

AGENDA # 1

City of Madison, Wisconsin

| | | |
|---|-------------------------------------|-------------|
| REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION | PRESENTED: December 21, 2005 | |
| TITLE: 702 North Midvale Boulevard (Hilldale Shopping Center) – Amended PUD(GDP-SIP), Theatre Anchor in Urban Design District No. 6 | REFERRED: | |
| | REREFERRED: | |
| | REPORTED BACK: | |
| AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary | ADOPTED: | POF: |
| DATED: December 21, 2005 | ID NUMBER: | |

Members present were: Paul Wagner, Ald. Noel Radomski, Todd Barnett, Bruce Woods, Lisa Geer, Michael Barrett and Lou Host-Jablonski.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of December 21, 2005, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL** of an Amended PUD(GDP-SIP) for the theatre anchor of Hilldale Shopping Mall located at 702 North Midvale Boulevard. Appearing on behalf of the project were Dennis Harder, Bob Fink, Michael Strum, Michael Cummings and Brett West. In response to the Commission's previous review of the project, the revised plans featured the following:

- Bike parking stalls and bus stop accommodations have been provided off of the south elevation of the theater.
- The first floor features multiple theaters and retail components with the second floor featuring a restaurant/bar and grill, and the third floor featuring an outdoor café and bar (roof). A "Sundance" icon or stone is located off of the southeast corner of the building.
- The front access is provided on the east elevation with a secondary entry added off of the southeast corner of the building as well as a south elevation egress door.
- Two tower elements are added on the east elevation; one featuring a rough cut limestone face and the other a glass wall tower.
- Projecting signs are located off of the southeast corner on both the east and west elevations.
- A recess has been added to the south elevation, featuring a fire egress door, a full three stories in height. Ramping has been added along the south elevation to provide access from the exiting (egress door).
- Wall signage is featured on the upper elevation of the west and south elevations.

Following the presentation, the Commission expressed concerns on the following:

- The railing on the access ramps, combined with landscaping, add liveliness to the wall of the south elevation.
- The utilization of 3-1/2" O.D. pipe should be more decorative.
- The use of brick versus precast panels is a concern. Would like to see real brick.
- Look at another lighting alternative; locate on a horizontal band that washes down.
- Move frosted glass element into the recess on the south elevation.

- Use of stone on tower element looks foreign; needs more integration.
- Concerned with brick impressed precast looking cheap in contrast to the utilization of brick on the rest of the building.
- The stone vertical tower appears as a foreign element and does not relate to anything else; needs integration.
- Need to see more detail on projecting signage with the signage package to come back for further consideration.
- Examine the possibility of integrating the “dry stack” stone into the overall landscape scheme, paving, retaining walls, etc.
- Consider the use of real brick below with proper precast panels above as a compromise.
- The building needs to keep an impression of quality with brick not precast which looks cheap.

ACTION:

On a motion by Geer, seconded by Barnett, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL** of an Amended PUD(GDP-SIP) for the theatre anchor of Hilldale Shopping Mall located at 702 North Midvale Boulevard. The motion was passed on a vote of (6-0-1) with Woods abstaining. The motion required the following:

- Provide building material colors and samples, in addition to lighting and photometrics and a more detailed landscape plan and signage package. In addition, introduce glass at the south elevation exit frosted, or an alternative, with further study of the stone tower with different materials or belt coursing, and consider the use of real brick over precast.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 6, 6, 6, 6.5, 6.5 and 7.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 702 North Midvale Boulevard

| | Site Plan | Architecture | Landscape Plan | Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc. | Signs | Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular) | Urban Context | Overall Rating |
|-----------------------|-----------|--------------|----------------|--------------------------------|-------|-------------------------------------|---------------|----------------|
| Member Ratings | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (Abstain) |
| | - | 7 | - | - | - | - | 7 | 7 |
| | 6 | 6 | 7 | - | 5 | 6 | 5 | 6 |
| | 7 | 7 | - | - | 6 | 6 | 7 | 6.5 |
| | 7 | 6 | 7 | 7 | 7 | 7 | 7 | 6.5 |
| | 6 | 6 | 6 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 7 | 6 |
| | 5 | 5 | 6 | 6 | - | 7 | 5 | 6 |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |

General Comments:

- Overall very satisfying. We need to resolve the façade material, whether brick or concrete stained to resemble brick.
- Building is too important to use imitation brick precast. Need to see more details on sign designs. A 3-D building view would be good.
- Addition to the café and public area on the south side is a big improvement and activates both sides facing streets. Details in the plaza area will be important. Add lighting photometric plan to submittal. Consider using the limestone in the landscape area in walls or paving to help unify.
- Use real brick; study lighting: Great revision for southeast corner; add glass slot at south exit.
- This would have deserved 8's straight across if the architectural strength of the front had carried around to the side and better façade materials used throughout.