



Agenda Item #: 5
Project Title: Buildings Proposed for Demolition - 2024
Legistar File ID #: 81161
Prepared By: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner
Members: Present: Richard Arnesen, Edna Ely-Ledesma, Molly Harris, Katie Kaliszewski, and Maurice Taylor
Excused: Ald. Amani Latimer Burris and Jacob Morrison

Summary

John Rolling, registering neither in support nor in opposition and not wishing to speak

Bailey said that staff recommended a finding of no known historic value for the building at 3441 Burke Avenue.

Arnesen recused himself from the review of the W Mifflin Street properties and did not participate in the discussion or vote.

For the buildings at 423 W Mifflin Street and 425 W Mifflin Street, Bailey said that staff recommended a finding of historic value related to the vernacular context of Madison's built environment, but the buildings themselves are not historically, architecturally, or culturally significant.

Harris said that there may be enough of these buildings now, but as they go away, there will eventually be one left. She said the last one would get saved rather than this one just because it is the only one that is left, not because it is any better than this building. Bailey said that the Mifflandia Plan, which covers this area, went through a public planning process and looked for areas to preserve or redevelop, and this was one of the areas highlighted for redevelopment. She said that while it is sad to see these buildings go, there are other examples of these buildings in the Third Lake Ridge historic district that are preserving some of that story of workforce housing, as well as the architectural style. She said there is currently no movement to create a historic district in the Mifflin area. Harris said that most of the population in the Mifflin area are students who may not have the same investment in the preservation of their neighborhood. Harris said she could be comfortable making a finding of demolition criterion "b."

Ely-Ledesma said that it is challenging to see the stark jump from what is considered demolition criterion "c" in the context of historic value, cultural significance, and architectural significance. She said the historic significance would be of that place, of that neighborhood, where this is the anchor or architectural type that defined the area. She said that she would vote no for "b" because this needs to be flagged.

Kaliszewski said she would vote for criterion "b," but she agreed with Ely-Ledesma's comments. She said that it is understandable why we are choosing to move forward with demolishing these buildings, but eventually we will hit the point where we are changing the way this part of the city feels by taking away buildings that are considered "b."

For the building at 427 W Mifflin Street, Bailey said that staff recommended a finding of historic value as the work of noted Madison architect Ferdinand Kronenberg and as an intact example of English Revival-style Missing Middle housing in 1920s Madison.

Kaliszewski said that the applicant's proposal to call the new building the Kronenberg and put up an exhibit is not enough. She said they could move the building. As an example, she mentioned the historic farmhouse on the west side

that was moved and kept as the office of an apartment building, though she acknowledged this might not work downtown. She said this was a “c.”

Action

A motion was made by Arnesen, seconded by Ely-Ledesma, to recommend to the Plan Commission that the building at 3441 Burke Avenue has no known historic value. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

A motion was made by Harris, seconded by Taylor, to recommend to the Plan Commission that the buildings at 423 W Mifflin Street and 425 W Mifflin Street have historic value related to the vernacular context of Madison’s built environment, but the buildings themselves are not historically, architecturally, or culturally significant. The motion passed by voice vote/other, with Ely-Ledesma voting no. Arnesen recused himself.

A motion was made by Ely-Ledesma, seconded by Harris, to recommend to the Plan Commission that the building at 427 W Mifflin Street has historic value as the work of noted Madison architect Ferdinand Kronenberg and as an intact example of English Revival-style Missing Middle housing in 1920s Madison. The motion passed by voice vote/other. Arnesen recused himself.