



Project Name & Address: 1254 Rutledge Street

Application Type(s): Certificate of Appropriateness for demolition and new construction in the Third Lake Ridge historic district

Legistar File ID # [60138](#)

Prepared By: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

Date Prepared: April 27, 2020

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Mark Jensen

Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the demolition of an existing garage structure and construction of a new garage structure.

Background Information

Parcel Location/Information: The subject site is located in the Third Lake Ridge Local Historic District.

Relevant State Statute Section:

Wisc SS 62.23(7)(em)2m. In the repair or replacement of a property that is designated as a historic landmark or included within a historic district or neighborhood conservation district under this paragraph, a city shall allow an owner to use materials that are similar in design, color, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities.

Relevant Ordinance Sections:

- 41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.** A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.
- (1) New construction or exterior alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
 - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City’s historic resources.
 - (2) Demolition or Removal. In determining whether to approve a certificate of appropriateness for any demolition or removal of any landmark or structure within a historic district, the Landmarks

Commission shall consider all of the following, and may give decisive weight to any or all of the following:

- (a) Whether the structure is of such architectural or historic significance that its demolition or removal would be detrimental to the public interest and contrary to the general welfare of the people of the City and the State.
- (b) Whether a landmark's designation has been rescinded.
- (c) Whether the structure, although not itself a landmark structure, contributes to the distinctive architectural or historic character of the historic district as a whole and therefore should be preserved for the benefit of the people of the City and the State.
- (d) Whether demolition or removal of the subject property would be contrary to the policy and purpose of this ordinance and/or to the objectives of the historic preservation plan for the applicable historic district as duly adopted by the Common Council.
- (e) Whether the structure is of such old and unusual or uncommon design, method of construction, or material that it could not be reproduced or be reproduced only with great difficulty and/or expense.
- (f) Whether retention of the structure would promote the general welfare of the people of the City and the State by encouraging study of American history, architecture and design or by developing an understanding of American culture and heritage.
- (g) The condition of the property, provided that any deterioration of the property which is self-created or which is the result of a failure to maintain the property as required by this chapter cannot qualify as a basis for the issuance of a certificate of appropriateness for demolition or removal.
- (h) Whether any new structure proposed to be constructed or change in use proposed to be made is compatible with the historic resources of the historic district in which the subject property is located, or if outside a historic district, compatible with the mass and scale of buildings within two hundred (200) feet of the boundary of the landmark site.

Prior to approving a certificate of appropriateness for demolition, the Landmarks Commission may require the applicant to provide documentation of the structure. Documentation shall be in the form required by the Commission.

41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (8) Standards for New Structures in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use. Any new structures on parcels zoned for mixed-use and residential use that are located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways: (Am. by ORD-16-00082, 9-15-16)
 - (a) Gross Volume.
 - (b) Height.
 - (c) The proportion and rhythm of solids to voids in the street facades.
 - (d) Materials used in the street facades.
 - (e) The design of the roof.
 - (f) The rhythm of buildings and masses.
 - (g) Directional expression.
 - (h) Materials, patterns and textures.
 - (i) Landscape treatment.

Analysis and Conclusion

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish an existing detached garage structure and construct a new detached garage structure. The Queen Anne-style house was constructed in 1892, but it is unclear when the detached garage was constructed. There is no building permit on file for the garage. It does not appear in the 1908 Sanborn map, but is in place on the 1942 map. The existing garage is simple in form and style, but its

dimensions make it difficult to use for current vehicle sizes. The construction of a new garage will allow the property to adapt to current conditions for new and ongoing uses. The current garage has shiplap wood siding rather than the clapboard siding on the house, but is otherwise a simple and unornamented structure.

The proposal is for a garage that is slightly larger than the existing and constructed in approximately the same location. It would be a single-story gable-front structure as is common for garages in Third Lake Ridge. However, the proposed new garage introduces decorative trusses and shingle siding in the front-facing gable and more decorative carriage-style doors. Of the other garages in the vicinity, they have minimal ornamentation and are utilitarian in nature. The exceptions to this are the few remaining barns and a some newer structures designed to have barn-style motifs.

A discussion of the relevant ordinance sections follows:

41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS. A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.

- (2) Demolition or Removal. In determining whether to approve a certificate of appropriateness for any demolition or removal of any landmark or structure within a historic district, the Landmarks Commission shall consider all of the following, and may give decisive weight to any or all of the following:
 - (a) This garage does not appear to have any known architectural or historic significance.
 - (b) N/A
 - (c) While the existing garage speaks to the style of garages found in the historic district in the early to mid-twentieth century, these structures are typically minimally visible from the street and the removal of this garage will not negatively impact the character of the historic district.
 - (d) Removal of this utilitarian structure is not contrary to the policy and purpose of this ordinance.
 - (e) The structure is not exceptionally old or unique.
 - (f) The retention of this small garage will promote the general welfare of the people of the City and the State by encouraging study of American history, architecture and design or by developing an understanding of American culture and heritage.
 - (g) N/A
 - (h) The new garage is largely compatible with the historic resources in the district in terms of its mass and scale.

Staff would request full exterior and interior photo documentation of the structure prior to its demolition.

41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (8) Standards for New Structures in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use. Any new structures on parcels zoned for mixed-use and residential use that are located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways: (Am. by ORD-16-00082, 9-15-16)
 - (a) The gross volume of the new garage is in keeping with the volume of other garages within 200 feet.
 - (b) The single-story garage is in keeping with the height of other accessory structures in the vicinity.
 - (c) The garage is on a corner lot, so it is highly visible. It maintains the traditional proportion and rhythm of solids to voids in the street facades of other garages in the vicinity, including similar garages located on corner lots.
 - (d) While the style of cladding for the new garage will differ from the existing garage, the clapboard-style cladding is more typical of all types of structures in the vicinity. The

introduction of decorative trusses in the gable-end of the street façade does not seem to have a precedent in the vicinity.

- (e) The simple front-facing gable roof form is similar to other garages in the vicinity.
- (f) The new garage will be located in approximately the same location as the existing. As with other garages in the vicinity, it is located behind the principal structure.
- (g) The new garage is in keeping with the directional expression of other accessory structures within 200 feet.
- (h) The cladding and roofing materials are in keeping with the historic resources within 200 feet. The decorative truss and shingle siding in the gable end and the carriage-style door is out of character with the utilitarian-style historic garages.
- (i) The proposal maintains the existing landscaping treatment.

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness are met and recommends that the Landmarks Commission approve the project with the following conditions:

1. Submit updated plans for staff approval with only clapboards in the gable-end
2. Submit new specifications to staff with a garage door more in keeping with the historic character of the district
3. Submit final pedestrian door specifications for staff approval