Tiller	608 Pine St.	Nov. 2, 2006
4.	Ken Pece	607 Pine St.	Nov. 2, 2006
5.	Cynthia Pece	601 Pine St.	Nov. 2 2006
6.	Laura Zingales	512 Pine St.	Nov 2, 06
7.	Host [unclear]	512 PINE ST	Nov 2 06
8.	David [unclear]	506 Pine St.	Nov 2, 06
9.	Betty Smith	602 Pine St.	NOV. 2, 06
10.	Jim [unclear]	609 PINE ST.	NOV 2, 06
11.	Amy [unclear]	509 Pine St.	NOV 2, 2006
12.	Mark Vosberg	509 Pine St.	11/2/06
13.	[unclear]	[unclear] St	[unclear]
14.	John Hansen	1405 S. PARK ST.	11-3-06
15.	Ray Lee	1502 Beld St.	11-3-06
16.	Dick Patterson	1502 Beld St.	11-3-06
17.	Sandra Larson	1502 Beld St.	11-3-06
18.	Betty J. [unclear]	1501 Nelson	11-3-06
19.	C E Heath	513 PINE	11-3-06

	<u>SIGNATURE</u>	<u>ADDRESS</u>	<u>DATE</u>
20.	Marcy Kess	702 Wingra Dr	11-3-06
21.	Wanda D. Platt	1417 Beld St	11/3/06
22.	Ernie Nelson	1407 Beld St.	11-3-06
23.	Christine Gugg	1422 Gilson St.	11-3-06
24.	Merced B. Tran	1713 Beld St Mad	11/9/06
25.	Wanda D. Platt	601 Kenward St	11/9/06
26.	Mary Collins	601 Kenward St	11/9-06
27.	Tim Anderson	1713 Fisher St	11/9/06
28.	Bill Lyke	1709 Fisher	11/9/06
29.	Edith Thotom	1706 Fisher St	11-9-06
30.	Kathryn Pastore	1702 Fisher St	11-9-06
31.	MYZELLE A. ALEXANDER	409 W. Wingra DR	11-9-06
32.	Paul Montague	401 WEST Wingra Dr	11/9/06
33.	Judy Robinson	921 S. Brooks St #6	11-13-06
34.	Robert W. Lockhart	633 Cedar St.	11/13/06
35.	Gini Waddich	1102 Gilson St	11-13-06
36.	Mike Zirkel	1102 Gilson St	11-13-06
37.	Rodolfo O. Ramon	1505 Beld St	11-15-06
38.	Manuela C. Ramon	1505 Beld St	11-15-06
39.			
40.			
41.			
42.			
43.			
44.			
45.			
46.			