



Project Name/Address: 412-414 S Baldwin Street

Application Type: PUBLIC HEARING Certificate of Appropriateness for construction of an addition and Certificate of Appropriateness for land division in the Third Lake Ridge historic district

Legistar File ID # [42148](#)

Prepared By: Amy L. Scanlon, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

Date Prepared: March 23, 2016

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: James Montgomery

Requested Action/Proposal Summary: The Applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for construction of an addition over 100 square feet and a Certificate of Appropriateness for land division in the Third Lake Ridge historic district.

Background Information

Parcel Location: The subject site is located in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District

Relevant Landmarks Ordinance Sections:

- 41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.** A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.
- (1) New construction or exterior alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) N/A
 - (b) N/A
 - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
 - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources.
 - (4) Land Divisions and Combinations. The commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for land divisions, combinations, and subdivision plats of landmark sites and properties in historic districts, unless it finds that the proposed lot sizes adversely impact the historic character or significance of a landmark, are incompatible with adjacent lot sizes, or fail to maintain the general lot size pattern of the historic district.

41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE

- (6) Standards for New Structures in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Mixed-Use and Commercial Use. Any new structures on parcels zoned for mixed-use and commercial use that are located within 200 feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
 - (a) Gross Volume
 - (b) Height
 - (c) The proportion and rhythm of solids to voids in the street facade(s)
 - (d) The materials used in the street facade(s)
 - (e) The design of the roof
 - (f) The rhythm of buildings masses and spaces
- (7) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Mixed-Use and Commercial Use.
 - (1) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned for mixed-use and commercial use that are located within 200 feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
 - (a) Height
 - (2) Alterations of street façade(s) shall retain the original or existing historical proportion and rhythm of solids to voids
 - (3) Alterations of street facade(s) shall retain the original or existing historical materials.
 - (4) Alterations of roof shall retain its existing historical appearance.

Analysis and Conclusion

The proposed project includes the exterior alteration of the existing building with the construction of a large addition and the land combination of two lots into one. The applicant is planning exterior alterations for the existing building at 412 S Baldwin as a second phase and those alterations are not part of this request.

One of the lots is zoned TR-C4 (Traditional Residential) and the other lot is zoned TSS (Traditional Shopping Street). The construction of the addition will require that the existing property line between the two properties be removed and that the zoning be changed to TSS for the entire site. Because the addition is larger than the existing building, it generally reads as a separate building, and minimally touches the existing building, the proposed addition is being reviewed as new construction. The Ordinance defines construction as “the erection of any new structure or the alteration of any existing structure.” The standards for the construction of new structures in mixed use and commercial areas (41.23(6)) will be used to review the southeastern building mass. The standards for exterior alteration (41.23(7)) will be used to review the existing building and stair tower alterations.

The Visual Compatibility map is attached to this report.

A discussion of the land division and combination standards 41.18(4) follows:

The proposed lot size is larger than the adjacent residential lot sizes, but consistent with adjacent commercial lot sizes. The proposed lot size will maintain the general lot size pattern of the historic district.

A discussion of the construction of new structures standards 41.23(6) follows:

- (a) The proposed building has a gross volume that is visually compatible with the gross volume of other buildings in the area. The new building is attached to the existing building, but the buildings read as two separate buildings. Their combined gross volume is also visually compatible with the gross volume of other buildings in the area.

- (b) The proposed building has a height that is visually compatible with the height of other buildings in the area.
- (c) The proportion and rhythm of solids to voids in the street facade(s) of the proposed building is compatible with other buildings in the area.
- (d) The proposed building will have brick as the primary wall material on the street façade. The brick will return on the side elevations and then change to siding. The use of brick on the street façade is visually compatible with other buildings in the area. The storefront system on the street façade should die into a solid paneled area at grade.
- (e) The proposed building has a flat roof which is compatible with other buildings in the area.
- (f) The proposed building exhibits a rhythm of building masses and spaces that is compatible with other buildings in the area. The space between the two buildings allows them to generally read as separate building masses with appropriate related spaces.

The overall form and general architectural treatment of the proposed building is typical of circa 1900 commercial structures in the area.

A discussion of the exterior alteration standards 41.23(7) follows:

- (1) The extension of the existing stair tower height to allow access to the third floor and the roof level of the proposed new building is taller than the existing building and the proposed new building, but is compatible with the buildings in the area and on the site.
- (2) The proposed alteration of the street façade(s) which is the extension of the height of the stair tower will alter the size of one existing window and create more upper wall surface. The existing proportion and rhythm of solids to voids is largely being retained. There are not alterations being proposed for the main building at this time.
- (3) The proposed alteration of the street façade(s) which is the extension of the height of the stair tower will retain the existing materials. The proposed alteration will continue the use of the existing siding. There are not alterations being proposed for the main building at this time.
- (4) The existing main building roof is not being altered with this proposal and will retain its existing historical appearance; however, the proposed alteration of the street façade(s) which is the extension of the height of the stair tower will alter the roof in the area of the stair tower. The stair tower is set back from the main street façade and reads as a later addition to the existing building.

Recommendation

Staff believes the standards for granting the Certificate of Appropriateness for the land division are met and recommends that the Landmarks Commission approve the request as submitted.

Staff believes the standards for granting the Certificate of Appropriateness for the exterior alteration are met and recommends that the Landmarks Commission approve the request as submitted.

Staff believes the standards for granting the Certificate of Appropriateness for the new construction are met and recommends that the Landmarks Commission approve the request with the following conditions of approval:

- 1. Storefront shall die into solid panel at grade.
- 2. The Applicant shall provide material samples for review.
- 3. The Applicant shall describe the stone cornice note on the first level front elevation.