

AGENDA # 6

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: May 7, 2008
TITLE: 31 South Henry Street - PUD(GDP-SIP) to Remodel an Existing 3-Story Structure and Adding 3 Additional Stories to Accommodate 58 Apartment Units and 5,000 Sq. Ft. of First Floor Commercial Space. 4th Ald. Dist. (09853)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: May 7, 2008	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Lou Host-Jablonski, Todd Barnett, Marsha Rummel, Bruce Woods, John Harrington, Richard Wagner, Richard Slayton, Jay Ferm and Bonnie Cosgrove.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of May 7, 2008, the Urban Design Commission **REFERRED** consideration of a PUD(GDP-SIP) located at 31 South Henry Street. Appearing on behalf of the project were Michael May, representing the Bassett Neighborhood Steering Committee, David Ferch, architect, and Peter Ostlind, representing the Bassett District of Capitol Neighborhoods. The modified plans as presented by Ferch as following:

- The movement of bike racks primarily for residential use in the interior of the first floor at the rear of the boiler room and within the Henry Street courtyard.
- The landscape plan has been modified to change out trees within the patio/courtyard along Henry Street along with the provision of a tree protection plan.
- There is an increase in the size of the balconies from 30" to 36" for the 1-bedroom/efficiency units with the 2-bedroom units featuring a 5' to 6' balcony.
- The door on Henry Street has been modified; tempered, insulated glass in aluminum frame.
- A previously proposed stone wrap around a vertical column of windows along the Henry Street elevation has been eliminated.
- Back balcony rails have been changed to an aluminum rail system with glass.
- The front stair tower has been modified to include more glass.
- The 1-story retail addition has been modified to push up the glass storefront with upper transom windows as an added feature.
- In regards to consideration of a 2-story element with the addition; a raised parapet and combined horizontal block band has been proposed as an alternative atop the addition.
- Signage for the 1-story commercial retail addition features backlit quarter inch aluminum painted individual letters atop a metal raceway including provision for small-scale tenant signage.
- The review of the fiber cement siding samples provides for the use of two standard colors with a factory finish; white cream and a brick matching color. The aluminum frames on windows would feature a medium dark brown.

Following the presentation the Commission noted the following:

- Not swayed by the use of 3-foot wide balconies for aesthetic reasons. Not a usable width. Sticking out to add width not an issue.
- Consider carving out space for more courtyard moped parking; if future outdoor eating area within the public right-of-way for the proposed restaurant.
- Retail space as designed doesn't quite hold up.
- Bike parking located deep inside the building is a problem, doesn't meet need of everyday bikers; need to provide bike parking combined with available access to the entrance outside of the building.
- The problem with the taller side of extended parapet instead of parapet on the 1-story restaurant addition.
- Consider signage adjacent to the doorway entry on West Washington.
- The corner addition's entry is hidden, an issue.
- Make entry to the restaurant more visible.
- Make the corner façade a lighter color to stand out more completely from expanded main structure.

Michael May and Pete Ostlind, of the Bassett Neighborhood Steering Committee, spoke noting the following:

- Issue with the identification and lack of pre-dominance of the residential entry to the building; define entry to apartments on West Washington Avenue vs. Henry Street as well as entry to rear office space.
- Need to resolve moped parking issue; facilitate with use of a ramp to deal with grade issues in the courtyard.
- Proposed use of solar and/or geo-thermal not clarified in proposed plans.
- Need to provide durable construction fencing.
- Consideration for a "reflective" roof.

ACTION:

On a motion by Slayton, seconded by Cosgrove, the Urban Design Commission **REFERRED** consideration of this item. The motion was passed on a unanimous vote of (9-0). Motion to refer. The motion required address of the above stated concerns and the following:

- All balconies are to be a minimum of 5 feet in width.
- Relook at the appearance of the restaurant addition.
- Deal with moped parking issue. Investigate converting on-street parking stalls to "moped" parking in consultation with the Traffic Engineer.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 5, 5, 6, 6, 7, 7, 7, 7 and 7.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 31 South Henry Street

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	6	7	5	-	-	-	7	6
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	5
	5	5	5	-	-	6	6	5
	7	7	5	-	5	6	7	7
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	7
	7	6	7	-	4	5	10	7
	-	7	6	-	6	-	7	7
	7	7	5	6	6	6	7	6
	-	-	-	-	-	-	7	7

General Comments:

- Nice improvements – the color is much better. Rethink the restaurant area.
- Great infill project.
- Good quality architecture and appropriate infill. Balconies must be minimum 5-feet in depth for usability. Architecture of retail needs work.
- Need to solve bike, moped parking accessibility.
- Nice progress. Recognize that moped parking is an issue, but placing them into courtyard is not the answer. Protect this space!
- Address entry/retail “diner.” Deeper balconies, more accessible bike parking. Recommend PBMVC look at converting parking stall into moped parking. Good infill project that will enliven corner/block.