

20 May 2010

Amy Scanlon - Department of Planning and Community and Economic Development
Rebecca Cnare - Department of Planning and Community and Economic Development
Bill Fruhling- Department of Planning and Community and Economic Development
Dan Stephans – Chair, Madison Landmarks Commission

In advance of the Landmarks Commission's July 12 meeting, please see comments below on agenda items from the *Madison Trust for Historic Preservation* and *National Trust for Historic Preservation*.

Item 1 - 404 North Carroll Street

Concur with staff report. Allowing vinyl shutters in the Mansion Hill Historic District when wood shutters are readily available would be a ratchet-click toward a residential historic district full of contrived historic fabric rather than sensitive treatment and replacement of the historic fabric that comprises the historic character of the district.

Item 2 - 111 S. Hamilton Street

No concerns about either option for placement of sign. Concur with staff report on recommendations for attachment method. Pleased to see revelation of more of the original entrance treatment.

Item 3 - 517-523 East Main Street

No concerns about the demolition of the existing building. It is not architecturally distinctive, nor does it contribute to the character of the First Settlement Historic District.

No concerns about the proposed new construction.

Item 4 - Discussion about applying for a Certified Local Government (CLG) Grant from the State of Wisconsin Historical Society.

The Madison Trust is holding a \$500 donation by a member who was interested in funding an architecture and history survey in Madison. If your application for survey funding is successful we will contribute this amount to augment the grant funding for the survey.

Item 7 - Buildings proposed for demolition - 2010

We hope the Commission considers carefully the request for demolition of 1384 Williamson St. Demolition of this house, though not an architectural specimen of "particular architectural or historical significance" in the Third Lake Ridge HD, would constitute the loss of an element in the district that contributes to the diverse character of this neighborhood. It is the architectural and economic diversity of the Third Lake Ridge area that is called out in the district nomination as a key

Dedicated to Preserving Madison's Historic Places

MADISON TRUST



for Historic Preservation

NATIONAL
TRUST
FOR
HISTORIC
PRESERVATION®

source of its significance. We also recognize that this house sits on a block that is predominated by commercial buildings, and that its loss would not leave a void in the rhythm of a residential block.

Respectfully submitted,

Jason Tish
Executive Director
Madison Trust for Historic Preservation
P.O. Box
Madison, WI 53701

Dedicated to Preserving Madison's Historic Places

P.O. Box 296 Madison, Wisconsin 53701-0296 608-441-8864 www.madisontrust.org