



**Project Name & Address:** 505 S Dickinson Street

**Application Type(s):** Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District

**Legistar File ID #** [62823](#)

**Prepared By:** Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

**Date Prepared:** November 10, 2020

## Summary

**Project Applicant/Contact:** Scott Doughman, Home Depot

**Requested Action:** The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the replacement of 17 windows.

## Background Information

**Parcel Location/Information:** The subject site is located in the Third Lake Ridge Local Historic District.

### Relevant State Statute Section:

**Wisc SS 62.23(7)(em)2m.** In the repair or replacement of a property that is designated as a historic landmark or included within a historic district or neighborhood conservation district under this paragraph, a city shall allow an owner to use materials that are similar in design, color, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities.

### Relevant Ordinance Sections:

- 41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.** A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.
- (1) New construction or exterior alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
    - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.
    - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.
    - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
    - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City’s historic resources.

**41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.**

- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.
- (a) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned residential use that are located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
    - 1. Height.
    - 2. Landscape treatment.
    - 3. Rhythm of mass and spaces.
  - (b) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical proportion and rhythm of solids to voids.
  - (c) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical materials.
  - (d) Alterations of the roof of any existing structure shall retain its existing historical appearance.
  - (e) Alterations of the street facade(s) shall retain the original or existing historical proportional relationships of door sizes to window sizes.

## Analysis and Conclusion

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace 17 windows. The applicant provided a 3<sup>rd</sup> party assessment on the condition of the windows with the recommendation that they all be replaced. The proposed replacements appear to closely replicate the existing windows.

However, the assessment of the existing windows appears cursory at best. Staff provided the application and assessment to the preservation architect who reviews preservation tax credit applications with the Wisconsin Historical Society and her conclusion was that these windows appear repairable and the request would not meet their standards for replacement. Staff concurs with this assessment. Most of the windows appear in need to maintenance (removing paint to allow for window operation, reattaching window weights, repair of windows that are out of square, and splicing or consolidating deteriorated portions of sashes). Staff has included the memo from the City Attorney's Office citing that removal of historic windows that can be repaired would "frustrate the public interest in protecting, promoting, and conserving the City's historic resources." Staff is also including information on the energy efficiency and sustainability of historic windows when they are properly maintained.

A discussion of the relevant ordinance sections follows:

**41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.** A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.

- (1) New construction or exterior alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
  - (a) N/A
  - (b) N/A
  - (c) The proposal would need to meet the standards of the Third Lake Ridge Historic District.
  - (d) As stated in the City Attorney's Office memo, replacing repairable historic windows would frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance.

**41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.**

- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.
- (a) N/A
  - (b) No changes in the rhythm of solids and voids
  - (c) This proposal would unnecessarily remove historic or original materials from the street façade, which does not comply with this standard.
  - (d) N/A
  - (e) The sizes of the window components for the replacements are slightly different, but the differences in dimensions should be minimally noticeable.

**Recommendation**

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness are not met and recommends that the Landmarks Commission deny the proposed application and recommend that the property owner repair and maintain the existing historic windows.