



City of Madison

City of Madison
Madison, WI 53703
www.cityofmadison.com

Meeting Minutes - Approved LANDMARKS COMMISSION

Monday, October 14, 2019

5:00 PM

215 Martin Luther King, Jr. Blvd.
Room 153 (Madison Municipal Building)

CALL TO ORDER / ROLL CALL

Present: 4 - David W.J. McLean; Anna Andrzejewski; Richard B. Arnesen and Katherine N. Kaliszewski

Excused: 2 - Arvina Martin and Elizabeth Banks

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A motion was made by Arnesen, seconded by McLean, to Approve the September 16, 2019 Minutes. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

PUBLIC COMMENT

None

DISCLOSURES AND RECUSALS

Arnesen recused himself from item 4.

Kaliszewski recused herself from item 3 and the demolition review for 4918 Lake Mendota Drive under item 9. She disclosed that she works for the State Historic Preservation Office, which reviews nominations for the National Register; however, she is not in the department that completes those reviews so she is able to provide comments and vote on item 5.

The Chair amended the agenda to take Item 8 before Item 1.

A motion was made by McLean, seconded by Kaliszewski, to hear Item 1 after Item 5 because a project representative was not present. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

PUBLIC HEARING - REQUEST FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

1. [57547](#) 6 Lathrop St - Construction of a new garage structure in the University Heights Hist. Dist.; 5th Ald. Dist.
A motion was made by McLean, seconded by Arnesen, to Approve the request for the Certificate of Appropriateness with the conditions that siding, trim, pedestrian door, garage door, and window specifications be approved by staff. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

REQUEST FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

2. [57565](#) 4718 Monona Dr - Exterior Alteration to a Designated Madison Landmark (Nathaniel Dean House) - Rehabilitation of rear porch; 15th Ald. Dist.
Peter Rott, registering in support and available to answer questions
Ann Waidelich, registering in support and available to answer questions
Ray Krizmanic, registering in support and available to answer questions
Ron Bull, registering in support and not wishing to speak
Karen Goebel, registering in support and not wishing to speak
- A motion was made by Arnesen, seconded by Kaliszewski, to Approve the request for the Certificate of Appropriateness with the condition that the proposed doors include a vertical muntin over the screens. The motion passed by voice vote/other.**
3. [57655](#) 622 1/2 E Gorham St - Exterior Alteration to a Designated Madison Landmark (Bernard Hoover Boathouse) - Replacement of windows; 2nd Ald. Dist.
Amy Scanlon, registering in support and wishing to speak
- A motion was made by McLean, seconded by Arnesen, to Approve the request for the Certificate of Appropriateness with the condition that final window specifications be approved by staff. The motion passed by voice vote/other. Kaliszewski recused herself, so the Chair, Andrzejewski, voted.**

ADVISORY RECOMMENDATION

4. [57666](#) 216 S Pinckney St (Judge Doyle Square) - Alteration to Planned Development Zoning Adjacent to a Designated Madison Landmark (Madison Municipal Building); 4th Ald. Dist.
Helen Bradbury, registering in support and wishing to speak
Randy Bruce, registering in support and wishing to speak
Andy Laufenberg, registering in support and wishing to speak
Duane Johnson, registering in support and available to answer questions
- A motion was made by Kaliszewski, seconded by McLean, to advise the Plan Commission and Urban Design Commission that the proposed development is not so large or visually intrusive as to adversely affect the historic character and integrity of the adjoining landmark. The motion passed by voice vote/other. Arnesen recused himself, so the Chair, Andrzejewski, voted.**
5. [57678](#) Review of National Register Nomination for the King Street Arcade (107-113 King St and 115-117 S Pinckney St)
- By unanimous consent, the Landmarks Commission voted to support the nomination and authorize staff to write a letter of support.**

NEW BUSINESS

6. [57664](#) Review of Landmarks Commission Policy Document

A motion was made by McLean, seconded by Kaliszewski, to Refer the item to a future Landmarks Commission meeting. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

REGULAR BUSINESS

7. [47837](#) Landmarks Commission Historic Preservation Plan Status Report

Bailey said that at the October 3 Historic Preservation Plan Advisory Committee (HPPAC) meeting, committee members provided comments to staff and consultants for finalizing a draft of the plan. She explained that they currently have an 80% working draft, and hope to get to a 90% draft before the public meeting on November 20. She referred commissioners to the draft plan in Legistar and recommended they familiarize themselves with the plan because the Landmarks Commission is the body that will refer the plan to the Common Council. Arnesen asked if the HPPAC's final meeting is on December 18, and Bailey confirmed that it is. Bailey said that she anticipates the HPPAC signing off on the plan at that meeting and turning it over to the Landmarks Commission to review at their January 13 meeting. She said that they will give commissioners time to review it and then make decisions at the following Landmarks Commission meeting. Andrzejewski said that this is an ambitious schedule, and asked how commissioners felt about holding a special meeting in January to focus on the plan. Arnesen agreed that would be a good idea. Andrzejewski said that it is too important to try and squeeze it in to a regular meeting, and it was agreed that staff would send out a poll for a special meeting date.
8. [54301](#) Secretary's Report - 2019

Bailey discussed the key takeaways from the City Attorney's formal opinion on calculating a majority vote to pass a motion. She said that while the City Attorney recognizes that the role of the chair is to remain impartial, if there is a project that comes down to a close vote where an additional vote would change the outcome, the chair is required to vote. She explained that for quorum, it is a majority of the members of the body present. She said that the Landmarks Commission currently has a quorum of four people present, so the majority for an item to pass is three votes in the affirmative of the motion. She said that if one commission member recuses themselves, the majority vote stays the same and they still need three affirmative votes.
9. [54302](#) Buildings Proposed for Demolition - 2019

A motion was made by Andrzejewski, seconded by McLean, to recommend to the Plan Commission that the building at 4918 Lake Mendota Drive may have historic value, but the building itself is not historically, architecturally, or culturally significant; and the effigy mound makes the site historically and culturally significant. The motion passed by voice vote/other. Kaliszewski recused herself, so the Chair, Andrzejewski, voted.

A motion was made by McLean, seconded by Kaliszewski, to recommend to the Plan Commission that the building at 216 S Hamilton Street has historic value based on architectural significance, cultural significance, historic

significance, and as an intact or rare example of a certain architectural style or method of construction. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

A motion was made by McLean, seconded by Kaliszewski, to recommend to the Plan Commission that the building at 6225 University Avenue has historic value related to the vernacular context of Madison's built environment, but the building itself is not historically, architecturally, or culturally significant. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned by unanimous consent at 6:28 pm.