

AGENDA # 6

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: August 5, 2009
TITLE: 2 South Bedford Street – PUD(GDP-SIP), Mixed-Use Development. 4 th Ald. Dist. (13295)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: August 5, 2009	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Bruce Woods, Richard Wagner, John Harrington, Marsha Rummel, Dawn Weber, Richard Slayton, Todd Barnett, Jay Ferm, Ron Luskin and Mark Smith.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of August 5, 2009, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL** of a PUD(GDP-SIP) located at 2 South Bedford Street. Appearing on behalf of the project were J. Randy Bruce and Abbie Moilien, both representing Jim Meier-Badger Bus. As an introduction to the item staff apprised the Commission of a memo from Timothy M. Parks, Planner, Planning Division stating the provisions apply that the Plan Commission/Common Council relevant to the building's architecture and balconies. The memo details that the Urban Design Commission consider a redesign of balconies proposed along South Bedford Street and West Washington Avenue façades of the 5-story mixed-use building. Planning staff did not feel that the balconies were well integrated with the architecture of the 5-story building. Staff recommended that the front of the balcony openings be pulled back to align with the rest of the building walls and that the horizontal banding of the walls be preserved along the front of the balconies and the railing details be visited and that more detail on the fascia of the balconies be provided. Staff noted to the Commission that this request allows the Commission to review the requested modifications against the project as originally approved and determine appropriate resolution of the issue. Bruce followed with a detailed review of the previously approved building elevations against those modified to address the balcony issue. Bruce also provided a detailed review of landscaping modifications along Bedford Street, including reduced and varied ground cover, the addition of trees along the adjacent property line with an adjoining warehouse at the neighbor owners request, the addition of green roofs on Buildings #2 and #3, along with additional planting areas on the parking lot side of the proposed buildings adjacent to the property's Bedford Street frontage. The use of LED fixtures on poles provided with the project was noted. Following the presentation the Commission noted the following:

- Request more tree plantings in the West Washington Avenue right-of-way in coordination with the Parks Division.
- Use 16-foot stalls along the adjacent building to provide for additional landscape space adjoining the buildings as proposed.
- Relevant to the balcony issue, with the 5-story on West Washington Avenue continue pre-cast band on first story level with balcony faces not projected beyond building edge.
- Don't like losing some balconies on the 5th floor level provided with the modified proposal, including a reduction in width from 6-feet to 5-feet.

- Concern with induction in balcony width.
- Increase bike parking in groups from 4 to 6 stalls.
- Convert some interior bike stalls to scooter and add hangers adjacent to parking stalls as an option.
- Find outdoor areas to provide for scooter parking.
- Pull balconies out to 6-feet and provide a 1-foot return on brick on balcony returns.
- Make arched upper windows all glass with no brick divider but keep the horizontal mullion and double hung features.
- Prefer a variety of previous balcony treatments.

ACTION:

On a motion by Smith, seconded by Slayton, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a vote of (9-1) with Luskin voting no. The motion provides for 6-foot balconies with the original design with vertical breaks and no horizontal bands between the fourth and fifth stories, and the following:

- The signage package is to return.
- There should be no window signage applications or overlays.
- An option is provided to eliminate the brick divider between oval windows on the fourth floor level of Building #2.
- Utilize compact parking stalls within the stalls adjacent to the warehouse building.
- Increase bike groupings from 4 to 6 stalls.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 6, 7, 7, 7, 8, 8 and 8.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 2 South Bedford Street

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	7	7.5	6	-	-	6	8	7
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	7
	5	7	6	-	-	5	7	7
	-	6	4	5	-	2	6	-
	5	7	5	-	-	5	6	6
	7	8	6	6	-	6	8	8
	7	8	6	-	-	6	8	8
	9	9	7	6	-	8	9	8

General Comments:

- I would like to see 6’ deep balconies on 5-story. Balconies should be protruding elements!
- Nice job – great building.
- Very attractive project, architecturally interesting. 6’ balconies better than 5’ balconies. Clear glass only for commercial first floor corner building.
- Good neighborhood fit. Great architecture.
- Terrific.