

AGENDA # 4

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: LANDMARKS COMMISSION

PRESENTED: 6/17/19

TITLE: 939 Jenifer St - Exterior Alteration in the
Third Lake Ridge Hist. Dist. -
Construction of deck; 6th Ald. Dist.

REFERRED:

REREFERRED:

REPORTED BACK:

AUTHOR: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner

ADOPTED:

POF:

DATED: 6/25/19

ID NUMBER: 56055

Members present were: Stuart Levitan, Richard Arnesen, Katie Kaliszewski, Arvina Martin, and David McLean. Excused was Anna Andrzejewski.

SUMMARY:

Michael Torrence, registering in support and available to answer questions

Bailey said that the applicant would like to construct an open deck in the side yard using Trex decking material. She showed photos of the existing site conditions, which is a picnic area that is located behind a vegetative screen. She pointed out other houses within 200 feet where there are side yard seating areas. She said that the standards may be met with the condition that they use wood or a wood substitute without a false texturized wood grain. She pointed out that the state statute allows materials that are a compatible substitute to current historic materials, and suggested the Commission discuss what types of materials they are willing to approve in place of wood.

Levitan asked Torrence if he had an opinion on the wood grain as mentioned in staff's recommendation. Torrence said that he wants to use composite so it is low-maintenance, and most all of the composite materials have a wood grain, but some have a larger grain than others. He said that they would like the deck color to match the house trim.

Levitan asked why Bailey is opposed to a false texture. Bailey said that some standards call out that it must be smooth with no false texture, and the Commission has also discussed alternatives to wood materials in the past and concluded that they should be smooth. She said that in this case, the texture is not specifically part of the Third Lake Ridge standards, the deck is a new structure not connected to the house, and will have limited visibility behind the vegetative screen. Levitan asked about the overall policy on texture, and Bailey said that composite materials with an overly exaggerated wood grain tend to look very obvious that it is not real wood as opposed to a more comparable substitute with less texture. Levitan asked about the visibility of this proposed deck structure, and Bailey said that it has limited visibility from the street.

Levitan asked if Torrence has a vested interest in the texture. Torrence said that he has no opinion either way, but it seems that most composite materials have a wood grain. Bailey said that Trex no longer appears to make a smooth product, and Torrence said that he could try to find a smooth product. There was further discussion of other composite materials, and samples were reviewed by the Commission.

Bailey pointed out that this is new construction, so the method of evaluating materials is different than if it were being installed on a historic structure. Levitan said that he has a hard time believing the proposed materials

would be noticeable to anyone from the street, and suggested they let the applicant use the materials he had selected. Kaliszewski said that if it were attached to the house, she would have strong feelings about it, but because it is a new structure that is not attached and minimally visible, she has no strong feelings about the materials. McLean agreed.

ACTION:

A motion was made by McLean, seconded by Kaliszewski, to approve the request for the Certificate of Appropriateness. The motion passed by voice vote/other.