

AGENDA # 9

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: May 23, 2007
TITLE: 1135 Erin Street – Amended PUD(GDP-SIP) for 40-Unit Cohousing Project. 13 th Ald. Dist. (03106)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: May 23, 2007	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Paul Wagner, Chair; Marsha Rummel, Lou Host-Jablonski, Todd Barnett, Bruce Woods, Michael Barrett and Richard Slayton.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of May 23, 2007, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL** of a PUD(GDP-SIP) located at 1135 Erin Street. Appearing on behalf of the project were Jim Glueck, Joe Hanauer, Cynthia Sampson and Janet Kelly. The modified plans featured the following:

- Relevant to the roof pitch and gable end treatment of both new structures; they are to remain the same in order to facilitate solar.
- On both the Orchard Street/Erin Street buildings, extra detailing has been added with brickwork, specifically vertical pier features with enhanced – gable end treatment with the additional windows.

Following the presentation the Commission noted the following:

- Relevant to the Orchard Street building south elevation, north façade appears bare; considered decorative brick work and landscaping in addition to windows in the garage to resolve.
- On the south elevations of the Erin Street building the balconies need brackets or a brick pier treatment.

ACTION:

On a motion by Woods, seconded by Slayton, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a vote of (4-2-1) with Host-Jablonski abstaining, and Barnett and Barrett voting no. The motion for final approval provided that issues relevant to the south elevation of the Orchard Street building’s blank façade be addressed as well as the issue with the provision of brackets or piers for the balconies on the south elevation of the Erin Street building.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 4, 6, 7, 7, 7/8 and 8.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 1135 Erin Street

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	-	7	-	-	-	-	7	7
	7	6	8	7	-	8	8	7/8
	7	8	6	-	-	7	8	8
	-	-	-	-	-	-	6	6
	4	4	5	5	-	8	4	4
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	7

General Comments:

- Excellent shape/forms in landscape. Great species selection but...why barberry?
- Very minimal design in a premium neighborhood. I would never have voted for the tearing down of old houses if I had know this...