



Project Name/Address: 620 S Ingersoll Street, Lougee House

Application Type: Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations to a landmark building in a historic district

Legistar File ID # [37908](#)

Prepared By: Amy L. Scanlon, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Bruce Bosben

Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations to a landmark site in a historic district.

Background Information

Parcel Location: The subject site is a designated landmark site located in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District

Relevant Landmarks Ordinance Sections:

33.19(5)(b)4. Upon filing of any application with the Landmarks Commission, the Landmarks Commission shall determine:

- a. Whether in the case of a designated landmark or landmark site, the proposed work would detrimentally change, destroy or adversely affect any exterior architectural feature of the improvement upon which said work is to be done;

33.19(8) Maintenance of Landmarks, Landmark Sites and Historic Districts.

(a) Every person in charge of an improvement on a landmark site or in an Historic District shall keep in good repair all of the exterior portions of such improvement and all interior portions thereof which, if not so maintained, may cause or tend to cause the exterior portions of such improvement to fall into a state of disrepair. This provision shall be in addition to all other provisions of law requiring such improvement to be kept in good repair.

33.19(11)(i) Guideline Criteria for Exterior Alteration in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.

1. Alteration of any existing structure shall be evaluated according to all criteria listed in Sec. 33.19(11)(g).
2. Alteration of the surface material, pattern and texture in the facade(s) of any existing structures shall be compatible with the original or existing historical finishes.
3. Alteration of any existing structure shall retain or be compatible with the original or existing historical rhythm of masses and spaces.
4. Alteration of any existing structure shall retain the existing historical landscape plan or shall develop a new plan which is compatible with the plans of the buildings and environment within its visually related area.
5. Alteration of the street facade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical proportional relationships of door sizes to window sizes.

33.19(11)(g) Guideline Criteria for Exterior Alteration in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Commercial Use.

1. Alterations of the height of any existing structure shall be visually compatible with the buildings and environment within its visually related area.
2. Alterations of the street facade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical rhythm of solids and voids.
3. Alterations of the street facade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical materials.
4. Alterations of the roof of any existing structure shall retain its existing historical appearance.

Analysis and Conclusion

The Lougee House was designed in 1907 in the Prairie Style by the Madison architectural firm of Claude and Starck. The building is individually listed on the National Register of Historic Places.

Slate roof shingles typically have an 80-100 year life span. The deterioration that was observed by Building Inspection and described in the submission materials is consistent with the age of the original slate roof. The submission materials indicate that the original nails have corroded and the roof requires replacement in order to keep the landmark building protected and in good repair (33.19(8)).

Related to 33.19(5)(b)4, the proposed removal of the slate shingle material would adversely affect the slate roof as an exterior architectural feature.

A brief discussion of the criteria of 33.19(11)(i) follows:

1. Alteration of any existing structure shall be evaluated according to all criteria listed in Sec. 33.19(11)(g). Those criteria are listed below:
 1. The height of the roof is not being changed.
 2. The street facades of the building will retain the historical rhythm of solids and voids.
 3. The slate shingles are being removed and therefore the original historical materials are not being retained. Roofs are supposed to be replaced in time and the proposed replacement material is a simulated slate that has a slate-like appearance. Replacement with a natural slate roof and regular maintenance would provide a roof with a life span of 80-100 years.
 4. The proposed replacement material is a simulated slate that has a slate-like appearance. Replacement with a natural slate roof and regular maintenance would provide a roof with a life span of 80-100 years.
2. While the original slate surface material is being removed, the pattern and texture of the proposed simulated slate shingle is visually compatible with the original material.
3. The building will retain the historical rhythm of masses and spaces.
4. The original landscape plan is unknown. The replacement of the roof will not affect the existing landscape.
5. The proposed roof replacement will not affect the original or existing historical proportional relationships of door sizes to window sizes.

Recommendation

In order to retain the integrity of landmark buildings, materials and details should be replaced in kind. Replacement with a natural slate roof and regular maintenance would allow the replaced slate roof to last another 80-100 years. The Landmarks Commission should discuss the issue of integrity and appropriateness as they relate to the treatment of landmark buildings and the use of compatible materials. If the Commission finds

that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness are met, staff recommends the following conditions of approval:

1. The Applicant shall explain the condition of the gutters and downspouts and whether those will be replaced. If replacement is required, round downspouts and half round gutters to match the existing shall be used.
2. The work shall follow National Park Service Preservation Brief 29: The Repair, Replacement and Maintenance of Historic Slate Roofs.