

Memorandum

To: Board of Estimates, City of Madison
From: Jeff Edge, P.E.
Re: Edgewater Hotel Public Spaces-Construction Cost Review Analysis
JSD Project # 10-4184
Date: May 10, 2010
cc: Joe Gromacki, TIF Coordinator, City of Madison

INTRODUCTION

The City of Madison has contracted with JSD to provide an independent review/analysis of the proposed TIF request submitted by The Hammes Company for the Public Improvements within the redevelopment of the Edgewater Hotel Project. This document has been prepared for the Madison Board of Estimates review. JSD reviewed Architectural, Landscape and Civil drawings dated March 10, 2010 as provided by the Hammes Company along with other support documents outlining the request for TIF support. We have met with the Developer, the Hammes Company and Contractor J. H. Findorff and performed a walk through of the site to gain a better understanding of the elements of this planned development and its complexity.

BACKGROUND

This generalized cost summary looked at the development process sequentially from the deconstruction of existing building elements to the construction of new structure. This was not an in-depth cost summary/analysis, but rather a generalized review of the present available data and associated costs for conformance with industry standards. We assigned costs to the areas of work outlined in the sequential process based on Generalized Costs Standard to the Industry and our experience. These costs are based on present 2010 values. We applied cost multipliers as we felt applicable to the various elements and based on the planned deconstruction of the existing Ballroom / Meeting Spaces / Bar and other service spaces within the 1970's construction. We also looked at the degree of difficulty associated with building over an existing parking structure and guest rooms, adjacent to a historic structure, on a steep embankment next to Lake Mendota. The following review/analysis reflects our understanding of the breakdown of the TIF request areas/items. The building area is contiguous and the dividing line between TIF request areas/items was assumed based on our interpretation of the documents and the associated areas/items within the TIF request.

ANALYSIS

TERRACE DEVELOPMENT

- Construction of the Terrace will begin with shoring the existing 1970's structure prior to the introduction of new loads to the current Ballroom/Meetings room floor. This floor is the roof of the parking structure and hotel guest rooms below the top level of the building. Opinion of Probable Construction Cost: \$150,000
- Because of the time frame in which the 1970's addition was built, paints were potentially lead based and asbestos used in other construction products. This will require abatement prior to the start of the deconstruction of the Ballroom/Meeting room's level from the 1970's addition. Opinion of Probable Construction Cost: \$200,000

- The Ballroom level will require careful deconstruction to prevent damage to the existing parking structure and finished spaces below this level which are to remain. The north glass wall of the Ballroom which overlooks Lake Mendota and the structural slab which cantilevers out 6' feet from the floor levels below, over the lake shoreline, will need to be carefully removed to prevent damage at the shoreline below. Tall scaffolding will most likely be used extending from the existing narrow shoreline path to the level of the cantilevered slab. Opinion of Probable Construction Cost: \$1,200,000
- The removal of the top level will also include the removal and relocation/replacement of the mechanical systems currently located on the roof of the 1970's structure.
Opinion of Probable Construction Cost: \$250,000
- The South half of the roof slab for the parking structure slopes downward away from the North half of the slab which is flat. This slab currently exists below the drive lane along the south side of the Ballroom. To provide a proper base for the Terrace slab this section of the concrete slab will be removed and recast level matching the Northern half of the floor. Opinion of Probable Construction Cost: \$900,000
- The proposed Terrace stairs, planters and other improvements will provide a heavier load to the existing structure than was presumably designed for when the 1970's addition was built with the Ballroom level. The addition of these new loads will require reinforcing and strengthening the present Ballroom floor and the columns, beams and potentially resizing footings below this level.
Opinion of Probable Construction Cost: \$500,000
- The present parking structure entrance/exit will be infilled with a concrete wall and new foundations constructed at the South side of the 1970's addition. Opinion of Probable Construction Cost: \$100,000
- Soils will be imported to in-fill and regrade the site from Langdon Street to the South side of the stairs at the elevation of the entrance to the proposed new hotel. The concrete Autocourt will slope steeply along the length of the upper planter beginning at Langdon Street before becoming level at the large drop-off area south of the Terrace. At the North end of the Autocourt the concrete drive will become a structural slab spanning over the Southern half of the parking structure and proposed storage rooms below. The Autocourt will be a fire lane requiring the structural slab to support fire truck loading. A snow melt system will be built into the concrete of the Autocourt to provide safe winter access for hotel visitors and safety vehicles.
Opinion of Probable Construction Cost: \$1,750,000
- Driving access to the existing below grade parking structure will be through a new unattached parking facility. A new entrance/exit will be cut through the foundation wall of the existing parking structure and a new underground tunnel will connect the new parking ramp to the existing facility which was constructed as part of the 1970's addition. Opinion of Probable Construction Cost: \$800,000
- Concrete stairs will connect the Autocourt to the lower Terrace. Construction of the stairs will include concrete foundation walls supported on the top of the newly cast slab over the south end of the existing parking ramp. Public restrooms and support services for the Terrace will be constructed under the stairs and the upper Terrace/Autocourt. Opinion of Probable Construction Cost: \$700,000
- The Terrace will consist of a combination of hardscape and landscaped areas. The hardscaped areas will consist of tiles and pavers and decorative concrete. The proposed hardscape areas will be built over rigid insulation supported by the existing Ballroom floor slab and the replacement slab proposed for the South half of the garage area below. These concrete surfaces will be waterproofed prior to placing the rigid insulation base. An extensive plaza drain and underfloor drainage system will drain the planters and the nearly level hardscape surfaces of the Terrace. The landscaping will be extensive and varied. Low lying plants will grow in shallow planters while taller shrubs and trees will be placed in deeper cast concrete planters supported on the structural slab below the Terrace level. Fire pits will be constructed on the structural slab and extend above the Terrace slab. Site utilities for the Terrace lighting and water for the planters will be provided. Decorative rails for the stairs and along the North edge of the Terrace at the Lake Mendota overlook will be provided. Opinion of Probable Construction Cost: \$3,750,000
- The relocation of the existing Ballroom/Meeting rooms and support spaces from the current location in the 1970s construction into the proposed new hotel and the shifting of the proposed hotel away from current structural support elements create added framing in the new hotel. To provide for the clear span over the proposed new Ballroom/Meeting spaces and provide for lateral stability a load transfer shearwall would

need to be constructed as part of the new hotel. This wall would transfer the gravity loads from the floor and roof framing above the open space and the lateral loads to support framing at the sides of the open Ballroom floor. Opinion of Probable Construction Cost: \$600,000

- The elevator core area of the proposed new hotel tower was shifted to accommodate the location of the Ballroom/Meeting rooms in the new building. This pushed the core into the hillside resulting in added costs for earth retention. Opinion of Probable Cost:\$200,000

TIF Request \$9,600,000

Opinion of Probable Construction Cost: \$11,100,000

GRAND STAIR AND WATERFRONT ACCESS

- Construction of the Stairway and Waterfront Access will begin with the demolition of the western end of the 1970's addition at the interface with the original 1940's hotel. Concrete retaining walls will be required to retain soils between the grade changes from the stairs and landings and the building floors of the 1970's addition. Opinion of Probable Construction Cost: \$500,000
- The construction will consist of a series of wide, cast-in-place concrete stairs cascading down the steep hill from the South near Langdon Street and ending at the North at the Lake Mendota shoreline. Decorative handrails will be provided and a snow melt system will be built into the stairs to facilitate use of the stairs in the winter months. Opinion of Probable Construction Cost: \$750,000
- As a result of the demolition required to provide the stair access, portions of the façade of the original 1940's hotel and walls and floors of the 1970's addition will need to be reconstructed. Opinion of Probable Construction Cost: \$400,000
- Planters and landscaping will be built along the stairs along with a watering system for the planters. Opinion of Probable Construction Cost: \$100,000
- ADA access to the lake shore will be provided by a relocated elevator within the 1940's addition and ramping outside the building to the waterfront. Opinion of Probable Construction Cost: \$500,000
- Access to the existing apartment building will be maintained and a tunnel is proposed to be built below the stair to connect the 1940's hotel with the 1970's addition. Opinion of Probable Construction Cost: \$50,000
- Relocation of utilities impacted by the separation of the 1940s and 1970s buildings. Opinion of Probable Construction Cost: \$150,000

TIF Request \$2,400,000

Opinion of Probable Construction Cost: Total \$2,450,000

SITE IMPROVEMENTS

- The intersection of Wisconsin Avenue and Langdon Street will be reworked and Langdon Street will be extended East of Wisconsin to create a private drive to access the new underground parking structure. Opinion of Probable Construction Cost: \$200,000
- Some grading changes will be made and new sidewalks will be placed. This will require construction of some soil retainage system. Opinion of Probable Construction Cost: \$100,000

TIF Request \$1,300,000

Opinion of Probable Construction Cost: \$300,000

DEMOLITION & REMEDIATION

- Demolition and remediation of the curvilinear features of the 1940s structure will be completed as part of the remodeling and construction to reestablish the original design appearance.
Opinion of Probable Construction Cost: \$150,000
- Demolition of areas of the existing dock to provide for construction of a new larger dock.
Opinion of Probable Construction Cost: \$150,000
- Construction of the relocated elevator within the 1940s construction will include demolition of areas of the existing concrete floor slabs and walls to provide access. It is anticipated that there will be minor Mechanical, Electrical and Plumbing replacement with some remediation work required.
Opinion of Probable Construction Cost: \$100,000
- Existing stairs to the shoreline East of the 1970s building will be demolish and removed.
Opinion of Probable Construction Cost: \$50,000

Remove and replace the laundry room slab of the 1940s hotel to accommodate the exterior grades.
Construct new walls and foundation. Opinion of Probable Construction Cost: \$300,000

TIF Request \$1,100,000

Opinion of Probable Construction Cost: Total \$750,000

WATERFRONT IMPROVEMENTS

- New riprap will be placed along the shoreline. Opinion of Probable Construction Cost: \$200,000
- The shoreline path will be demoed and a new concrete path paced along the shoreline.
Opinion of Probable Construction Cost: \$150,000
- Landscaping will be placed along the new path along with public seating.
Opinion of Probable Construction Cost: \$100,000
- Public restrooms will be provided in the area of the Rigadoon room at the 1940's original hotel.
Opinion of Probable Construction Cost: \$100,000
- A public dock will be constructed. Opinion of Probable Construction Cost: \$250,000

TIF Request \$900,000

Opinion of Probable Construction Cost: Total \$800,000

SITE UTILITIES

- Utility Demolition/Abandon in place. Opinion of Probable Construction Cost: \$50,000
- Stormwater control system will be relocated and a Stormwater treatment system will be constructed. Opinion of Probable Construction Cost: \$200,000
- The sanitary system will be extended into the new construction. Opinion of Probable Construction Cost: \$50,000
- The electrical service and vault will be relocated and extended to the new construction. Opinion of Probable Construction Cost: \$100,000
- Reconstruction of water lines and the addition of fire hydrants will be completed. Opinion of Probable Construction Cost: \$50,000

TIF Request \$600,000

Opinion of Probable Construction Cost: Total \$450,000

SUMMARY

Our cost breakdown based on the various elements of the TIF request resulted in a total of \$15,850,000. The difference in cost between various elements could be attributed to how different work items were assigned to the various TIF elements.

EDGEWATER REDEVELOPMENT – COST COMPARISON TABLE

TIF ELEMENT	TIF REQUEST	OPINION OF PROBABLE CONSTRUCTION COST
Terrace Development	\$9,600,000	\$11,100,000
Grand Stair and Waterfront Access	\$2,400,000	\$ 2,450,000
Site Improvements	\$1,300,000	\$ 300,000
Demolition and Remediation	\$1,100,000	\$ 750,000
Waterfront Improvements	\$ 900,000	\$ 800,000
Site Utilities	\$ 600,000	\$ 450,000

Our review of costs associated with the six (6) separate TIF request numbers is based on present costs. No attempt was made to adjust costs and duration. Our values looked at present costs of construction.