

PLANNING DIVISION STAFF REPORT

January 14, 2015

PREPARED FOR THE URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION AND PLAN COMMISSION



Project Address: 22 South Carroll Street (4th Aldermanic District, Alder Verveer)
Application Type: Conditional Use
Legistar File ID #: [36301](#)
Prepared By: Heather Stouder, AICP, Planning Division
Report Includes Comments from other City Agencies, as noted

Summary

Applicant/Owner: Bradley Mullins; Park Hotel, Inc.; 401 S. Carroll St., Madison, WI 53703

Project Contact: Melissa Destree; Destree Design Architects; 222 W. Washington Ave. #310, Madison, WI 53703

Requested Action: Approval of a conditional use to exceed the Capitol View Height Limit in conjunction with a significant remodeling and an addition to an existing hotel in the Downtown Core (DC) District.

Proposal Summary: The applicant proposes significant exterior renovations to an existing hotel building. Small additions on the second, third, and ninth floors would add a total of 8,564 square feet to the building, although interior reconfigurations would result in a slight reduction of hotel rooms to 211. The proposal requires conditional use review by the Plan Commission in order to accommodate two elevator overruns and a small chimney above the Capitol View Preservation height limit. The proposal requires review by the Urban Design Commission for a major exterior alteration and for an addition less than 20,000 square feet.

Applicable Regulations & Standards: This proposal is subject to the standards for conditional uses (MGO Section 28.183), and to the Downtown Urban Design Guidelines.

Review Required By: Urban Design Commission (UDC), Plan Commission (PC)

Summary Recommendation: The Planning Division recommends that the Plan Commission find that the conditional use standards can be met and **approve** the request at 22 South Carroll Street. This recommendation is subject to input at the public hearing and the conditions recommended by the Planning Division and other reviewing agencies.

Background Information

Parcel Location: The property is on the northwest corner of West Main Street and South Carroll Street; Downtown Core (DC) District; Aldermanic District 4 (Verveer); Madison Metropolitan School District.

Existing Conditions and Land Use: The property has an existing nine-story, 213-room hotel, which was substantially reconstructed in 1961 and had an addition in 1983. The hotel includes bar and restaurant uses on the first floor and the eighth floor, which would remain.

Surrounding Land Use and Zoning:

North: A surface parking lot in the Downtown Core (DC) District.

East: Across South Carroll Street to the east, the Capitol Square in the Downtown Core (DC) District.

South: Across West Main Street to the south, a mix of restaurant, office, and residential uses in the Downtown Core (DC) District.

West: Wisconsin Bell building in the Downtown Core (DC) District.

Adopted Land Use Plan: The Comprehensive Plan (2006) and Downtown Plan (2012) recommend Downtown Core Mixed Use for this property. The Downtown Plan recommends a maximum height not to exceed the Capitol building for a majority of the site, with a small area in the southeast corner of the property recommended for a maximum of 6 stories.

Zoning Summary: The property is in the Downtown Core (DC) District.

Environmental Corridor Status: The subject site is not located in a mapped environmental corridor.

Public Utilities and Services: This property is served by a full range of urban services, including many Metro Transit Routes on the Capitol Square.

Related Reviews and Approvals

On December 4, 2014, the Zoning Board of Appeals granted a variance to exceed the allowable six-story height for a very small (104 square foot) portion of the ninth story addition on the south side of the building.

The Urban Design Commission received an informational presentation on November 5 (see attached report), and will formally review the proposal on January 14, 2015.

Project Description

The applicant proposes a significant exterior remodel with some interior changes to the Inn on the Park, which is currently a 213-room hotel on the Capitol Square. The most significant changes are proposed for the base and top of the building, although work on the existing building face will include tuck-pointing existing brick, touch ups to existing EIFS, and new windows throughout. A total estimate for the project is approximately \$8 Million.

On the base of the building, small additions to the second and third floors totaling 2,704 square feet will fill in existing gaps and extend the base of the building to the top of the third floor. This portion of the building will be completely re clad with a dark granite base for the first few feet, and light tan stone above, to the top of the third story. New awnings are proposed for the ground floor, including a hard canopy at the corner, and canvas awnings elsewhere.

On the ninth floor of the building, the applicant proposes to round out the hard corner, which currently extends into the Hamilton Street viewshed identified in the Downtown Plan between the Capitol Building and Monona Bay. A net 5,860 square foot addition is proposed to the ninth floor along West Main Street to incorporate additional hotel space and essentially bring balance to the top of the building. The ninth floor will still cantilever over the floors below by roughly six (6) feet. A strong new cornice is proposed to clearly delineate the top of the building, extending an additional nine inches and encroaching into the right-of-way.

Associated with the ninth floor addition, the applicant is proposing two new elevator overruns and a new chimney which project less than five feet (for the elevators) and less than nine feet (for the chimney) above the Capitol View Preservation height limit. Such projections are allowable if approved as a conditional use. As shown in the plans submitted, the new elements are placed on the western half of the building, and over 25 feet from the Main Street façade, so they will be virtually unnoticeable from the street. The elevators and chimney together constitute a very small area, at approximately 272 square feet total. These proposed components are similar to existing components on the building such as a mechanicals penthouse and two communication towers, which already exceed the Capitol View Preservation height limit.

While not a significant part of staff review, the project involves interior changes and updates as well. The enlargement and reconfiguration of some of the hotel rooms will result in an overall loss of two rooms, despite the ninth floor addition of hotel space. The eighth floor restaurant will be slightly enlarged by 540 square feet, and will have a capacity of 170 guests. The ground floor restaurant area will be reduced by 831 square feet to accommodate business offices.

Project Analysis and Conclusion

Land Use and Plan Consistency -

The proposal involves no change in use, and is consistent with recommendations in the Comprehensive Plan (2006) and the Downtown Plan (2012) for the Downtown Core.

The rounding of the ninth floor corner removes a small amount of the existing building from the South Hamilton Street View Corridor to and from the Capitol Building, which is identified in the Downtown Plan as a priority viewshed (see map at right).

This change helps to meet Objective 3.1 in the Plan, *"Preserve Views of, to, and from the Downtown that reflect the natural topography and enhance views of the skyline, Capitol, lakes, and other important vistas."*



Downtown and Urban Design Guidelines - The Planning Division staff evaluation of the proposed project's ability to meet these guidelines is summarized below.

Site Design and Building Placement

1. *Orientation* - Unchanged from existing conditions.
2. *Access and Site Circulation* - Unchanged from existing conditions.
3. *Usable Open Space – Residential Development* - Not applicable for this use.
4. *Landscaping*- Not applicable, as the building covers the site entirely.
5. *Lighting*- The Urban Design Commission should review the recently submitted lighting submittal to ensure that these guidelines are met.

Architecture

1. *Massing*- Aside from the relatively small ninth story addition, the massing of the building is not changed. Staff believes that the addition helps to complete the West Main Street façade. While this property does

lie within the South Hamilton Street view identified in the Downtown Plan Views and Vistas Map, the addition does nothing to further impede these long views to and from the Capitol building.

Importantly, staff believes that the second and third floor additions along Main and Carroll Streets go a long way to improving the overall massing of this building, which was made awkward by the previous building addition. The strengthening of the base to a full three-story element is very successful.

2. *Building Components* – Staff believes that these guidelines are met. The lower three levels of the building create a strong architectural base, as mentioned above. Changes to the ninth floor, including the rounding of the corner, the ninth floor addition, and the strong cornice on top of the building help to significantly improve the top of the building. In this area, staff recommends that the Urban Design Commission consider the details proposed for the cantilevered portion of the ninth floor, particularly at the prominent corner. The overall depth and the materials utilized on the return to the main building face should be appropriate, since this the front and underside of this projecting element will be so visible from the sidewalk and street below.

Finally, staff believes that the proposed elevator overruns on the rooftop are appropriately located on the roof so as to minimize any impact on short and long views of the building.

3. *Visual Interest*-Staff believes that the proposed changes significantly improve the visual interest of the building, and that these guidelines are met.
4. *Door and Window Openings* - Staff believes that these guidelines are met. While most of the window and door openings are maintained, the changes on the eighth and ninth floor dramatically improve the building.
5. *Building Materials* - Staff believes that these guidelines are met, noting that the revised proposal improves the continuity of the design, when compared to the version shared with the UDC in early December. While most materials remain the same, the first three floors will be significantly improved with the dark granite base and tan stone.
6. *Terminal Views and Highly-Visible Corners* – This building is located on one of the most prominent corners in the city, and staff believes that the proposed exterior revisions dramatically improve the architectural quality by strengthening the base of the building and rounding the top of the building at the corner within this important viewshed.
7. *Awnings and Canopies* - Staff notes that recent revisions to the plans include a hard canopy on the corner of the building, reflecting previous UDC comments. The UDC should make a finding as to whether the proposed materials for the canopies adequately meet these guidelines.

Conditional Use Standards – In this case, the conditional use is requested solely for the elevator overruns and chimney associated with the proposed addition which exceed the Capitol View Preservation height limit (MGO 28.134). The Planning Division staff evaluation of the proposed project's ability to meet the standards for conditional use approval is summarized below.

As stated in MGO Section 28.183(6)(a), *"The City Plan Commission shall not approve a conditional use without due consideration of the recommendations in the City of Madison Comprehensive Plan and any applicable neighborhood, neighborhood development, or special area plan, including design guidelines as adopted as supplements to these plans. No application for a conditional use shall be granted by the Plan Commission unless it finds that all of the following conditions are present:*

1. *The establishment, maintenance, or operation of the conditional use will not be detrimental to or endanger the public health, safety, or general welfare.*

Staff believes that this standard is met.

2. *The City is able to provide municipal services to the property where the conditional use is proposed, given due consideration of the cost of providing these services.*

Staff believes that this standard is met.

3. *The uses, values, and enjoyment of other property in the neighborhood for purposes already established will not be substantially impaired or diminished in any foreseeable manner.*

Staff believes that this standard is met.

4. *The establishment of the conditional use will not impede the normal and orderly development and improvement of the surrounding property for uses permitted in the district.*

Staff believes that this standard is met.

5. *Adequate utilities, access roads, drainage, parking supply, internal circulation improvements, including but not limited to vehicular, pedestrian, bicycle, public transit, and other necessary site improvements have been or are being provided.*

Staff believes that this standard can be met, so long as any zoning conditions related to bicycle parking are sufficiently addressed.

6. *Measures, which may include transportation demand management (TDM) and participation in a transportation management association have been or will be taken to provide adequate ingress and egress, including all off-site improvements, so designed as to minimize traffic congestion and to ensure public safety and adequate traffic flow, both on-site and on the public streets.*

Staff believes that this standard is met.

7. *The conditional use conforms to all applicable regulations of the district in which it is located.*

Staff believes that this standard can be met, so long as all conditions of approval are sufficiently addressed.

9. *When applying the above standards to any new construction of a building or an addition to an existing building, the Plan Commission shall find that the project creates an environment of sustained aesthetic desirability compatible with the existing or intended character of the area and the statement of purpose for the zoning district. In order to find that this standard is met, the Plan Commission may require the applicant to submit plans to the Urban Design Commission for comment and recommendations.*

Statement of Purpose for the Downtown Core (DC) District

The DC District is established to recognize the Capitol Square, the State Street corridor, and surrounding properties as the center of governmental, office, educational, cultural, specialty retail, and recreational activities for the City and the region. Residential uses are appropriate in some locations or in combination with other uses. This district is intended to allow intensive development with high-quality architecture and urban design.

Staff believes that this standard is met, and that the proposed exterior changes will be a significant improvement to this part of the Capitol Square.

[Standards 8 and 10-15 do not apply to this request]

Conclusion- On balance, staff believes that the proposed exterior remodeling and addition to the hotel will be a significant improvement to the building, and that will complement significant investment anticipated in this part of Madison's Downtown in the near future. Staff believes that the conditional use standards and Downtown Urban Design Guidelines are met, and recommends that the Urban Design Commission and Plan Commission approve the proposal.

Recommendation

Planning Division Recommendation (Contact Heather Stouder, 266-5974)

The Planning Division recommends that the Plan Commission find that the conditional use standards can be met and **approve** the request at 22 South Carroll Street. This recommendation is subject to input at the public hearing and the conditions recommended by the Planning Division and other reviewing agencies.

Recommended Conditions of Approval

Major/Non-Standard Conditions are Shaded

Planning Division (Contact Heather Stouder, 266-5974)

1. Final plans submitted for staff review and approval shall include elevation drawings complete with a detailed materials schedule.

City Engineering Division (Contact Janet Schmidt, 261-9688)

2. There currently is a privilege in streets agreement for a canopy to protrude into the S. Carroll Street right of way per Document No. 1977588, reference Madison Real Estate Project 3068. The project proposes façade changes and additional canopy and other encroachments into the adjacent public right of ways of S. Carroll Street and W. Main Street. Applicant shall make a new application with City of Madison for a new privilege in streets for all improvements planned to encroach into any adjacent public right of way administered by the City of Madison Office of Real Estate Services. An approval of the development does not constitute or guarantee approval of any encroachments. Use the link below for application information and materials:
<http://www.cityofmadison.com/developmentcenter/landdevelopment/streetencroachment.cfm>.
3. The applicant shall submit, prior to plan sign-off, digital PDF files to the Engineering Division (Jeff Benedict or Tim Troester). The digital copies shall be to scale, and shall have a scale bar on the plan set (POLICY and MGO 37.09(2)).

PDF submittals shall contain the following information:
 - a) Building footprints
 - b) Internal walkway areas
 - c) Internal site parking areas
 - d) Lot lines and right-of-way lines
 - e) Street names
 - f) Stormwater Management Facilities
 - g) Detail drawings associated with Stormwater Mgmt Facilities (including if applicable planting plans)

Traffic Engineering Division (Contact Eric Halvorson, 266-6527)

4. The applicant shall submit one contiguous plan showing proposed conditions and one contiguous plan showing existing conditions for approval. The plan drawings shall be scaled to 1" = 20' and include the following, when applicable: existing and proposed property lines; parcel addresses; all easements; pavement markings; signing; building placement; items in the terrace such as signs, street light poles, hydrants; surface types such as asphalt, concrete, grass, sidewalk; driveway approaches, including those adjacent to and across street from the project lot location; parking stall dimensions, including two (2) feet of vehicle overhang; drive aisle dimensions; semitrailer movement and vehicle routes; dimensions of radii; and percent of slope.
5. All parking facility design shall conform to MGO standards, as set in section 10.08(6).

Fire Department (Contact Bill Sullivan, 261-9658)

- | |
|---|
| 6. The 9 th floor addition will require additional fire protection system modernizations. Additional and more specific comments may arise as the project is further developed. |
|---|

Parks Division (Contact Kay Rutledge, 266-4714)

7. Existing street trees shall be protected. Please include the following note on the site plan: Contractor shall install tree protection fencing to surround the trees, tree grates and above ground planters. If excavation within 5 feet of any tree is necessary, contractor shall contact City Forestry (266-4816) prior to excavation to assess the impact to the tree and root system. Tree pruning shall be coordinated with City Forestry. Tree protection specifications can be found in section 107.13 of *City of Madison Standard Specifications for Public Works Construction* - <http://www.cityofmadison.com/business/pw/documents/StdSpecs/2013/Part1.pdf>.
8. Please reference ID# 15102 when contacting Parks about this project.

Water Utility (Contact Dennis Cawley, 266-4651)

9. All wells located on this property shall be abandoned if no valid well operation permit has been obtained from the Madison Water Utility.

Zoning Administrator (Contact Pat Anderson, 266-5978)

Zoning comments will be provided separately if received.