

EVALUATION PANEL REPORT

Project: West Towne Path Phase 2B (Zor Shrine Pl to Gammon Rd)
Location(s): Citywide
Aldermanic District(s): District 9 (Ald. Pritchett)
RFP: Contract 8771
Date: 5/21/2026

This Evaluation has been reviewed and approved by a Principal Architect 2, Principal Engineer 2, Deputy City Engineer, Deputy Division Manager, or the City Engineer. Yes No

A. Project Details

1. Background Information

This contract is for the final design, plans, specifications and estimates for the construction of West Towne Path Phase 2B (Zor Shrine Pl to Gammon Rd). Preliminary design and environmental documentation was performed by city staff.

B. Purchasing Details

1. Guidelines for RFP Evaluation

The City of Madison solicited proposals from qualified vendors through a Request for Proposal (RFP) process. The RFP and associated materials were posted on two distribution networks, VendorNet and DemandStar, on Feb 27, 2026. RFP responses were due back on April 1, 2026.

Proposals were reviewed by a selection panel.

Qualification factors were weighted as shown.

Technical Questions 65%

Cost 30%

Local Preference 5%

Total 100%

2. RFP Respondents

HDR

JT Engineering

KL Engineering

MSA

3. Disqualifications

No firms were disqualified.

4. Evaluation Panel

The technical evaluation panel was composed of 4 City Staff from the Engineering and Traffic Engineering Divisions. Costs were obtained in the proposal.

5. Evaluation Structure and Scoring

Evaluation for this RFP was conducted in one round. The technical evaluation panelists each performed their evaluation independently and the results were averaged. The final recommendation was based on the highest average of those scores.

Section C2 shows the proposal scoring.

6. Evaluation Timeline

Feb 27, 2026	– RFP issued
Mar 13, 2026	– Questions from Consultants due
Mar 20, 2026	– Answers to Consultant questions posted
Apr 1, 2026	– Proposals due
Apr 2026	– Panel evaluation
Jun 10, 2026	– Board of Public Works approval
Jun 23, 2026	– Common Council approval

C. Summary of Evaluation Panel Findings

1. Recommendation

KL Engineering

Based on the combination of the technical evaluation and proposed costs, the panel recommends that KL Engineering be approved as the consultant for the construction of the West Towne Path Phase 2B.

2. Evaluation and Scoring

The combined scoring of the panel can be found in the chart below.

Max Points	Section	HDR	JT	KL	MSA
65	Technical	49.69	42.38	50.31	50.25
30	Cost	28.70	27.24	30.00	24.78
5	Local Vendor	0.00	5.00	5.00	0.00
100		78.38	74.62	85.31	75.03

Notes:

1. Proposal review is the primary basis for evaluating the respondents (based on response to the RFP guidelines)
2. Discussion among the final determination panelists was held to compare the results of the technical evaluation, review costs, and to deliberate over selecting a firm to recommend.

3. Fee Breakdown

The table below shows the fee break down for each firm.

	KL Eng	HDR	JT	MSA
Total	\$291,020	\$304,238.59	\$320,500	\$352,333.59

4. Local Preference

The City of Madison has adopted a local preference purchasing policy granting a scoring preference to local suppliers. Only suppliers who meet the criteria and are registered as of the bid's due date will receive preference.

www.cityofmadison.com/business/localPurchasing

Was the outcome of this bid changed by the local purchasing ordinance?

Yes

No

5. Additional Proposal Discussion

Overall, reviewers felt KL Engineering had a thorough and comprehensive project approach, solid project team, and very relevant experience. They were the lowest cost and have staff with a proven record of meeting the City of Madison's needs in a timely and cost-effective manner.