

Regarding: **1341 Jenifer Street – Third Lake Ridge Historic District – exterior alteration involving the construction of a 2 story rear addition.**
(Legistar #21246)

Date: February 14, 2011
Prepared By: Amy Scanlon

General Information:

The Applicant is proposing to construct a 2 story addition at the rear of the residence at 1341 Jenifer Street. The existing 1 story sunroom will be expanded to become a family room on the first floor and a master bedroom suite on the second floor. A window on the second floor will be replaced to more closely resemble the adjacent historic window.

The Ordinance criteria for exterior alteration and for new development should be used to evaluate this proposal.

Relevant sections of the Landmarks Ordinance for Exterior Alteration

In the left hand columns, staff has indicated whether they believe the proposal meets each criteria.

<u>Yes</u>	<u>No</u>	
		33.19(11)(i) <u>Guideline Criteria for Exterior Alteration in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.</u>
		1. Alteration of any existing structure shall be evaluated according to all criteria listed in Sec. 33.01(11)(g) (<i>Referenced below for your information</i>).
Y		2. Alteration of the surface material, pattern and texture in the facade(s) of any existing structures shall be compatible with the original or existing historical finishes.
Y		3. Alteration of any existing structure shall retain or be compatible with the original or existing historical rhythm of masses and spaces.
NA		4. Alteration of any existing structure shall retain the existing historical landscape plan or shall develop a new plan which is compatible with the plans of the buildings and environment within its visually related area.
NA		5. Alteration of the street facade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical proportional relationships of door sizes to window sizes.

<u>Yes</u>	<u>No</u>	33.19(11)(g) <u>Guideline Criteria for Exterior Alteration in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Commercial Use.</u>
Y		1. Alterations of the height of any existing structure shall be visually compatible with the buildings and environment within its visually related area.
NA		2. Alterations of the street facade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical rhythm of solids and voids.
NA		3. Alterations of the street facade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical materials.
Y		4. Alterations of the roof of any existing structure shall retain its existing historical appearance.

Relevant sections of the Landmarks Ordinance for New Development

In the left hand columns, staff has indicated whether they believe the proposal meets each criteria.

<u>Yes</u>	<u>No</u>	33.19(11)(h) <u>Guideline Criteria for New Development in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.</u>
Y		1. Any new structure shall be evaluated according to all criteria listed in Sec. 33.19(11)(f) (<i>Referenced below for your information</i>).
Y		2. The directional expression of any new structure shall be compatible with those of the buildings and environment within its visually related area.
Y		3. The materials, patterns and textures of any new structure shall be compatible with those of the buildings and environment within its visually related area.
Y		4. The landscape plan of any new structure shall be compatible with that of the buildings and environment within its visually related area.

<u>Yes</u>	<u>No</u>	33.19(11)(f) <u>Guideline Criteria for new Development in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Commercial Use.</u>
NA		1. Any new structures shall be evaluated according to both of the criteria listed in Sec. 33.01(11)(d) (<i>Referenced below for your information</i>) that is, compatibility of gross volume and height.
NA		2. The rhythm of solids and voids in the street facade(s) of any new structure shall be compatible with the buildings within its visually related area.
NA		3. The materials used in the street facade(s) of any new structure shall be compatible with those used in the buildings and environment within its visually related area.
Y		4. The design of the roof of any new structure shall be compatible with those of the buildings and environment within its visually related area.
Y		5. The rhythm of building masses and spaces created by the construction of a new structure shall be compatible with the existing rhythm of masses and spaces for those sites within its visually related area.

<u>Yes</u>	<u>No</u>	33.19 (11)(d) <u>Guideline Criteria for new Development in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Manufacturing Use.</u>
Y		1. The gross volume of any new structure shall be visually compatible with the buildings and environment within its visually related area.
Y		2. The height of any new structure shall be visually compatible with the buildings and environment within its visually related area.

Staff Comments and Recommendation:

Staff understands that the Applicant would like to construct an addition that is compatible with the traditional massing, scale and materials of the historic district. Staff has had discussions with the Applicant regarding the following:

1. The window trim and show sill dimensions will more closely resemble the existing trim and sill dimensions and treatment than what is shown in the submission materials. The attached window detail shows 2” trim that will be changed to 3” trim to more closely match the existing trim.
2. The proposed siding exposure will match the existing exposure.
3. Due to modern framing lumber sizes and floor to ceiling heights, the submission drawings show a “hiccup” in the roof where the new addition would touch the existing wall plane. In addition, (not shown in the submission drawings) the existing roof has a kick at the lower 24” of the slope that should be continued at the addition roof if the wall plane below is flush. In an effort to eliminate the “hiccup”, Staff suggested that the Applicant consider holding the addition at least 6” of the existing corner on the south west rear corner. This offset will allow the addition to have a straight roof slope (without kick) and allow the addition to read clearly as a later building campaign. The Applicant agreed to consider this option, but may have additional thoughts to share at the Commission meeting.
4. The proposed windows for the addition are casements. While there is no criteria in the Ordinance that prohibits casement windows, precedence suggests that double hung windows would be preferred by the Commission and Staff. The Applicant would prefer to use casement windows due to their operation. Staff suggested that the casement windows of the addition be of similar proportion to the existing adjacent double hung windows. Staff believes that the offset described above coupled with the similar window proportion would allow a more contemporary appearance for the fenestration of the addition.

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of the new addition and the exterior alteration to the existing residence can be met and recommends approval by the Landmarks Commission with the following conditions:

1. The window trim shall be 3” wide to more closely match the existing trim. A flat trim profile is preferred to a profile with a back band, but the 3” width is the priority.
2. The Applicant shall provide a design solution in the area of the “hiccup” that will resolve the roof /offset issue and allow the addition to be an obvious later campaign with more contemporary fenestration. The Applicant shall work with Staff to determine an acceptable treatment.
3. The submission drawings show very little exposed concrete at the foundation walls. If during construction, more concrete will be exposed than currently shown, the Applicant shall provide information and work with Staff to determine an acceptable treatment for the walls.