



**Project Name & Address:** 952-956 Spaight Street  
**Application Type(s):** Certificate of Approval for new construction  
**Legistar File ID #** [91916](#)  
**Prepared By:** Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division  
**Date Prepared:** March 5, 2026

## Summary

**Project Applicant/Contact:** Benjamin Fritz  
**Requested Action:** The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Approval for new construction of an accessory structure

## Background Information

**Parcel Location/Information:** The subject property is located within the Third Lake Ridge local historic district

### Relevant Ordinance Sections:

#### 41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROVAL

A Certificate of Approval shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.

- (1) New Construction or Exterior Alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of Approval for exterior alteration or construction only if:
  - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
  - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
  - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
  - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of Approval is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources.

#### 41.27 STANDARDS FOR NEW STRUCTURES.

- (1) General.
  - (a) Primary Structures. The design for a new structure in a historic district shall be visually compatible with other historic resources within two hundred (200) feet in the following ways:
    1. Building Placement. When determining visual compatibility for building placement, the Landmarks Commission shall consider factors such as lot coverage, setbacks, building orientation, and historic relationships between the building and site.
    2. Street Setback. When determining visual compatibility for street setbacks, the Landmarks Commission shall consider factors such as the average setback of historic resources on the same block face within two hundred (200) feet, and the setback of adjacent structures.
    3. Visual Size. When determining visual compatibility for visual size, the Landmarks Commission shall consider factors such as massing, building height in feet and stories, the

gross area of the front elevation (i.e., all walls facing the street), street presence, and the dominant proportion of width to height in the façade.

4. Building Form. When determining visual compatibility for building form, the Landmarks Commission shall consider factors such as building type and use, roof shape, symmetry or asymmetry, and its dominant vertical or horizontal expression.
  5. Architectural Expression. When determining visual compatibility for architectural expression, the Landmarks Commission shall consider factors such as the building's modulation, articulation, building planes, proportion of building elements, and rhythm of solids to voids created by openings in the façade.
- (b) Accessory Structures.
1. Comply with requirements for new primary structures with other historic accessory structures serving as comparables.
  2. Minimally visible from the developed public right-of-way, or be minimally visible from the front of the property for corner lots.
  3. Clearly be secondary to the primary structure.
- (3) Exterior Walls.
- (a) General.
1. Materials used for new structures shall be similar in design, scale and architectural appearance to materials that date to the period of significance on historic resources within two hundred (200) feet, but differentiated enough so that it is not confused as a historic building.
- (4) Roofs.
- (a) Form.
1. Roof form and pitch shall be similar to the form and pitch of the roofs on historic resources within two hundred (200) feet.
- (b) Materials.
1. Roof materials shall replicate materials found on historic resources within two hundred (200) feet.
- (5) Windows and Doors.
- (a) General.
1. Door and window styles should both match the style of the new structure and be compatible with those on historic resources within two hundred (200) feet.
- (b) Windows and Storm Windows.
1. Multi-light windows shall have true divided lights or simulated divided lights with muntin grids on the exterior and interior with spacer bars between the panes of glass.
- (f) Garage Doors.
1. Garage doors shall be similar in design, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities prevalent within the historic district.
- (6) Entrances, Porches, Balconies and Decks.
- (a) Porch Elements.
1. Entrances and porches shall be of a size and configuration consistent with the historic resources in the district.
  2. The primary entrance for the structure shall be located on the front elevation, or, structures on a corner lot may have a corner entrance.
- (b) Balconies and Decks.
1. Projecting, partially projecting/inset, and inset balconies are prohibited on elevations visible from the developed public right-of-way, unless there is precedent on the historic resources in the district. Balconies that are not on elevations facing the developed public right-of-way shall be minimally visible when there is not precedent on historic resources in the district.

(7) Building Systems.

(a) Mechanical Systems.

1. Mechanical equipment shall be screened if it is visible from the developed public right-of-way.
2. Static vents, electric vents, wind turbines, and attic fans visible from the developed public right-of-way are prohibited.
3. Grilles, vents, equipment, and meters shall be finished or painted to match adjacent building materials.

(c) Lighting and Electrical Systems.

1. Decorative light fixtures shall be compatible in style and location with the overall design of the building.
2. Security light fixtures or security cameras shall be installed so that they are as unobtrusive as possible.
3. Exterior mounted conduit on elevations visible from the developed public right-of-way is prohibited.

## Analysis and Conclusion

The proposed project is to construct an accessory structure in the rear yard of this corner property. The two-story structure would have a garage and pedestrian entrance on the first floor and a residential unit on the upper floor. The proposed new structure is located to be as minimally visible as possible from the developed public right-of-way and the design of the structure draws design elements from the historic house on the site. The house on the property was constructed in 1906 and designed by noted Madison architects Claude & Starck.

Most of the material details align with historic district standards. The window framing needs to replicate historic profiles with a projecting sill rather than picture framing as proposed and the soffit & fascia need to replicate the appearance of wood rather than the aluminum as proposed. Otherwise, final specifications for the windows, lighting, gutters/downspouts, and garage doors need approval before issuing the Certificate of Approval. The new building will read as clearly secondary to the principal structure and while it will use a similar architectural vocabulary, it will read as a product of its time and not create a false sense of history.

A discussion of relevant standards follows:

### 41.27 STANDARDS FOR NEW STRUCTURES.

(1) General.

(a) Primary Structures. As an accessory structure, the building must meet the general standards of principal structures.

1. Building Placement. The accessory structure would be in the rear corner of the yard where we expect to find accessory structures.
2. Street Setback. The accessory structure is proposed to be setback from the street in the same manner as other accessory structures in the vicinity.
3. Visual Size. The new structure is of a similar scale to other accessory structures in the vicinity and is of a smaller scale than the principal structure on the property.
4. Building Form. The square form of the building is a direct reference to the massing of the principal structure on the property.
5. Architectural Expression. The design of the building has decorative elements such as the columns and arch above the balcony entrance that reference the architectural details on the historic house on the property. Otherwise, this building is simple in design and style with strong symmetry in its design, echoing the style of the historic house.

(b) Accessory Structures.

1. The accessory structure appears to comply with requirements for new primary structures with other historic accessory structures serving as comparables.
  2. The new structure would be as minimally visible from the front of the property as a corner lot.
  3. The new structure would clearly be secondary to the primary structure.
- (3) Exterior Walls.
- (a) General.
    1. The smooth fiber cement board will replicate the clapboard cladding found on the historic house on the property and is also similar to the materials found on historic accessory structures in the vicinity.
- (4) Roofs.
- (a) Form.
    1. The gable roof form is common on principal and accessory structures in the district.
  - (b) Materials.
    1. The asphalt shingles are typical for roofing in the district.
- (5) Windows and Doors.
- (a) General.
    1. The door and window styles shown on the renderings and elevations differ from one another, but the pedestrian door cut sheets show doors that meet the historic district standards.
  - (b) Windows and Storm Windows.
    1. The renderings and elevations appear to show some multi-light windows, but there are no final specifications to confirm if the divided lights are true divided lights or simulated divided lights with muntin grids on the exterior and interior with spacer bars between the panes of glass.
  - (f) Garage Doors.
    1. The renderings and elevations show slightly different garage doors. Final specifications are needed to confirm that the door will meet the historic district requirements.
- (6) Entrances, Porches, Balconies and Decks.
- (a) Porch Elements.
    1. The primary entrance for the residential unit is located on the front of the structure, facing towards the street. The balcony above the entrance with decorative columns on the first floor replicate the configuration of residential-form structures in the immediate vicinity.
    2. The primary entrance for the structure would be located on the front elevation of the structure, facing towards the street of the corner lot.
  - (b) Balconies and Decks.
    1. The balcony on the front of this structure replicates the configuration of other residential historic structure in the immediate vicinity. The railing specifications are needed to ensure that the proposed railing meets historic district requirements.
- (7) Building Systems.
- (a) Mechanical Systems.
    1. There are no details on the mechanical equipment, which would need to be screened if it is visible from the developed public right-of-way.
    2. The notes on the plans call for venting, but don't specify if it will be entirely through soffit vents or through the roof. Static vents, electric vents, wind turbines, and attic fans visible from the developed public right-of-way are prohibited.
    3. Grilles, vents, equipment, and meters shall be finished or painted to match adjacent building materials. There are no details on those elements in the submitted plans.
  - (c) Lighting and Electrical Systems.

1. The plans show exterior lighting that appears to be decorative, but we need final specifications to be able to approve that lighting.
2. Security light fixtures or security cameras shall be installed so that they are as unobtrusive as possible.
3. Exterior mounted conduit on elevations visible from the developed public right-of-way is prohibited.

## **Recommendation**

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Approval are met and recommends the Landmarks Commission approve the project with the following conditions

1. Final light, venting, window, railing, gutter, and door specifications be approved by staff
2. Window trim must replicate the historic with a projecting sill
3. Soffit and fascia must be wood or composite, not aluminum as proposed