

AGENDA # 1

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION

PRESENTED: July 11, 2018

TITLE: 2430 Frazier Avenue – New Development
of a “Starion Bank” Located in UDD No.
1. 14th Ald. Dist. (51097)

REFERRED:

REREFERRED:

REPORTED BACK:

AUTHOR: Janine Glaeser, Secretary

ADOPTED:

POF:

DATED: July 11, 2018

ID NUMBER:

Members present: Richard Wagner, Chair; Lois Braun-Oddo, Rafeeq Asad, Tom DeChant, Amanda Hall, Cliff Goodhart and Christian Harper.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of July 11, 2018, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL** of new development of a “Starion Bank” located at 2430 Frazier Avenue in UDD No. 1. Registered in support of the project were Robert Feller and Curt Walth, both representing Starion Bank. Registered and speaking in opposition were Watong Vang and Matt Vang. Ald. Carter sent an email with her comments, noting a neighborhood meeting was held on June 25th and the attendees and development team engaged in a robust discussion on design. There is support for the new location of the bank from the neighborhood and constituents. She is yielding to the Commission and their expertise on the materials.

Feller presented updates and changes to the plans, including reduction of pavement, a change from two-way traffic to one-way traffic and reduced the parking by one spot. The location of the building on the site is driven by Engineering requesting a queuing zone while providing safety to pedestrians, and there is an easement that requires the building to be setback further on the site. The entrance has been moved closer to the front, which the rendering reflects. A palette of materials was presented.

Comments and questions from the Commission were as follows:

- I think we recommended last time that the number of materials seemed like a lot for a little building. I appreciate you have made efforts to simplify that. I wonder if the building would be better off as just all brick. It’s such a small building and there’s plenty of great buildings that really only use one material predominantly. If the exit door that faces the street were painted to match the brick would be much less obvious. My biggest criticism is that this whole upper entrance is spandrel glass, and when I look at the plans I see nothing behind there or the large columns, they’re just hollow. The room on the second floor is nothing but just inaccessible space.
 - The intention is that it’s not spandrel glass, but a clerestory to get more light further into the vestibule space. It’s a 1 ½ story vestibule.
- It looks like by the time the doors are opened up there’s no place for that light to go.

- We're looking to get some presence at the entry and due to the size of the site there's no room for us to pull this even further toward the building. We're working with the constraints of the site. The intention is clear story and the light will come in and bring light into that lobby space.
- You have this high ledge that's going to just collect a lot of stuff.
 - Architecturally we feel it adds some robustness to the front elevation.
- If that were to go down you would have the opportunity for windows on the second floor.
- I saw this nice strong brick archway here that really doesn't need this glass top that aligns with this change in materials here that could really be a strong presence and even stronger because it has better proportions without this glass element. You're going to have all kinds of problems with water sloping back on the building. It adds again to the needless complexity of the design when it could be simpler and stronger with fewer materials and a simple entry portal.
 - We had 6 types of building materials and we are now down to 4. We have reduced it a significant amount.
- Looking at the Nichiha, there's a little chip in it and didn't make me think it's the most durable material.
 - That's from cutting the material. It's very durable.
- I like the number of materials, but I think it stands out, it's dynamic. I really still like the stone along the bottom, if you do end up going down to three I recommend keeping that piece of it. I echo the flat piece comment, we don't have flat roofs in Wisconsin.
- I agree that there are still too many materials. The stone isn't doing much for the building as far as layers. I noticed these columns that are holding up the roof over the entry are not on the landscape plan, and in the rendering they're shown in the middle of a piece of grass. Is there a way to just cantilever that to simplify the design?
 - The ability to cantilever is definitely there. We thought that created more of a presence for the entrance.
- If you choose to keep them I'd put them in pavement, not in the middle of your planting bed. I would rather see another band of glass before the second floor and have a stronger horizontal that aligns with the first floor space.
 - We were looking for more warmth into the lobby, similar to what we did in Sun Prairie.
- Is there a way to bring that down? The first level doesn't seem to be relating very well to the rest of the building because you're stepping up three times. It feels like you're stepping all over the place. It's a missed opportunity for the second floor to get more light in there.
- If you eliminate the stone would you keep the line below the windows, I rather like that.
- You could just do sills.
- Noting on the landscape plan, I see on the side of the property that is adjacent to the houses you have an 8-foot vinyl screening fence. The other side that abuts Kwik Trip there, I'm wondering about adjacent to the drive-thru you have these prairie plug plantings. What actually separates the property on that side from the Kwik Trip property? It doesn't look like more than a 2-foot wide strip and I wonder about the reality of plantings in that area.
 - The choice to go to prairie seeding is a direction that Starion follows with many of their properties. We're looking for low impact landscaping on the site for more natural feel and less maintenance. But they do follow a strict maintenance program and have a real sense of pride with their sites and buildings. The native feel is part of our organization. As far as what's there with Kwik Trip, they have some plants and mulch adjacent to this property.

Public comment was as follows:

Mr. Vang shared concerns as his dad owns the house adjacent to the property. They oppose the project due to noise, traffic, pedestrian connections and safety. Crime rates are increasing in Madison and with that being a

bank they are concerned about safety. The front door of the establishment points straight to his house. There's a tree line that blocks them from the Kwik Trip, but once those are cut down there will be no screening.

- (Braun-Oddo) Is this the side where the 8-foot fence is? That won't be adequate screening?
 - No.
- All the trees go?
 - (Applicant) Yes. And 6-foot is the requirement so we are going higher than what's required.
- (Goodhart) The proposed fence is vinyl, is that maintenance free?
 - (Applicant) Maintenance free, solid, vertical panels.
- (Goodhart) Have you consulted with them on the design of the fence?
 - (Applicant) That was all presented at the neighborhood meeting.
 - (Mr. Vang) We didn't get notification of any meeting. Just saw the signs posted. We would prefer the establishment not be built here.
- (Braun-Oddo) What are the business hours?
 - 8-5 Monday through Friday. We're not open on Saturdays, and there will be a 24-hour drive-up ATM.
 - Any service window has to be 60-feet away from residential property. We've minimized the amount of traffic flowing around. Pedestrian traffic should be safe. From what we heard at the neighborhood meeting there is potential of illegal activity occurring within the area, especially on the property. We think this is an improvement. Ald. Carter did request that we meet with the neighborhood following review and discuss the possibility of lighting could be kept on 24 hours and possibly spill over to protect the neighborhood. They've asked us to include Kwik Trip in that meeting.
- Please make sure you're using LED. Kwik Trip has really well designed lighting.
- I agree that going from 6 to 4 is not decreasing the materials enough. It's too small to be all brick, maybe two materials at most. If you can keep the window but bring the roofline down at the entry, because it's so small it looks like it's doing too much with these canopies or sun screens. The light situation, if you have a residential neighborhood and you leave these lights on, how does that affect their quality of life? Having the lights on all day is wasteful.
 - They wouldn't be on all day. We normally turn them off at 11:00 p.m. and come on at 5-6:00 a.m. They won't be on when there's daylight. And we would honor that they don't cross onto residential property.
- This is a rezoning? So you have to go to the Plan Commission. I would suggest to the neighbors who testified here that that's the best place for you to issue your concerns about the appropriateness of putting a bank here. We're primarily dealing with design here.
 - Can we get clarification on the materials?
- In a building this size metal panel, brick and glass could be successful. We weren't really talking about colors as much as number of materials.
 - If we went with brick and stayed with Nichiha, that would be acceptable?
- If that brick wrapped all the way around where you have the wings under dark metal panel it would tie the whole thing together.

ACTION:

On a motion by Goodhart, seconded by Braun-Oddo, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL**. The motion passed on a vote of (6-0).

Conditions for Initial Approval:

- Simplification of materials:
 - Recommend going with 2 or 3 materials, remove stone and stick with brick and metal panel;
 - Simplify layers. Too much going on: Many different canopies and window sunshades, multiple step up elements at the corner.
- Adjustment of entry portal and columns (see notes below):
 - Consider refining the entry – adjust/remove clerestory and expand second floor windows.
 - Consider removing the entry canopy columns, cantilever?
- Landscaping updates that reflect changes above.