

AGENDA # 5

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: LANDMARKS COMMISSION

PRESENTED: 5/4/20

TITLE: 1254 Rutledge St - Demolition of an existing garage structure and construction of a new garage structure in the Third Lake Ridge Hist. Dist.; 6th Ald. Dist.

REFERRED:

REREFERRED:

REPORTED BACK:

AUTHOR: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner

ADOPTED:

POF:

DATED: 5/12/20

ID NUMBER: 60138

Members present were: Anna Andrzejewski, Richard Arnesen, Katie Kaliszewski, Arvina Martin, David McLean, and Maurice Taylor. Excused was: Betty Banks.

SUMMARY:

Mark Jenssen, registering in support and available to answer questions

Bailey described the proposed project to demolish the existing single car garage and construct a new garage in approximately the same location that is dimensioned to fit current vehicle sizes. She said that the garage is shiplap instead of clapboard like the house and she estimated it was built in the 1940s. She said that the replacement garage will be a simple front-facing gable building; however, the applicant is proposing to introduce shingle siding and decorative wood trusses in the gable end as well as a carriage-style garage door. She said that the project meets the standards for demolition, but in terms of the standards for new construction, she explained that the materials used on the street façade would be out of character compared to other garages in the vicinity. She showed photos of several nearby garages and pointed out that they are simple, utilitarian, and functional buildings. She said that the one exception to a more decorative style are the remaining barns in Third Lake Ridge, but for this building she thinks it should be a more utilitarian style of garage. She said that staff recommends approval of the project with the conditions that the applicant submit updated plans with only clapboards in the gable-end, not decorative shingles or truss; updated specifications with a garage door more in keeping with the historic character of the district; and final pedestrian door specifications for staff approval.

Andrzejewski opened the public hearing.

McLean asked the applicant if he had comments on staff's recommendations. Jenssen said that he thinks it is unfortunate that he has to make a less attractive garage, but he understood the reasoning.

Andrzejewski closed the public hearing.

ACTION:

A motion was made by McLean, seconded by Arnesen, to approve the request for the Certificate of Appropriateness with the conditions that updated plans with only clapboards in the gable-end be submitted, updated garage door specifications with a garage door more in keeping with the historic character of the district be submitted, and final pedestrian door specifications be submitted, all to be approved by staff. The motion passed by voice vote/other.