PREPARED FOR THE LANDMARKS COMMISSION

Project Name & Address: 2113 Kendall Street

Application Type(s): Certificate of Appropriateness for an addition

Legistar File ID # 88410

Prepared By: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

Date Prepared: June 11, 2025

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Meri Tepper, Associated Housewrights

Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate

of Appropriateness to construct an addition

Background Information

Parcel Location/Information: The subject property is located within the University Heights local historic district

Relevant Ordinance Sections:

41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.

A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.

- (1) <u>New Construction or Exterior Alteration</u>. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
 - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources.

41.25 STANDARDS FOR ALTERATIONS.

- (1) General
 - (a) Alterations are defined as any change to any portion of the exterior of a building or site that replaces existing materials or changes its appearance. This section provides standards for building alterations.
 - (b) Materials and Features
 - 1. Alterations shall be in keeping with the original design and character of the building.
- (5). Windows and Doors
 - (a) Openings
 - 1. A limited number of openings in walls above the foundation not visible from the developed public right-of-way may be filled in a manner that retains the original

- opening pattern and size, and is similar in design, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities of the surrounding wall.
- 2. New window openings may be added to elevations not visible from the developed public right-of-way.
- 3. The new openings and the windows or doors in them shall be compatible with the overall design of the building.

41.26 STANDARDS FOR ADDITIONS.

(1) General

(a) <u>General</u>

- 1. New additions on the front of the principal structure are prohibited, except for restoring or reconstructing missing historic features that can be documented.
- 2. A new addition shall be designed to be subordinate and compatible with the character of the structure.
- 3. The addition shall be visually separated from the principal building.
- 4. The alignment, rhythm, and size of the window and door openings of the new addition shall be similar to those of the historic building.

(b) Materials and Features

 A new addition shall be constructed on a secondary or non-character defining elevation so that historic materials and features are not obscured, damaged or destroyed.

(2) Building Site

(a) <u>General</u>

1. Exterior additions to historic buildings shall be designed to be compatible with the historic character of historic resources within two hundred (200) feet and to maintain the pattern of the district.

(3) Exterior Walls

(a) General

 Materials used for exterior walls of the addition shall be similar in design, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities of the historic building, but differentiated enough so that it is not confused as historic or original to the building.

(b) Wood

1. Products that replicate wood shall have a smooth surface without textured faux wood grain.

(4) Roofs

(a) <u>General</u>

1. The form and pitch of the addition roof shall be similar to and compatible with the existing roof form and pitch.

(b) <u>Materials</u>

1. Visible roof materials shall be similar to the historic roof materials on the structure.

(5) Windows and Doors

(a) General

- 1. Openings and the windows or doors in them shall be compatible with the overall design of the historic building.
- 2. The new openings shall have similar dimensions, operation, components, and finish as the historic windows or doors of the structure.

(b) Windows and Storm Windows

 Storm windows shall minimally obscure the window beneath and have a nonreflective coating.

(c) Entrance Doors and Storm Doors

- 1. Doors shall be compatible with the overall design of the building.
- 2. New door openings shall have a similar height to width ratio, components, and finish as the historic doors of the structure.
- 3. Storm doors shall be full-light or full-view and have a non-reflective coating.

(6) Entrances, Porches, Balconies and Decks

- (b) <u>Balconies and Decks</u>
 - 1. Rear yard decks shall be constructed so that they are not visible from the developed public right-of-way to which the building is oriented.
 - 3. All parts of the deck or balcony, except the flooring and steps, shall be painted or opaquely stained.

Analysis and Conclusion

The proposed project is to construct a rear addition to the existing historic structure (simple vernacular house constructed in 1922) and add a new second-story window to the existing house. The rear addition will replace an existing nonhistoric addition. The addition will be separated from the historic building with a slight inset of the wall plane. Otherwise, the siding, trim, and window configuration all replicate the character of the historic house. There is a more contemporary interpretation of the architectural style on the rear of the addition, which is where we would expect to find more variation and will help the addition to read as a product of its time while still being compatible with the architectural style of the building. The proposal also includes introducing a new window on the second story of the historic house. This will be highly visible from the developed public right-of-way and does not meet the current standards for alterations.

Staff has discussed the

A discussion of relevant standards follows:

41.25 STANDARDS FOR ALTERATIONS.

- (1) General
 - (a) Alterations are defined as any change to any portion of the exterior of a building or site that replaces existing materials or changes its appearance. This section provides standards for building alterations.
 - (b) Materials and Features
 - The application does make the case that there are pairs of windows found elsewhere on the historic building. There have been several modifications over time to this structure and it is difficult to know what is original.

(5). Windows and Doors

- (a) Openings
 - 2. This standard only allows for adding new windows to elevations not visible from the developed public right-of-way. As this new window would be very visible, it is not allowed under the current ordinance.
 - 3. The new opening would be compatible with the overall design of the building.

41.26 STANDARDS FOR ADDITIONS.

- (1) General
 - (a) <u>General</u>
 - 1. The new addition is on the rear of the structure.
 - 2. The inset of the wall plane allows for it to read as subordinate to the historic structure while still being architecturally compatible.

- 3. The inset of the wall plane visually separates the addition from the rest of the principal building.
- 4. The alignment, rhythm, and size of the window and door openings of the new addition appear to be similar to those of the historic building.

(b) Materials and Features

1. The addition is proposed for the rear of the house and will replace an existing nonhistoric addition.

(2) Building Site

- (a) <u>General</u>
 - 1. The rear addition is in keeping with the location of additions to other historic resources in the vicinity.
- (3) <u>Exterior Walls</u>
 - (a) General
 - 1. The wall cladding and trim appear to be similar in design, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities of the historic building.
 - (b) Wood
 - 1. The synthetic wood siding is specified in the plans as being smooth-surfaced.
- (4) Roofs
 - (a) General
 - 1. The form and pitch of the addition roof is identical to the historic house.
 - (b) Materials
 - 1. The new asphalt shingles will match those on the rest of the house.
- (5) Windows and Doors
 - (a) General
 - 1. The window and door openings appear to have a similar design and function and are compatible overall design of the historic building.
 - 2. The new openings have similar dimensions, operation, components, and finish as the historic windows or doors of the structure.
 - (c) Entrance Doors and Storm Doors
 - 1. The full-light doors on the back of the building are compatible with the overall design of the building.
 - 2. The new door openings have a similar height to width ratio, components, and finish as the historic doors of the structure.
- (6) Entrances, Porches, Balconies and Decks
 - (b) <u>Balconies and Decks</u>
 - 1. The rear yard deck is inset and will not be visible from the developed public right-of-way to which the building is oriented.
 - 3. All parts of the deck will have a cladding that gives the appearance of being opaquely stained.

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness could be met and recommends the Landmarks Commission approve the project with the following condition:

1. Submit updated drawings that remove the proposed new second story window on the existing house