

PLANNING DIVISION STAFF REPORT

March 25, 2019



PREPARED FOR THE PLAN COMMISSION

Project Address: 525 Wingra Street (District 13 – Ald. Arntsen)
Application Type: Demolition Permit
Legistar File ID # [54673](#)
Prepared By: Colin Punt, Planning Division
Report Includes Comments from other City Agencies, as noted
Reviewed By: Kevin Firchow, AICP, Principal Planner

Summary

Applicant: Matt Acker; Acker Buildings, Inc; 331 E. Main St.; Waunakee, WI 53597
Contact: Brittney Jackson; Acker Buildings, Inc; 331 E. Main St.; Waunakee, WI 53597
Property Owner: Fan Jiang; 525 Wingra St.; Madison, WI 53715

Requested Action: The applicant requests approval of a demolition permit to demolish an existing two-unit residence and construct a new single-family residence in the TR-C3 (Traditional Residential – Consistent 3) zoning district at 525 Wingra Avenue. The proposal is subject to the standards for Demolition and Removal Permits [§28.185(7) MGO].

Proposal Summary: The applicant proposes to demolish an existing one-and-one-half-story two-unit residence and construct a new one-and-one-half-story single-family residence at 525 Wingra Avenue.

Applicable Regulations & Standards: This proposal is subject to the standards for Demolition and Removal Permits [§28.185(7) MGO].

Review Required By: Plan Commission

Summary Recommendation: The Planning Division recommends that the Plan Commission find that the standards for demolition and removal are met and **approve** the request to demolish a two-unit residence and construct a new single-family residence in the TR-C3 (Traditional Residential – Consistent 3) zoning district at 525 Wingra Avenue. This recommendation is subject to input at the public hearing and the conditions recommended by the reviewing agencies.

Background Information

Parcel Location: The 3,360 square-foot (approximately 0.08-acre) subject property is located on the east side of Wingra Avenue, between Drake Street and Erin Street. The site is within Aldermanic District 13 (Ald. Arntsen) and the Madison Metropolitan School District.

Existing Conditions and Land Use: The subject site includes an existing 1,470-square-foot, one-and-one-half-story two-unit house. The home was originally constructed in the 1850s or 1860s and moved to its current location in 1905. It contains six total bedrooms and two and one-half bathrooms.

Surrounding Land Use and Zoning:

North: Two-unit house, zoned TR-C3 (Traditional Residential – Consistent 3);

South: Single-family homes zoned TR-C3;

East: Single-family homes, zoned TR-C3; and

West: Across Wingra Street, predominantly single-family homes and one two-unit house, all zoned TR-C3.

Adopted Land Use Plan: The [Comprehensive Plan](#) (2018) recommends Low Residential uses for the subject parcel. The [Brittingham-Vilas Neighborhood Plan](#) (1989) recommends retaining the neighborhood's current density levels and to encourage owner-occupied housing. The [Greenbush Neighborhood Plan](#) (2008) recommends that the existing housing stock should be preserved and homeownership should be increased, with a shift toward more single-family homes. The subject site is included in the [A Revitalization Strategy](#) (Supplement to the Greenbush and Vilas Neighborhood Plans) (2010) planning area, with a goal to encourage and support owner-occupied opportunities by facilitating single family/duplex reversions and conversion.

Zoning Summary: The property is zoned TR-C3 (Traditional Residential-Consistent 3).

Requirements	Required	Proposed
Lot Area (sq. ft.)	3,000 sq. ft.	3,360 sq. ft.
Lot Width	30'	40.0'
Front Yard Setback	15'	16.0'
Max. Front Yard Setback	30' or up to 20% greater than block average	16.0'
Side Yard Setback	Lot width <50': 10% lot width (4')	4.25' north 4.25' south
Rear Yard Setback	20'	21.0'
Usable Open Space	500 sq. ft.	Adequate
Maximum Lot Coverage	75%	Less than 75%
Maximum Building Height	2 stories/ 35'	2 stories/ 25'

Site Design	Required	Proposed
Number Parking Stalls	Single family detached dwelling: 1 (location only)	Attached garage
Building Forms	Yes	Single family detached building

Other Critical Zoning Items	Utility Easements
------------------------------------	-------------------

Tables Prepared by Jenny Kirchgatter, Assistant Zoning Administrator

Environmental Corridor Status: The property is not located in a mapped environmental corridor.

Public Utilities and Services: This property is served by a full range of urban services.

Project Description

The applicant is seeking Plan Commission approval for a demolition and removal permit. The applicant is proposing demolish an existing two-unit residence at 525 Wingra Street to replace it with a new single-family residence. The existing house is a 1,470-square foot, 1 ½-story, two-unit house with six total bedrooms and two-and-one half bathrooms. According to the applicant, the house is in disrepair and needs significant upgrades to be "brought to an acceptable standard of living." Planning staff has not physically inspected the structure, but submitted [photos](#) of the existing house appear to show some foundation damage, ceiling damage, worn surfaces, and possible water

damage. The letter of intent states that the owner has been aware of the repairs needed for several years, but that the repairs have become overwhelming, so the owner has decided to rebuild a new home on the site. The Building Inspection division is not currently engaged in code enforcement actions at the property, nor have there been any at the property under the current owner.

The proposed house is a 1,720-square foot, 1 ½-story, single-family residence with three bedrooms and two-and-one half bathrooms and an attached one-stall garage. It features mainly traditional design similar to most of the surrounding houses on the street, such as a front gable roof with architectural shingles, shake and lap-styled vinyl siding, a stone cladding at the base of the house, and a front porch. A street-facing garage door occupies the southern portion of the front facade. The current house does not have a garage, nor does it have alley access enabling a rear-located alley-loaded garage.

Project Analysis and Conclusion

This request is subject to the standards for demolition permits. In order to approve a demolition request, M.G.O §28.185(7) requires that the Plan Commission must find that the requested demolition and proposed use are compatible with the purpose of the demolition section and the intent and purpose of the Traditional Residential-Consistent (TR-C) zoning districts. The statement of purpose for TR-C districts says, in part:

The TR-C Districts are established to stabilize, protect and encourage throughout the City the essential characteristics of the residential areas typically located on the Isthmus, near East and near West portions of the City, and to promote and encourage a suitable environment for family life while accommodating a full range of life-cycle housing. The districts are also intended to:

- (a) Promote the preservation, development and redevelopment of traditional residential neighborhoods in a manner consistent with their distinct form and residential character.
- (b) Ensure that new buildings and additions to existing buildings are designed with sensitivity to their context in terms of building placement, facade width, height and proportions, garage and driveway placement, landscaping, and similar design features.
- (c) Maintain and improve the viability of existing housing of all types, while providing for updating of older housing in a context-sensitive manner.

The demolition standards further state that the Plan Commission shall consider and may give decisive weight to any relevant facts including impacts on the normal and orderly development of surrounding properties and the reasonableness of efforts to relocate the building. Furthermore, the proposal should be compatible with adopted plans. Finally, the demolition standards state that the Plan Commission shall consider the report of the City's Historic Preservation Planner regarding the historic value of the property as well as any report submitted by the Landmarks Commission.

The [Comprehensive Plan](#) (2018) recommends Low Residential uses for the subject parcel. Low Residential areas typically include a mix of single-family and two-unit structures. The [Brittingham-Vilas Neighborhood Plan](#) (1989) recommends retaining the neighborhood's current density levels and encouraging owner-occupied housing. The [Greenbush Neighborhood Plan](#) (2008) recommends that the existing housing stock should be preserved and homeownership should be increased, with a shift toward more single-family homes. While this proposal does not preserve the existing housing stock, it does contribute to a neighborhood shift toward a housing mix with more single-family homes, as well as toward the stated goal of more common owner-occupancy. The Greenbush Neighborhood Plan further recommends that front-facing garages for new construction be no greater than 15 feet wide if accessed from a public street. The proposed garage is 14'6" wide. New construction should be complimentary to the historic architectural elements of the neighborhood, including front entrances, porches, garage size, and garage placement. While street-facing garages are not common in this area, the garage does meet all applicable zoning requirements. The subject site is included in the [A Revitalization Strategy](#) (Supplement to the

Greenbush and Vilas Neighborhood Plans) (2010) planning area, with a goal to encourage and support owner-occupied opportunities by facilitating single family/duplex reversions and conversion and to reinforce the character of the area with a Neighborhood Conservation District. While the plan encourages much of the existing housing stock be preserved, it acknowledges that some is in disrepair and may be too expensive to rehabilitate. A strategy for replacing sub-par housing with carefully sited and designed new structures is intended to provide future stability and incentive for investment in other existing homes.

The Landmarks Commission considered the demolition of the existing house at 525 Wingra Street at its January 14, 2019 meeting. The [Preservation Planner's](#) and [Landmarks Commission's](#) demolition reports are attached. The preservation file for the property indicated that the house was likely constructed in the 1850s-60s, and that it was originally located on Doty Street. It was moved to its current location on Wingra Street in 1905. By unanimous consent, the Landmarks Commission voted to recommend to the Plan Commission that the building at 525 Wingra St has historic value related to the vernacular context of Madison's built environment, or as the work/product of an architect of note, but that the building itself are not historically, architecturally, or culturally significant.

The Plan Commission must carefully consider several issues in the determining if the standards for demolition permits can be found met. While the house is not a designated landmark, it is, nevertheless, one of the oldest structures surviving in Madison. According to City Assessor data, the principal structures on only 117 parcels in the city were built prior to 1870, making this one of the oldest buildings in Madison. And though the building is no longer in its original location and context, it has been part of the fabric of its current neighborhood for far longer than it was in its original location on Doty Street. Further, while the demolition of the house eliminates two units and does not further the [Greenbush Neighborhood Plan's](#) recommendation to preserve and rehabilitate the existing housing stock, the proposal does result in shift toward more owner-occupied single-family housing in the neighborhood, a recommendation of both the [Greenbush](#) and [Brittingham-Vilas Neighborhood Plans](#).

In considering the findings of the Landmarks Commission, the various plan recommendations in place for this location, and the applicant's proposal, the Planning Division believes that, one balance, the applicable demolition standards can be found met with the recommended conditions enumerated below.

At the time of report writing, Staff was not aware of public comment regarding this proposal.

Recommendation

Planning Division Recommendation (Contact Colin Punt, (608) 243-0455)

The Planning Division recommends that the Plan Commission find that the standards for demolition and removal are met and **approve** the request to demolish an existing two-family residence and construct a new single-family residence at 525 Wingra Avenue. This recommendation is subject to input at the public hearing and the conditions recommended by the reviewing agencies.

Recommended Conditions of Approval

Major/Non-Standard Conditions are Shaded
--

Planning Division (Contact Colin Punt, (608) 243-0455)

1. Label materials, colors, and heights on building elevations.

Zoning Administrator (Contact Jenny Kirchgatter, (608) 266-4429)

2. Section 28.185(7)(a)5 requires that if a demolition or removal permit is approved, it shall not be issued until

the reuse and recycling plan is approved by the Recycling Coordinator, Bryan Johnson (608-266-4682).

3. Every person who is required to submit a reuse and recycling plan pursuant to Section 28.185(7)(a)5. shall submit documents showing compliance with the plan within sixty (60) days of completion of demolition.
4. A demolition or removal permit is valid for one (1) year from the date of the Plan Commission.

Engineering Division (Contact Brenda Stanley, (608) 261-9127)

5. Prior to approval, the owner or owner's representative shall obtain a permit to plug each existing sanitary sewer lateral that serves a building which is proposed for demolition. For each lateral to be plugged the owner shall complete a sewer lateral plugging application and pay the applicable permit fees. The permit application is available on line at <http://www.cityofmadison.com/engineering/permits.cfm>.
6. The plan set shall be revised to show more information on proposed drainage for the site. This shall be accomplished by using spot elevations and drainage arrows or through the use of proposed contours. It is necessary to show the location of drainage leaving the site to the public right-of-way. It may be necessary to provide information off the site to fully meet this requirement.

Engineering Division – Mapping Section (Contact Jeff Quamme, (608) 266-4097)

7. The final site plans shall include a copy of the property survey to be completed as noted on the current plan.
8. The address of the new single family house is 525 Wingra St. The site plan shall reflect a proper street address of the property as reflected by official City of Madison Assessor's and Engineering Division records.

Fire Department (Contact Bill Sullivan, (608) 261-9658)

9. Madison Fire Department recommends the installation of a residential fire sprinkler system in accordance with NFPA 13D. Additional information is available at the Home Fire Sprinkler Coalition website: <https://homefiresprinkler.org/building-residential-fire-sprinklers>
10. Please consider allowing Madison Fire Dept. to conduct training sequences prior to demolition. Contact MFD Training Division to discuss possibilities: Division Chief Tracy Burrus at tburrus@cityofmadison.com or (608)266- 5959.

Parks/Forestry Division (Contact Brad Hofmann, (608) 267-4908)

11. An existing inventory of trees (location, species, & DBH) and any tree removal plans (in PDF format) shall be submitted to the plans and Brad Hofmann – bhofmann@cityofmadison.com or 266-4816. All proposed street tree removals within the right of way shall be reviewed by City Forestry. Approval and permitting of street tree removals shall be obtained from the City Forester and/or the Board of Public Works prior to the approval of the site plan.
12. City Forestry will issue a removal permit for a 19" Linden tree due to driveway installation. Please contact Brad Hofmann – bhofmann@cityofmadison.com or 266-4816 to obtain the street tree removal permit.