

TO: Personnel Board

FROM: Emaan Abdel-Halim, Human Resources

DATE: 18 April 2019

RE: Assistant Parking Utility Manager–Parking Division, Department of Transportation

The Director of Transportation, Mr. Tom Lynch, requested a position study of the Assistant Parking Utility Manager (position #1275) in CG 18, Range 17; currently occupied by Ms. Sabrina Tolley. This study request is a result of the recent creation of the City's Department of Transportation, and subsequent vacancy of the City Traffic Engineer/Parking Manager position, which for the past 12 years has served as the appointing authority for both Traffic Engineering and the Parking divisions. In 2018, the City hired a Director of Transportation who now has full managerial responsibility over Traffic Engineering, Parking and Metro Transit.<sup>1</sup> With this shift in organizational structure, this position study will evaluate the Assistant Parking Utility Manager classification and position to determine proper placement within the classification and compensation plans. It is recommended that the position be retitled to Parking Division Manager in the same CG and Range, but no change to the range for the reasons outlined in this memo. This determination is not based on the quality of work performed by the incumbent, but rather on an analysis of this position and other comparable positions outlined in this memo and in accordance with the factors outlined in the City Personnel Rules.

Prior to approximately 2006, the Parking Utility was an independent division with a CG21 department head overseeing operations. However, in 2006, as noted above, the City Traffic Engineer assumed management of the Parking Utility. While the two divisions work closely on certain issues, the mission of each division is different and the management skills and duties warrant separate managers. Traffic Engineering has primary responsibility for designing traffic flow, traffic signals, and road signage, for both vehicular, bicycle, and pedestrian traffic. The Parking Utility, on the other hand, is primarily responsible for operating the City's parking garages and on-road parking programs. The 2018 ordinance creating the Department of Transportation listed three divisions under its oversight, including the Parking Division. Part of the revisions reflect a change from the term "utility" to the "Parking Division." The Parking Division is not a true utility in that while it charges rates for parking, there isn't oversight from a state agency like the Public Service Commission. As such, it is more appropriate to name the agency the Parking Division.

In 2015, the classification of Assistant Parking Utility Manager was created in CG18, R17, to oversee operations of the Parking Utility, and Ms. Sabrina Tolley promoted into this position through a training program in 2016. Between 2006 and 2015, the highest manager in the Parking Utility was the Parking Operations Manager, in CG18, Range 15. However, as outlined in the 2015 study, the Operations Manager position was increased to an Assistant Parking Utility Manager based on the position taking on greater independent responsibility for the operations of the Parking Utility. Upon interviewing both Mr. Lynch and the incumbent, they both indicated

---

<sup>1</sup> Each agency still maintains an appointing authority—the City Traffic Engineer in Traffic Engineering (no longer with responsibility for Parking), the Transit General Manager at Metro, and the position being studied in this memo.

limited changes to specific job duties since the 2015 study, and Mr. Lynch defers to Ms. Tolley as the full decision making authority for the Parking Division's staffing, finances, budget, and policies.

First, a review of the classification specification for the Assistant Parking Utility Manager, which defines the work as:

**...highly responsible professional and managerial work in supervising, planning, directing, coordinating and implementing the finances, programs, operations, and administration of the Parking Utility.** The Parking Utility is **primarily responsible** for city-wide public on-street and off-street parking programs, including the **operation, maintenance and building of Parking Utility-owned parking facilities.** This position assists the [Director of Transportation] in **policy development** in conformance with the City's objectives and related Land Use and Transportation planning processes and **recommends and implements related processes and procedures.** Work is characterized by **independence of action in a broad range of assignments.** This position will act on behalf of the [Director of Transportation] during absences and/or as specifically delegated in order to provide for continuity of services. [emphasis added]

It is now appropriate to retitle this position Parking Division Manager to reflect the ongoing managerial responsibility of this position, but also the renaming of the Parking Utility to Parking Division. The Parking Division Manager will now report to the Director of Transportation, but has continued responsibility for developing the operating and capital budgets for the Parking Division, for serving as the agency appointing authority, and for managing day-to-day operations of the Division.

As part of the 2015 position study, the comparable identified classification with similar budgetary, supervisory and programmatic authority was the Housing Operations Program Manager, in CG18, R17. Both classifications have operating and capital budget oversight and authority, supervise similar levels of professional positions, and report to a department/division head. This comparable remains appropriate. However, in this study I also reviewed this position against the classification of Budget and Program Evaluation Manager in Finance, in CG18, R17.

A review of that classification specification describes the work as:

**... highly responsible professional, administrative, and managerial work directing the budget and program evaluation functions of the City Finance Department.** The work focuses on **overseeing the development, coordination and implementation of the City's annual operating and capital budget process;** supervising program evaluations and serving as secretary to the [Finance Committee]. Under the **general direction of the City Finance Director,** this position requires **considerable professional expertise, independent judgment and discretion** in the achievement of program objectives. [emphasis added]

This position serves as the budget manager for the City, with oversight of both capital and operating budget processes for over 26 agencies, and reports to the Finance Director. With a high level of discretion and independent decision-making authority, the Budget and Program Evaluation Manager's decisional impact has a dramatic influence on City operations across the agencies, as a whole. This position works directly with the Mayor's office in allocating over \$600 million in capital and operating funds for all City agencies. While the Parking Manager's decision-making authority has direct impact on the revenue generating function of the Parking Division,

the scope of these decisions has substantially less impact on other city agencies and their operations, and is significantly smaller in overall dollars. Again, both positions have a high degree of authority serving as the program manager within their respective work units and report to a department/division head. The fact that the Parking Division is significantly larger in terms of staff, working at multiple locations throughout the City, and that the Parking Manager has overall appointing authority responsibility offsets the difference in decisional impact and makes placement of both positions in the same range appropriate.

As a follow up to my interview with Ms. Tolley, she provided me the 1984 study for the Parking Utility reorganization under the last Director of Transportation for the City. While this memo placed the classification of Parking Manager in CG 21, Range 18, it would not be appropriate to assume a similar placement at this level as comparisons to the old organizational structure does not take into account how the comparable positions in that study have changed over the last 35 years. However, it is appropriate to reconsider whether this position should be placed in CG21. As noted above, prior to 2006, the Parking Manager was a CG21 position, reported directly to the Mayor, and worked under an employment contract. To note, the ranges in CG18 and CG21 are parallel, meaning that a CG18, R17 is equivalent to a CG21, R17. While the starting salary in both ranges is the same, the spread of the CG21 range is wider to account for the fact that those positions are not eligible for longevity. Therefore, it is appropriate to also compare the Parking Division Manager to the Fleet Service Superintendent and the City Assessor, both in CG 21, Range 17.

The Fleet Services Superintendent has a large staff with higher technical skills than Parking, but similar to Parking, they work dispersed across the City. Fleet Services manages, maintains, and repairs a wide variety of vehicles and equipment for many city agencies, which can directly affect those agencies' operations. For instance, if vehicles are out of service when a major snow storm hits, plowing operations for the City would be impacted and the public will be affected. Because of the wide variety of vehicles, including traditional, diesel, hybrid, and electric, the technical knowledge required at Fleet is greater than that required within the Parking Utility. This is reflected in the fact that the Fleet Technicians, in CG15, R8, are higher than almost all the field positions at Parking in CG16, as this is comparable to a CG16, R13 position. The highest field position at Parking is the Maintenance Electrician in CG16, R16. Otherwise, the field positions at Parking are Range 13 (1 position) or below. As an enterprise agency, the Parking Division Manager has greater budgetary responsibility in setting parking rates and ensuring that the Division makes enough money, but similar to the above, these factors offset and make comparison appropriate.

Additionally while the City Assessor has a smaller staff, these positions have a high level of responsibility in determining property values for the City. The Property Appraisers, while in CG16, are professional staff, and with ranges between CG16, R15 and R21, significantly higher than almost all positions in the Parking Utility. Furthermore, with responsibility for properly assessing the value of property in the City, the City Assessor has greater decisional impact on the tax revenues and ultimately on the City's overall budget. Again, the differences in the two positions offset one another and make for placement in the same range appropriate.

Lastly, the department heads in CG 21, R18 include the Civil Rights Director, Street Superintendent, and many of the Division heads for the Department of Planning, Economic, and

Community Development. When comparing these positions with the Parking Division Manager, we find the staffing levels in these agencies have a larger number of professional level staff, including high-level managers in CG18, R15; and in the Streets Division with a high number of technical staff. While the Parking Division's has a large staff, most of these positions are predominately parking cashiers in CG16, R2; with the highest level professional position of Engineer 4 in CG18, R12, and the Parking Operations Supervisor in CG18, R8. Therefore, should it be determined that the Parking Division Manager be placed in CG 21, it would be most appropriate for the position to be in Range 17.

Position	CG/Range	Responsibility
Housing Operations Program Manager	CG18, R17	Comparable
Budget and Program Evaluation Manager	CG18, R17	Comparable
Fleet Services Superintendent	CG21, R17	Comparable
City Assessor	CG21, R17	Comparable
Streets Division Superintendent	CG21, R18	Not Comparable (More technical staff)
Civil Rights Director	CG21, R18	Not Comparable (More professional staff)

Based on a review of all the aforementioned positions, as well as the analysis from the 2015 study, this position continues to be appropriately placed in CG18, R17, similar to the positions described in this memo. Again, it is worth noting that it is at the Mayor's discretion to create this position as a CG21 department/division head. That is not the case at this time, which is why continued placement in CG18 is appropriate. Finally, it is important to reiterate that this conclusion is not a reflection of the quality of work performed by Ms. Tolley. Rather, it is evident that Ms. Tolley performs high-quality work that is truly appreciated by Mr. Lynch and the City. However, the determination is based on the various factors outlined in the Personnel Rules and more fully described herein.

The necessary resolution to implement the title change recommendation has been drafted.

cc: Tom Lynch—Director of Transportation  
Sabrina Tolley—Assistant Parking Utility Manager