
Regarding: **510 North Carroll Street – Designated Madison Landmark,
Van Slyke House – Mansion Hill Historic District
Consideration of Issuance of Certificate of Appropriateness
(Legistar #19900)**

Date: September 13, 2010
Prepared By: Amy Scanlon

General Information:

The owner is proposing to alter the existing sleeping porch (constructed c. 1940) and related roof structure of the designated landmark at 510 North Carroll Street in the Mansion Hill Historic District. The sleeping porch is located on the back of the residence and is not visible from the street. The alterations to the sleeping porch include:

Alter the roof structure on one half of the roof to improve drainage and add a clerestory to improve lighting and ventilation. The new roof structure will rise approximately 18” above the existing ridge.

Install new antique/salvage (Victorian styled) window sash with true divided lights in new frames at the sleeping porch enclosure.

Install new Marvin Ultimate windows with simulated divided lights and spacer bars at the proposed clerestory.

Install new frame and panel siding on sleeping porch below windows.

Install new terne-coated standing seam metal roof on new roof structure and the other related roof areas on the rear wing.

Applicable Landmarks Ordinance sections:

- Sec. 33.19(6)(b)4. Upon filing of any application with the Landmarks Commission, the Landmarks Commission shall determine:
- a. Whether, in the case of a designated landmark or landmark site, the proposed work would detrimentally change, destroy or adversely affect any exterior architectural feature of the improvement upon which said work is to be done; and
 - b. Whether, in the case of the construction of a new improvement upon a landmark site, the exterior of such improvement would adversely affect or not harmonize with the external appearance of other neighboring improvements on such site; and
 - c. Whether, in the case of any property located in an Historic District designated pursuant to the terms of Subsection (6)(d) hereunder, the proposed construction, reconstruction or exterior alteration does not conform to the objectives and

design criteria of the historic preservation plan for said district as duly adopted by the Common Council.

- 33.19(10)(d) Regulation of Construction, Reconstruction, Exterior Alteration and Demolition.
The Commission shall act in these matters specifically as they regard the Mansion Hill Historic District in the manner specified by Madison General Ordinance, Sections 33.19(5)(b) and (c).
-

Staff Comments:

Staff believes that the project is well designed and appropriate; however, the extension of the eave to wrap the existing chimney seems an unnecessary encroachment on the historic architectural feature.

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the exterior alteration can be met and recommends approval by the Landmarks Commission subject to staff approval of the following:

- The overhang on the sloped side of the new roof structure should be reduced to an 8” projection so that it dies into the side face of the chimney and does not wrap around the long side of the chimney.