



Project Name/Address: 710 Orton Court
Application Type: Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alteration
Legistar File ID # [42423](#)
Prepared By: Amy L. Scanlon, Preservation Planner, Planning Division
Date Prepared: May 10, 2016

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Andrew Rubsam
Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations in the Third Lake Ridge historic district.

Background Information

Parcel Location: The subject site is located in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District.

Relevant Landmarks Ordinance Section:

41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.
- 1) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned residential use that are located within 200 feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
 - (a) Height
 - (b) Landscape treatment
 - (c) Rhythm of mass and spaces
 - 2) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical proportion and rhythm of solids to voids.
 - 3) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical materials.
 - 4) Alterations of the roof of any existing structure shall retain its existing historical appearance.
 - 5) Alterations of the street facade(s) shall retain the original or existing historical proportional relationships of door sizes to window sizes.

Analysis and Conclusion

The Applicant originally asked about installing a column on the opposite side of the steps to assist in the deflection of the beam and to wrap architectural elements in aluminum to encapsulate lead paint. Staff explained that the wide beam span at the front porch and curved beam ends were indicative of the architectural style and the addition of a column would not be appropriate. The Applicant submitted materials related to the repair of the porch beam and for wrapping architectural elements. At that time, staff believed these items could be administratively approved. In continued conversations with the Applicant it has become apparent that the project should be formally reviewed by the Landmarks Commission.

Staff understands that the following items may be part of the proposed project:

- Repair the porch roof sag.
- Repair general porch sag on right side.
- Cover all columns, top of railing, curved porch beam and porch ceiling with aluminum.
- Paint small curved beam elements.
- Remove porch decking, front steps and stair knee walls.
- Replace porch decking and stair treads with composite material.
- Install railings on both sides of stair.
- Knee walls are not proposed to be replaced.

A brief discussion of the standards of 41.23 (9) follows:

1. N/A
2. N/A
3. The proposed alterations of the street façade will affect the existing historical materials.
 - Wrapping the arched beam in aluminum will require joints to accommodate the curved ends and/or the curves will become segmented. Staff asked the Applicant if the curved beam could be painted like the smaller side beam elements.
 - Removing the knee wall elements from the front stairs will alter the appearance. The side walls are a characteristic of the style and should not be removed in their entirety. The knee walls should be repaired or replaced as part of the stair replacement.
 - A simple railing can be added to both sides of the stair in a manner that will not detract from the architectural style. The reuse of the existing iron railing may be appropriate and it could be installed closer to the side wall.
 - The removal of the existing wood porch floor and replacement with composite material may be appropriate if the decking material is run in the direction of the existing material.
 - Covering the existing porch ceiling beadboard (to encapsulate lead paint) with unvented soffit material with a 2" joint spacing to replicate the appearance of the existing beadboard may be appropriate.
4. N/A
5. N/A

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the alterations may be met and recommends that the Landmarks Commission approve the request with the following conditions of approval:

1. The Applicant shall describe the appearance of the proposed stair railing(s) for Landmarks Commission review.
2. The Applicant shall confirm that the arched beam retains a curve and is not segmented.
3. The stair knee walls shall be repaired/replaced in kind.
4. The new porch flooring shall be installed to match the direction of the existing flooring.