



Project Name/Address: 1438 Rutledge Street
Application Type: Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations in historic district
Legistar File ID # [33305](#)
Prepared By: Amy L. Scanlon, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Rob Van Nevel and Tony Jamieson
Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations including replacement and repair of siding, trim, stucco, soffits and windows.

Background Information

Parcel Location: The subject site is located in the Marquette Bungalows local and National Register Historic Districts

Relevant Landmarks Ordinance Sections:

33.19(13)(d) Criteria for the Review of Additions, Exterior Alterations and Repairs. All additions, exterior alterations and repairs must be compatible with the historic character of the house and the Marquette Bungalows Historic District.

1. Re-Siding. Re-siding with aluminum or vinyl that replaces or covers clapboards or non-original siding on buildings originally sided with clapboards will be approved by the Landmarks Commission provided that the new siding imitates the width of the original clapboard siding to within one inch and provided further that all architectural details including, but not limited to, window trim, wood cornices and other ornament either remain uncovered or are duplicated exactly in appearance. All trim must continue to project out beyond the plane of the siding. Brick, stucco, and half-timber detailing shall match the original in appearance. Original wood shingle siding should be repaired or replaced to match the original in appearance, whenever possible; however, covering wood shingles with double-four vinyl or aluminum may be approved.
2. Roof Materials. *Not applicable*
3. Skylights. *Not applicable*
4. Dormers and Other Roof Alterations. *Not applicable*
5. Chimneys. *Not applicable*
6. Windows and Doors.
 - a. **General Criteria.** The original appearance of leaded glass and other nonrectangular decorative windows (e.g., curved top windows) on any facade of the house shall be retained. Replacement of such windows shall duplicate the original in size, configuration and appearance. Picture windows are prohibited. Trim on new or remodeled windows shall match the original window trim on the house.
 - b. **Street Façades.** Windows and doors on the front or street façade of the house and on side faces within 10 feet of the front façade of the house shall retain their original or existing appearance,

- including true muntins where they exist. Replacement windows and doors may be approved if they match the original appearance.
- c. **Non-Street Side Façades.** Retention of the original appearance of windows and doors on the sides of the house is encouraged. However, if replacement or new windows are proposed, the muntin design of the original windows on the house may either be replicated with true-divided lights or with exterior or interior applied grids or with grids applied between the panes of glass. New windows shall either be casement windows or double-hung windows. Sash on new windows over four (4) feet square shall be divided by muntins or mullions. Bay windows may be approved if they have sides perpendicular to the wall and if they do not extend beyond the eaves of the roof.
 - d. **Rear Façade.** Replacement, remodeling or installation of new doors and windows on the rear façade will not be restricted except as discussed under “General Criteria” above.
7. **Porches.** *Not applicable*
 8. **Second Exits.** *Not applicable*
 9. **Additions and Other Alterations.** New additions on the front of the house are prohibited. Additions on the sides or rear shall be permitted if they are compatible with the house in architectural design, scale, color, texture, proportion of solids to voids and proportion of widths to heights of doors and windows. Materials and architectural details used in additions and alterations shall duplicate in texture, appearance, and design, the materials and details used in the original construction of the house or of other houses in the district. The Landmarks Commission may approve an exception to this policy where the existing building materials and architectural details differ from the original. Additions and exterior alterations that exactly duplicate the original materials in composition are encouraged. Additions or exterior alterations that destroy significant architectural features are prohibited. Side additions shall not detract from the design composition of the original facade. (Renum. by ORD-08-00122, 11-22-08)
 10. **Foundations.** *Not applicable*
 11. **Tuckpointing and Brick Repair.** *Not applicable*
 12. **Storm Windows and Doors.** Storm windows and doors shall be enameled, painted or otherwise coated with a colored surface; raw aluminum is prohibited. Storm door designs of wood and glass to match the original design on the house or on similar houses in the district is encouraged. Storm doors of simple design with no stylistic references (e.g., colonial cross-bars) may also be used. Storm doors with metal grilles may be approved provided that they blend with the style of the house. (Renum. by ORD-08-00122, 11-22-08)

Analysis and Conclusion

Staff met with the Mr. Van Nevel on December 17, 2013 at the site to review the proposed work. Staff provided the Applicants with tax credit program information.

A discussion of each of the relevant Ordinance sections is below:

1. **Re-Siding.** The Applicant is proposing the use of 3” exposure replacement siding. There is an opportunity to evaluate the exterior materials when the aluminum siding is removed to confirm the original appearance (siding exposure, areas of stucco, shingle siding, etc.) and revise the plans. The Applicants explain in the submission materials that if areas of stucco are found under the aluminum siding, the stucco will be repaired or replaced. The stucco plane, siding plane and related trim details shall maintain the historic projections and relationships. The Commission should discuss whether the original wood siding, if found under the aluminum siding, should be retained in place or removed. The submission materials note that all damaged wood trim will be replaced, but it is possible that not all existing wood trim is damaged.
2. **Roof Materials.** *Not applicable*
3. **Skylights.** *Not applicable*

4. Dormers and Other Roof Alterations. *Not applicable*
5. Chimneys. *Not applicable*
6. Windows and Doors. Staff was on site in December to assess the general condition of the windows and found that the window condition is good. There were typical condition issues present for windows of this age including broken glass panes, broken weight and pulley system, and movement between the sash; however, there are also sash made of older growth wood that have been well maintained and show little if any deterioration of the bottom rail. Staff explained that window repair would be more beneficial than replacement given the good condition and provided the Applicants with tax credit information. The submission materials indicate that the Applicants are considering replacement windows given the costs associated with repair, but are not considering the tax credit program.
 - a. The Applicants are proposing to retain the original appearance of the three part curved top windows by selecting a replacement window manufacturer that provides custom features. The leaded glass windows in the Living Room were not mentioned in the submission materials, but shall remain in place. Since these windows are not operable (fixed in place) there is no lead dust concern and the exterior can be protected by fixed storms.
 - b. The Applicants are proposing to retain the original/existing appearance of the windows on the street façade and on the side façades within 10 feet of the front façade of the house.
 - c. The Applicants are proposing to retain the original/existing appearance of the windows on the non-street side façades except where the equal sash double hung windows do not have muntins. In these locations, they are proposing to replace with a window that has a smaller top sash and larger bottom sash which the submission materials reference as “cottage style 2:3 ratio windows”. Staff understands that the Applicants are attempting to provide continuity of the window styles and types and that the Ordinance encourages the retention of the original appearance of windows; however, staff is concerned that the proportion of the divided lights in the top sash match the proportion of the other windows of similar size.
 - d. The Applicants are not proposing to change the size of the windows on the rear façade during the window replacement project except where the equal sash double hung windows do not have muntins. For those locations, please refer to the comments above.
7. Porches. *Not applicable*
8. Second Exits. *Not applicable*
9. Additions and Other Alterations. The siding, bead board soffit material, and profiled detail elements shall duplicate the texture, appearance and design of the original elements. The siding should have a smooth surface instead of a faux grained surface. The bead board and profiled elements shall have profiles that match the existing profiles. Staff encourages the Applicants to use wood siding and wood trim and repair the existing windows to exactly duplicate the original materials in composition as the Ordinance suggests. Significant architectural features are not being destroyed.
10. Foundations. *Not applicable*
11. Tuckpointing and Brick Repair. *Not applicable*
12. Storm Windows and Doors. The Applicants are not proposing the installation of new storm windows. Staff strongly suggests that the Living Room leaded glass windows be protected by exterior storms.

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness may be met and recommends approval by the Landmarks Commission with the following conditions of approval:

1. The Applicant shall document any original elements that are exposed under the aluminum siding.
2. The Applicants shall confirm if any found stucco areas would be insulated and then new stucco applied to bring the stucco to the same relationship with the new siding plane. The stucco plane, siding plane and related trim details shall maintain the historic projections and relationships.

3. The Applicants shall provide information to clarify the submission materials when describing the amount of window trim that will be replaced.
4. The Applicants shall confirm that the leaded glass windows in the Living Room will remain in place and be protected by fixed exterior storm panels.
5. The Applicants shall provide more information about the proportion of the divided lights in the top sash of the windows that currently do not have divisions. Staff is concerned that the proportion of the divided lights match the proportion of the other windows of similar size.
6. The Applicants shall confirm that the siding duplicates the texture, of the original siding with a smooth surface instead of a faux grained surface. The Applicants shall also confirm that the bead board and profiled elements shall have profiles that match the existing profiles.
7. The final details shall be reviewed and finalized with staff, and at her discretion, the Landmarks Commission.