

AGENDA # 1

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION **PRESENTED:** January 10, 2007

TITLE: 227 State Street, Overture Center – Minor Alteration of a Conditional Use; Projecting Graphic for the “Madison Museum of Contemporary Art” and Comprehensive Design Review for a Canopy Graphic for the “Fresco Restaurant.” 4th Ald. Dist. (05345)

REFERRED:

REREFERRED:

REPORTED BACK:

AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary

ADOPTED:

POF:

DATED: January 10, 2007

ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Paul Wagner, Chair; Lou Host-Jablonski, Todd Barnett, Michael Barrett, Lisa Geer, Ald. Noel Radomski, Bruce Woods and Robert March.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of January 10, 2007, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL** of a conditional use; projecting graphic for the “Madison Museum of Contemporary Art” and comprehensive design review for a canopy graphic for the “Fresco Restaurant” located at 227 State Street. Appearing on behalf of the project were Mary Beth Growney Selene, Rosemary Lee, Michael Huffman, Ralph Jackson and Stephen Fleischman. Prior to the presentation, staff referenced excerpt from Chapter 31, Street Graphics Control Ordinance relevant to their consideration of one of the proposed signs for the “Madison Museum of Contemporary Art” located within the Overture Center. It is a projecting blade sign to be located over the entrance to the museum at 227 State Street. The sign is 18-feet in height with a measurement and width of 4-feet at the top and 1’6” at the bottom, flush with the building façade above a projecting canopy at the entranceway. Staff noted that the provision of the ordinance allow for its approval as a departure from the conventional requirements of the ordinance under the provisions for a “Conditional Use Graphic” as defined as follows: “A graphic which because of its unique or varying characteristics cannot be properly classified as a permitted graphic in a particular district and must be approved by the Plan Commission subject to the provisions of Section 28.12(10).” Staff noted that the Urban Design consideration of the proposed conditional use graphic was required based on the property’s location within the C4 Central Commercial District, along with consideration of the conditional use provisions for the graphic under the existing conditional use for the Overture Center as part of a minor alteration.

The other sign component under consideration is a canopy graphic for the “Fresco Restaurant.” Staff noted excerpts from the Street Graphics Control Ordinance relevant to Miscellaneous Canopy Graphics as defined in Section 31.071(3) as follows: “A graphic may be displayed on a detached canopy or an attached canopy with no signable fascia area as described in Subsec. (1), if approved by the Urban Design Commission as part of a Comprehensive Design Review under Sec. 31.04(2)(b)2.b.vi. The maximum size of any canopy graphic approved under this subsection shall be not more than ten percent (10%) of the total area of an imaginary vertical plane measured from the upper edge of the canopy to the lowest point of the canopy on which face the graphic will be attached, excluding any supporting structures. The horizontal dimension of the graphic shall be

no wider than the width of the canopy on which it is displayed. In no case shall a canopy graphic be approved unless it is in compliance with Sec. 31.04(6)(f). In addition to meeting the objectives of a Comprehensive Design Review, any graphic approved under this subsection shall integrate harmoniously into the design of the canopy structure, building, and overall signage treatment; and may be approved in lieu of other permitted graphics as provided in this Chapter. Mary Beth Growney of Ryan Signs presented details of previously approved signage for the Overture Center, as well as required in conjunction with the proposed canopy signage, as the blade sign for the Madison Museum of Contemporary Art. Following the presentation, the Commission noted the following:

- Relative to the Fresco canopy sign, an issue with the two fascia canopy signs as proposed. The Commission supports a single centered below canopy sign.
- Relevant to the projecting blade sign for the museum, the Commission felt that its approval under the provisions for a conditional use graphic was appropriate, as is existing signage around the Square and State Street for public institutions such as the Madison Children's Museum, the Veteran's Museum, and the Wisconsin State Historical Society.

ACTION:

On a motion by March, seconded by Geer, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a vote of (7-1) with Wagner abstaining. The motion required the utilization of a single canopy fascia sign for the Fresco Restaurant with a double face consistent with the ordinance provisions. The Commission instructed staff to provide for an ordinance change to allow for a single double-face below canopy sign as preferred by a majority of the Commission. Staff noted that it would follow through on the requested ordinance amendment.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 6, 7, 7, 7, 7 and 9.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 227 State Street

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	-	-	-	-	7	-	-	7
	-	-	-	-	6	-	6	6
	-	-	-	-	9	-	9	9
	-	-	-	-	7	-	-	-
	-	-	-	-	7	-	-	7
	-	-	-	-	7	-	-	7
	-	-	-	-	7	-	7	7

General Comments:

- A much needed splash of color on an otherwise boring façade.
- Absurd that current ordinance forbids an under-canopy sign.
- Nice graphic design but losing canopy transparency.
- It is always very aggravating to be forced by poorly-written codes to approve a better solution.
- Appropriate use and location.