

AGENDA # 1

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: October 15, 2008
TITLE: 709 Struck Street – Street Graphics Variance for Dane County Credit Union. 1 st Ald. Dist. (11985)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: October 15, 2008	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Lou Host-Jablonski, Chair; Bruce Woods, Jay Ferm, John Harrington, Ron Luskin, Marsha Rummel, Dawn Weber, Richard Slayton and Richard Wagner.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of October 15, 2008, the Urban Design Commission **REJECTED** a Street Graphics Variance located at 709 Struck Street. Appearing on behalf of the project were Jon Lowery and Michael Olkwitz, representing the Dane County Credit Union. Prior to the presentation staff noted that the sign as proposed replaces an existing ground sign in the exact location. The existing ground received a size/setback variance should have received a setback variance from the provisions of Urban Design District No. 2 in January of 2003 when the project was originally approved. Although the new sign is exactly in the same location and is relatively the same size; the addition of an electronic reader board feature is not considered a change of copy and also requires consideration of the setback variance for the new sign as reconfigured. Michael Olkwitz of Grant Signs provided a summary of the proposal. The sign as currently located and as modified doesn't meet the required 20-foot setback of Urban Design District No. 2. Following the presentation, the Commission's comments were as follows:

- The electronic reader board cheapens the look of the sign; the sign is better without.
- Three lines of text proposed; limit to two lines to align with mid horizontal band on vertical corners.
- The reader board element is billboard advertising; not really for way finding .

A discussion on the standards for approval followed between the Commission and staff relative to the jurisdiction of the Commission to regulate electronic reader boards in Urban Design Districts, Conditional Use Planned Commercial Sites, Planned Developments and variance provisions within the Street Graphics Control Ordinance, MGO Chapter 31 in contrast to their allowance in areas outside of the Commission's jurisdiction. Staff noted a previous directive by the Commission not administratively approved this type of technology within its jurisdiction and require formal consideration when proposed in any of the above areas.

ACTION:

On a motion by Ferm, seconded by Harrington, the Urban Design Commission **REJECTED** a Street Graphics Ordinance located at 709 Struck Street. The motion was passed on a vote of (7-2) with Weber and Slayton voting no. The motion to reject noted approval for a non-electronic reader board version of the sign.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 2, 3, 5, 5, 5, 5 and 6.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 709 Struck Street

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	-	-	-	-	3	-	-	3
	-	-	-	-	5	-	-	5
	-	-	-	-	5	-	-	5
	-	-	-	-	5	-	-	5
	-	6	-	-	5	-	-	6
	-	-	-	-	5	-	-	5
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	2
	-	-	-	-	5	-	-	-

General Comments:

- Reader board just not appropriate for this use and location. It would be a bad precedent to approve this.
- Handsome sign.
- Reader board cheapens the look of the sign and the building.