### PLANNING DIVISION STAFF REPORT

March 20, 2017

#### PREPARED FOR THE PLAN COMMISSION

Project Address: 1501 Monroe Street

**Application Type:** Conditional Use

Legistar File ID # 46115

**Prepared By:** Timothy M. Parks, Planning Division

Report includes comments from other City agencies, as noted.

**Reviewed By:** Heather Stouder and Kevin Firchow, Planning Division

# **Summary**

**Applicant & Property Owner:** Michael Erikson, Red Hospitality, LLC; 1501 Monroe Street; Madison; Jason Illstrup, representative.

**Requested Action:** Approval of a major alteration to an approved conditional use to construct a four-story addition to the four-story hotel at 1501 Monroe Street, including approval of an additional outdoor eating area.

**Proposal Summary:** The applicant proposes to construct a four-story addition to the existing four-story Hotel RED at 1501 Monroe Street. The addition will add 53-57 guest rooms to the existing 48 rooms for a total of 105 lodging rooms, as well as an eighth floor lounge and event space. Construction of the project will commence this fall or winter, with completion anticipated in fall 2018.

Applicable Regulations & Standards: Table 28D-2 in Section 28.061 of the Zoning Code identifies hotels, inns and motels, and non-accessory temporary outdoor events as conditional uses, and outdoor eating areas as conditional accessory uses in the TSS (Traditional Shopping Street) zoning district. Non-accessory temporary outdoor events (such as beer gardens for events at Camp Randall Stadium) are subject to supplemental regulations in Section 28.151. Section 28.065(3)(c) requires conditional use approval for building heights exceeding the three stories and 40 feet maximum allowed in TSS zoning. Section 28.065(4) states that an individual establishment shall not exceed 10,000 gross square feet in TSS zoning unless approved as a conditional use. Section 28.183 of the Zoning Code provides the process and standards for the approval of conditional use permits, including major alterations.

Review Required By: Plan Commission

**Summary Recommendation:** The Planning Division recommends that the Plan Commission not find the standards met and place on file without prejudice the request to construct a four-story addition to the four-story hotel at 1501 Monroe Street and associated conditional uses for additional outdoor eating areas and non-accessory temporary events.

# **Background Information**

**Parcel Location:** An approximately 0.44-acre site generally located at the southeasterly corner of Monroe and Regent streets, Aldermanic District 13 (Eskrich); Madison Metropolitan School District.

**Existing Conditions and Land Use:** The existing four-story, 48-room Hotel RED, zoned TSS (Traditional Shopping Street District).



### **Surrounding Land Uses and Zoning:**

North: University of Wisconsin Field House, Camp Randall Stadium, Fire Station #4;

<u>South</u>: Madison Chinese Christian Church, single- and two-family residences along Madison Street, zoned TR-C4 (Traditional Residential–Consistent 4 District);

<u>West</u>: New Orleans Takeout, Stadium Barbers, Mickie's Dairy Bar on southerly side of Monroe Street; Crazylegs Lane on northwesterly side of Monroe, all zoned TSS (Traditional Shopping Street District);

<u>East</u>: The Regent Apartments northeast across Regent Street, and various commercial business along the south side Regent Street east of Madison Street, all zoned TSS.

**Adopted Land Use Plans:** The <u>Comprehensive Plan</u> identifies the subject site and south side of Monroe Street from Regent to Van Buren streets, including the subject site, for Neighborhood Mixed-Use development, with a Transit-Oriented Development node identified further southwest of the subject site at the Grant/S. Spooner street intersection.

The site is also included in Area #3 of the 2007 Monroe Street Commercial District Plan, which recommends mixed-use redevelopment of the Monroe Street block face bounded by Oakland Avenue on the west and Regent Street on the east with two- to four-story buildings. The plan includes the opportunity for a projecting or tower-type element at the Regent Street intersection.

Finally, the subject site is also located within the limits of the 2008 Regent Street/ South Campus Neighborhood Plan, which guides redevelopment activities along Regent Street from Breese Terrace to East Campus Mall. The plan incorporates the recommendations contained in the Comprehensive Plan for land use and those contained in the Monroe Street Commercial District Plan for building height for the subject site.

Zoning Summary: The property is zoned TSS (Traditional Shopping Street District).

Requirements	Required	Proposed
Maximum Front Yard	25′	Existing
Side Yards	None required except for access	Existing
Rear Yard	For corner lots, where all abutting property is in a nonresidential zoning district, the rear yard setback shall be the same as the required side yard	Adequate
Maximum Lot Coverage	85%	See Zoning conditions
Maximum Building Height	3 stories/ 40'	8 stories, approx. 100'
Auto Parking	Hotel: 0.75 stalls per bedroom (79) Existing Restaurant-tavern: 15% of capacity of 160 persons (24) = 103 total	78 valet stalls (See Zoning conditions)
Accessible Stalls	N/A	(See Zoning conditions)
Bike Parking	Hotel: 1 per 10 bedrooms (10) Existing Restaurant-tavern: 5% of capacity of 160 persons (8) = 18 total	22 (See Zoning conditions)
Loading	None	(See Zoning conditions)
Building Forms	Commercial Block Building	(See Zoning conditions)

Other Critical Zoning Items		
Yes:	Barrier Free, Utility Easements	
No:	Urban Design, Floodplain, Wellhead Protection, Landmarks, Waterfront Development, Adjacent to Park	
	Prepared by: Jenny Kirchgatter, Assistant Zoning Administrator	

**Environmental Corridor Status:** The subject site is not located within a mapped environmental corridor.

**Public Utilities and Services:** The site is served by a full range of urban services, including seven-day Metro Transit service along Regent Street, and weekend/ holiday service along Monroe Street. Bus stop ID #0249 is adjacent the proposed project site along the south side of Monroe Street, with the bus stop zone encompassing the area from the existing bus stop sign pole east up towards the intersection.

# **Previous Approvals and Requests**

On May 5, 2008, the Plan Commission approved a demolition permit to allow two commercial buildings located at 1501-1509 Monroe Street to be razed and a <u>four</u>-story, 48-room hotel to be constructed. That approval included, among other conditions, the prohibition of beer gardens and a requirement that changes to the approved plans or operations, as well as complaints against said plans or operations, shall be subject to the conditional use procedures in Sec. 28.12(11)(h) and (i) of the [1966] Zoning Code. Following an appeal of the Plan Commission decision by the district alder, the Common Council upheld the Plan Commission approval on June 3, 2008 and added a condition that the deed restriction be reviewed by the Plan Commission and recorded prior to issuance of permits to ensure that it reflected all of the project elements presented in the Plan Commission public hearing and to clarify the enforcement mechanism in the restriction. The Plan Commission approved the restrictive covenant for the hotel on June 16, 2008. [At the time of approval, hotels and motels up to 40,000 square feet of gross floor area were permitted uses in the C2-General Commercial and C3-Highway Commercial zoning of the site under the 1966 Zoning Code.]

Previously on December 17, 2007, the Plan Commission placed on file a demolition permit to construct a <u>five</u>-story, 48-room hotel on the subject site. In so doing, the Plan Commission found that the proposal did not meet the standards for approval, stating that the project did not comply with demolition standard that both the requested demolition and the proposed use be compatible with the purpose of [the demolition permit] section and the intent and purpose expressed in the Zoning Code for the zoning district in which the property is located [then C2-General Commercial and C3-Highway Commercial zoning]. The Plan Commission expressed concerns about the proposed demolition and proposed hotel use of the subject property would have on the normal and orderly development and improvement of surrounding properties..." The Plan Commission cited the nature of the proposed use and the concerns about it being detrimental to the neighborhood and stated that they did not believe the hotel met the recommendations of the <u>Monroe Street Commercial District Plan</u> in regard to the scale, height and setback or the <u>Comprehensive Plan</u> in regard to scale.

On October 17, 2011, the Plan Commission approved a conditional use to allow a non-accessory beer garden associated with events taking place at Camp Randall Stadium [1966 Zoning Code] and an outdoor eating area for Hotel RED, and also approved amendments to the restrictive covenant approved for the hotel in 2008.

# **Project Description**

The applicant is seeking Plan Commission approval to add four stories to the existing four-story Hotel RED at 1501 Monroe Street. Hotels are conditional uses in the TSS zoning district under the 2013 Zoning Code, although

a conditional use for the lodging use was not required when the hotel was first approved and constructed subject to the 1966 Zoning Code. The current request also seeks to modify previously approved conditional uses for outdoor eating related to the hotel restaurant and bar and for non-accessory temporary outdoor event space (Camp Randall beer garden), which were approved after the hotel was approved and under construction.

The existing hotel contains 48 rooms on the second through fourth floors, with the hotel lobby and offices, "The Wise" restaurant and bar, meeting space, and hotel fitness room on the first floor. Parking for approximately 70 vehicles is provided on two levels below the four-story hotel, with access from Regent Street and the mid-block alley that parallels Monroe and Madison streets. Trash and loading for the hotel are provided from the alley.

The proposed addition to the hotel will add three floors of guest rooms on floors five through seven, as shown on Sheets A204 and A205 of the submitted plans. The eighth floor of the addition will include a combination of new guest rooms on the southwesterly portion of that floor, and a lounge and event space and associated prep kitchen on the northeasterly half. A small balcony is proposed at the northeastern corner of the eighth floor, with a larger rooftop garden proposed overlooking the Monroe-Regent intersection in the middle of the eighth floor. The letter of intent indicates that between 53 and 57 new rooms will be added with the addition for a total of 105. Like with many of the street-facing rooms on the lower floors of the hotel, many of the new rooms will include balconies overlooking Monroe and Regent streets, although no balconies or outdoor living spaces will be provided for the new rooms on the alley side of the hotel overlooking the adjacent residential neighborhood to the southeast consistent with the design of the existing hotel. In addition to the four new floors of hotel proposed, the plans submitted for review also identify a series of smaller modifications on the existing lower floors of the hotel to accommodate the expanded hotel program, as noted by the gray-shaded areas on Sheets A201-A203.

The exterior of the expanded hotel will continue many of the angular, modern/ industrial themes of the existing building, which features architectural concrete, large metal-framed windows, and prominent red-colored and clear glass-paneled balcony walls. Portions of the Monroe Street façade are trimmed in red brick, while the rear of the building includes EIFS panels that were not originally shown on the 2008-approved plans. Floors 5-7 of the addition will largely continue the materials, rhythm and patterning on the existing hotel on the north (Monroe Street), east (Regent Street) and south (alley) elevations, as depicted on Sheet A401. On the west façade of the addition, which will face towards Oakland Avenue and overlook the two-story commercial buildings between the site and Oakland, the applicant proposes a combination of concrete panels, red brick and EIFS, with limited window openings adjacent to the westerly side property line.

The existing hotel stands approximately 48 feet in height above Monroe Street, with approximately 10 additional feet of building height exposed along Regent Street as the grade of the site falls from west to east, and along the alley, which sits 10 feet below the grade of Monroe Street. The proposed addition will add 51.5 feet of height to the building mass, including a 20-foot tall eighth floor. The top floor will feature prominent floor to ceiling windows on the northern half of the floor where the lounge and event space is proposed, and a recess above Monroe Street where the rooftop garden is proposed.

Parking for the expanded hotel will be provided in 77 auto stalls to be located below the building. The applicant proposes to convert the existing hotel parking into a full valet operation in which all of the car parking will be handled by hotel staff. The Traffic Engineering Division has requested a parking management plan and plan for the valet parking prior to issuance of permits for the addition. The letter of intent indicates that 22 bike parking stalls will be provided on site, including racks located adjacent to the lobby at the corner of Monroe and Regent streets. The number and location of bike parking stalls and the type of rack to be used shall be subject to final approval by the Zoning Administrator prior to issuance of permits.

# **Analysis**

The Plan Commission may not approve a conditional use or a major alteration to an approved conditional use unless it can find that all of the standards found in Section 28.183(6)(a), Approval Standards for Conditional Uses, are met. That section states: "The City Plan Commission shall not approve a conditional use without due consideration of the recommendations in the City of Madison Comprehensive Plan and any applicable, neighborhood, neighborhood development, or special area plan, including design guidelines adopted as supplements to these plans. No application for a conditional use shall be granted by the Plan Commission unless it finds that all of the following conditions are present."

In reviewing the conditional use request to add four stories to the existing Hotel RED at 1501 Monroe Street, the Planning Division cannot recommend that the Plan Commission find the standards for approval are met. In making this recommendation, staff believes in particular that the proposal does not meet standards #9 and 12, which state:

- 9. When applying the above standards to any new construction of a building or an addition to an existing building the Plan Commission shall find that the project creates an environment of sustained aesthetic desirability compatible with the existing or intended character of the area and the statement of purpose for the zoning district. In order to find that this standard is met, the Plan Commission may require the applicant to submit plans to the Urban Design Commission for comment and recommendation."
- 12. When applying the above standards to an application for height in excess of that allowed in the district, the Plan Commission shall consider recommendations in adopted plans; the impact on surrounding properties, including height, mass, orientation, shadows and view; architectural quality and amenities; the relationship of the proposed building(s) with adjoining streets, alleys, and public rights of ways; and the public interest in exceeding the district height limits.

Staff does not believes that the eight-story, nearly 100-foot tall hotel proposed comports to either the existing or intended character of the surrounding area given the site context, applicable plan recommendations, and purpose of the TSS—Traditional Shopping Street zoning district.

The area surrounding the subject site consists of a wide range of land uses, including a mix of low-rise, mostly single- and two-family residences in the Vilas neighborhood to the south and southeast of the site, and an assortment of primarily one- and two-story commercial businesses that extend along both Monroe and Regent streets. The University of Wisconsin Field House and Camp Randall Stadium are located north of the site across Regent Street, while the eight-story Regent Apartments are located a block east of the site at the northwestern corner of Randall Avenue and Regent Street. The site is also located across Monroe Street from the small "Crazylegs Square" plaza greenspace bounded by Breese Terrace, Monroe Street and Regent Street.

Although staff acknowledges that there are buildings of comparable scale in the vicinity of Hotel RED, it feels that the distance of those buildings from the subject site, their orientation to abutting streets, and the significant change in character beginning on the south side of the Monroe-Regent intersection set the hotel addition apart from those other buildings. For example, the Field House is located approximately 250 due north of the hotel across the vast open space created by the intersection of Monroe Street, Regent Street and the Southwest Bike Path, which includes the Crazylegs Square greenspace. Staff feels that this horizontal distance diminishes the visual relationship that building has to the hotel. Unlike the subject hotel, which is located at the

right of way lines of Monroe and Regent streets, most of the Field House is set back from Monroe Street above a modest embankment with the exception of the southeastern corner of the building, which touches the right of way. Likewise, The Regent Apartments are set back 10 or more feet north of Regent Street, which slightly reduces the presence of that building along the street.

Buildings on the south side of Monroe and Regent streets by comparison are located much closer to the sidewalk, which creates a much different character and pedestrian experience, particularly along Monroe Street. As noted, most of these buildings are two stories tall. The next closest buildings exceeding this predominant scale, the four-story Clarenden Apartments, are mostly set back from Monroe Street and organized around a central courtyard. Three blocks further west, the five-story Monroe Commons mixed-use building abuts Monroe Street in a fashion similar to the hotel and appears taller at its eastern end due to grades that fall from west to east. However, Monroe Commons incorporates considerable modulation of its façades in an effort to reduce its mass, and was very controversial at the time of its approval and construction due to the significant change in scale and character it proposed compared to the traditional scale and character of Monroe Street. While elements of the eight-story expanded hotel will be stepped back from the Monroe Street property line to provide some modulation of the mass along that street, most of its mass will be visible along and in close proximity to Monroe Street. Meanwhile, the building will stand a full eight stories above Regent Street.

While the proposed four-story addition will continue the modern architectural motif of the existing hotel and offers a more distinctive cap for the building than currently exists on the four-story original hotel, Planning staff feels that consideration should be given to how the eight-story mass will appear when viewed at a distance approaching the Regent and Monroe intersection. Due to the proposed height of the hotel and openness of the Monroe-Regent-Southwest Path intersection, the hotel will stand considerably taller than surrounding buildings and be visible from a considerable distance when approaching the intersection. The architecture and building materials used should present well on all sides of the building, and the Plan Commission may consider seeking an advisory recommendation from the Urban Design Commission on those topics if it considers approving the addition. In particular, the presentation of the building facing southeast over the Vilas Neighborhood and from the east along Regent Street, as well as the appearance of the side wall facing southwest down Monroe Street above the two-story commercial buildings between the hotel and Oakland Avenue are areas that staff feels merit particular attention to ensure that the eight-story mass creates "an environment of sustained aesthetic desirability" with its surroundings.

Regarding the southwest-facing wall, staff is particularly concerned by the lack of window openings or meaningful articulation of that façade, which staff believes will be visible for a distance when approaching the Monroe-Regent intersection along inbound Monroe Street. The proposed lack of openings is a result of the proximity of the side wall of the addition to the side property line and the limits the Building Code places on windows within specified distances of a property line. It is paramount in staff's opinion that a building of the height proposed be very well designed on all sides given its surrounding context, and the need for the hotel to comply with building codes should be a secondary consideration to the need for the mass to present well on all sides. If the four-story addition is approved, staff recommends that the additional floors be sufficiently set back from the westerly property line to allow an architectural treatment on that façade that is consistent with the rest of the building, including significantly increased window openings and a upper story treatment that punctuates the building on that façade similar to how it is proposed overlooking the Monroe-Regent intersection.

Staff also does not feel that the proposed height is consistent with the height and design recommendations applicable to the site in adopted plans.

The <u>Comprehensive Plan</u> identifies the south side of Monroe Street from Regent to Van Buren streets, including the subject site, for Neighborhood Mixed-Use (NMU) development. The Plan notes that "neighborhood-serving commercial buildings and uses" within NMU areas are "primarily intended to serve the adjacent neighborhoods," with any residential uses generally recommended not to exceed 40 dwelling units per acre. Per the Plan, "neighborhood mixed-use districts may also include specialty businesses serving wider markets, provided the size of establishment and scale of building is consistent with the character of the district and the surrounding neighborhood." The <u>Comprehensive Plan</u> does not define what a "specialty business" is, although Planning staff previously recommended to the Plan Commission when Hotel RED was first proposed in 2007 that hotels could be considered a "specialty business." While hotels of any size are conditional uses in the current TSS zoning of the site since 2013, hotels up to 40,000 gross square feet were permitted uses in the previous C2 and C3 zoning the site had when it was developed in 2008.

The scale of buildings in NMU areas are generally recommended to be between two and four stories in height, though building heights, as well as intensity of use and residential densities can vary as established in an adopted neighborhood or special area plan. The scale of the proposed eight-story hotel will require specific consideration given the character of the surrounding neighborhood, which largely features one- and two-story residential buildings to the southwest along this portion of Monroe Street.

In this case, the applicable adopted special area or neighborhood plan is the Monroe Street Commercial District Plan, which includes detailed development recommendations for each blockface along Monroe Street from Regent Street to Glenway Street, including urban design recommendations for building placement, height and articulation. The Common Council adopted the plan in March 2007 with a provision that redevelopment projects along most of the corridor could be developed with two- to four-story buildings, with the understanding that lot size, proximity to other building forms, setbacks, stepbacks, and floor-to-floor height shall all be considered when reviewing the redevelopment of properties on Monroe Street. The building massing recommendations in the Monroe Street Commercial District Plan are intended to mirror the predominant commercial development pattern present along Monroe Street, and buildings taller than four stories are generally discouraged. The plan recommends that buildings be compatible with the buildings near them along Monroe Street and the residential streets behind, and stepbacks, fenestration and "other similar significant features" are recommended to mitigate height, which is recommended to be measured both in terms of number of stories and overall height above grade. The plan also notes that "there are no absolutes" and that each project should be considered on a case-by-case basis with an emphasis on a project's compatibility with its surroundings. For buildings taller than four stories, creative design, consideration of contextual impact and the inclusion of "value-added features" are encouraged to mitigate the taller building height.

Specifically, the subject site is included in Area #3 of the Monroe Street Commercial District Plan, which identifies the Monroe Street blockface bounded by Oakland Avenue on the west and Regent Street on the east as a "redevelopment opportunity, short term." The plan recommends that Area #3 be developed with two- to four-story buildings and includes an opportunity for a projecting bay or tower-type element at the Regent Street intersection. The plan encourages buildings along Monroe Street to step down in height along the rear alley in order to provide a "comfortable transition...to the residential neighborhood behind" and encourages rear building parking, service and loading from the mid-block alley. Pedestrian-oriented storefronts are recommended along both Monroe and Regent streets for this block.

The proposed height of the expanded hotel essentially exceeds the adopted height and design recommendations in both plans by a factor of two. The Plan Commission is asked to consider the height of the eight-story hotel and give consideration to both the use, scale and intensity of this project and surrounding land uses when determining if this proposal comports to the design guidelines in the <u>Monroe Street Commercial</u>

<u>District Plan</u> and the normal and orderly physical development of the surrounding area as required in the conditional use standards.

Staff also does not believe that the scale of the proposed building is consistent with the intent of the TSS zoning of the site as expressed in the statement of purpose and general bulk requirements for that district. Per its statement of purpose, the TSS district is established "to encourage and sustain the viability of Madison's mixed-use corridors, which sustain many of the City's traditional neighborhoods...consistent with the adopted goals, objectives, policies, and recommendations of the Comprehensive Plan and of adopted neighborhood, corridor or special area plans." Most areas zoned TSS around the City are recommended for Neighborhood Mixed-Use (NMU) or Community Mixed-Use (CMU) development in the Comprehensive Plan and are located in areas with more detailed neighborhood or sub-area plans that contain specific recommendations on the use and form of future development, such as the Monroe Street Commercial District Plan. The TSS district limits individual establishments to 10,000 square feet of floor area and mixed-use buildings to 25,000 square feet of floor area unless larger buildings and establishments are approved as conditional uses. Similarly, the allowed height in TSS is limited to three stories and 40 feet unless a conditional use is approved to allow greater height after specific consideration of conditional use standard #12.

The existing hotel, which is considered one establishment for zoning purposes (the restaurant and bar on the first floor are part of the hotel), is 39,867 gross square feet per its 2008 approval and the current letter of intent. With the proposed addition, the floor area of the hotel will increase to 76,637 gross square feet. Staff feels that this scale of the expanded hotel is considerably greater than what would ordinarily be found in a neighborhood mixed-use corridor such as Monroe Street and in TSS zoning. Where larger buildings have been approved in these similarly planned and zoned areas, they have most often been mixed-use buildings, which can be up to 2.5 times larger than an individual building in TSS, and in structures that largely comported to the bulk and design recommendations contained in adopted plans. In some instances, especially prior to 2013, those projects were developed in a planned development zoning district that allowed greater flexibility than a conventional district.

## Conclusion

The applicant is requesting approvals by the Plan Commission to add four stories to his existing four-story hotel at the corner of Monroe and Regent streets. Hotels are conditional uses in the TSS (Traditional Shopping Street) zoning district, as are outdoor eating areas and non-accessory temporary outdoor events such as beer gardens related to events at Camp Randall Stadium. The proposed eight-story, approximately 100-foot tall hotel requires conditional use approval to allow the building following the addition to exceed the three-story and 40-foot height maximums allowed in TSS zoning, as well as conditional use approval to allow an individual establishment to exceed 10,000 gross square feet of area.

In order to approve the conditional use required to allow construction of the four-story addition, the Plan Commission shall find that the request meets the standards for approval in due consideration of the recommendations in adopted plans. The Planning Division has carefully reviewed the proposal and cannot recommend that the scale of the proposed building meets the standards given its surrounding context, the recommendations in the Comprehensive Plan and Monroe Street Commercial District Plan, both of which recommend significantly smaller buildings in scale and mass for the site and the Monroe Street corridor, and the intent and bulk requirements of the TSS district. While the Monroe Street Commercial District Plan allows for consideration of buildings taller than the four-story maximum generally recommended, staff cannot find that a building of the scale proposed could be supported by that plan, nor does staff feel that the eight-story hotel has adequately achieved the equivalencies in the plan for such taller buildings. Further, staff does not believe that the proposed building will create an environment of sustained aesthetic desirability consistent with the adopted

plan recommendations for the site per conditional use standard #9, or that there is a sufficient public interest to allow the proposed height per standard #12.

Should the Plan Commission find that the conditional use standards are met for this project, Planning staff encourages the Commission to consider the architecture of the southwest- and southeast-facing facades of the eight-story hotel to ensure that the building is well-designed on all sides given the considerable visibility it will have. Prior to approval, the Plan Commission may refer the project to the Urban Design Commission for a recommendation on the aesthetic desirability of the expanded hotel if it feels their input would be helpful in finding standard #9 met.

In the event that the Plan Commission should approve the conditional use requests, conditions of approval are included in the following section. Among the conditions proposed, staff is recommending limits on the outdoor eating areas and non-accessory temporary outdoor event space to limit impacts on residents in the surrounding neighborhoods, including limits on the hours of operation and amplified sound.

## Recommendation

<u>Planning Division Recommendation</u> (Contact Timothy M. Parks, 261-9632)

The Planning Division recommends that the Plan Commission **not** find the conditional use standards met and **place on file without prejudice** the request to construct a four-story addition to the four-story hotel at 1501 Monroe Street and associated conditional uses for an additional outdoor eating area and non-accessory temporary event space. If the Plan Commission denies the conditional use application, it shall include findings of fact and list the standard(s) that have not been met and the reasons such standard(s) was not met as part of its action.

Should the Commission find the conditional use standards met, staff recommends that it approve the project subject to input at the public hearing and the following conditions:

Recommended Conditions of Approval: Major/Non-Standard Conditions are Shaded

#### **Planning Division**

- 1. The applicant shall submit a revised plan for the first floor outdoor eating area for final approval by Planning and Zoning staff prior to issuance of permits. The revised plan shall reflect the expanded entry vestibule and provide a seating plan and maximum occupancy for regular (non-game day) operation and for operation as a non-accessory temporary outdoor event for events occurring at Camp Randall Stadium. The plan shall include details of any screening or barriers to enclose the first floor space during regular and stadium event operations.
- 2. When the first floor outdoor area is used as a non-accessory temporary outdoor event, food shall be available for purchase throughout the operation of the event space, and employees shall wear easy to identify uniforms to aid in identifying hotel staff from the patrons.
- 3. That service in all outdoor eating areas not begin before 6:00 AM, and end by 10:00 PM Sunday—Thursday and by 11:00 PM on Friday and Saturday, except as specified in the following condition. No service of anything to anyone shall be allowed outside of these hours, and the outdoor eating areas shall only be for seating/ lounging by hotel guests at other times. Modifications to the hours of operation for shall be allowed

only following the approval of a minor alteration to the conditional use by the Director of the Planning Division following a recommendation by the district alder.

- 4. The first floor non-accessory temporary event area for events occurring at Camp Randall Stadium shall be open no later than 8:00 PM, except for University of Wisconsin football games with a kickoff after 5:00 PM, when the area shall be open no later than 10:00 PM. Any use of the non-accessory event area for a concert at the stadium shall end one hour after the start of the concert and shall remain closed for the remainder of service.
- 5. That amplified sound is prohibited at all times in all outdoor areas of the hotel.
- 6. That no portion of the eighth floor be used for a non-accessory temporary outdoor event. Any event scheduled for the eighth floor lounge/ event space during an event at Camp Randall Stadium shall not be open to the general public and shall only be a ticketed event.
- 7. The applicant shall work with the Planning Division, Zoning Administrator, Building Inspection Division and Fire Department to establish a maximum occupancy for the eighth floor lounge/ event space for regular (non-game day) operation and for operation during events occurring at Camp Randall Stadium.
- 8. The applicant shall work with Zoning and Planning staff to amend the deed restriction on the property to reflect the plans for the expanded hotel, revised parking arrangements, and new and revised outdoor eating areas.

#### City Engineering Division (Contact Tim Troester, 267-1995)

- 9. The applicant shall replace all sidewalk and curb and gutter that abuts the property that is damaged by the construction, or any sidewalk and curb and gutter, which the City Engineer determines needs to be replaced because it is not at a desirable grade, regardless of whether the condition existed prior to beginning construction.
- 10. All work in the public right of way shall be performed by a City-licensed contractor.
- 11. All damage to the pavement on Monroe Street and Regent Street adjacent to this development shall be restored in accordance with the City's Pavement Patching Criteria.

#### <u>City Engineering Division–Mapping Section</u> (Contact Jeff Quamme, 266-4097)

- 12. The site plan shall label and acknowledge the Encroachment Agreement for existing subterranean footings in Regent and Monroe Streets per Document No. 4527029.
- 13. The addresses for existing hotel room on the 4th floor do not match the approved addressing plan. In addition, the hotel room numbers for the proposed floors are out of sequence and not valid for addressing. Submit a PDF of all floor plans (including the 1st, 2nd, 3rd and 4th floor) to Izenchenko@cityofmadison.com so that an interior addressing plan can be developed prior to plans being submitted for permit review. If there are any changes pertaining to the location of a unit, the deletion or addition of a unit, or to the location of the entrance into any unit, (before, during, or after construction) the addresses may need to be changed. The interior address plan is subject to the review and approval of the Fire Marshal.

## <u>Traffic Engineering Division</u> (Contact Eric Halvorson, 266-6527)

- 14. The applicant shall prepare a Parking Management Plan, including a detailed Valet Parking Plan, for site and building operations to be reviewed and approved by the City Traffic Engineer.
- 15. The applicant shall prepare a Transportation Demand Management (TDM) Plan to be reviewed and approved by the City Traffic Engineer per MGO Section 28.183(6)(a)6.
- 16. The applicant shall submit one contiguous plan for approval showing proposed conditions and one contiguous plan showing existing conditions. The plan drawing shall be scaled to 1" = 20' and include the following, when applicable: existing and proposed property lines; parcel addresses; all easements; pavement markings; signing; building placement; items in the terrace such as signs, street light poles, hydrants; surface types such as asphalt, concrete, grass, sidewalk; driveway approaches, including those adjacent to and across street from the project lot location; parking stall dimensions, including 2 feet of vehicle overhang; drive aisle dimensions; semitrailer movement and vehicle routes; dimensions of radii; and percent of slope.
- 17. The Developer shall post a security deposit prior to the start of development. In the event that modifications need to be made to any City owned and/or maintained traffic signals, street lighting, signing, pavement marking and conduit/handholes, the Developer shall reimburse the City for all associated costs including engineering, labor and materials for both temporary and permanent installations.
- 18. The City Traffic Engineer may require public signing and marking related to the development; the developer shall be financially responsible for such signing and marking.
- 19. All parking facility design shall conform to the standards in MGO Section 10.08(6).

### Zoning Administrator (Contact Jenny Kirchgatter, 266-4429)

- 20. A shared parking arrangement is proposed across the alley at the Madison Chinese Christian Church at 1510 Madison Street. Verify whether a shared parking agreement exists or obtain approval for the shared parking arrangement. This parking may not count toward the minimum parking requirement for the hotel and restaurant-tavern without a shared parking agreement in place.
- 21. Surface parking is shown across the alley at 1506 Madison Street. The applicant shall obtain approval for the surface parking lot or remove the parking lot from the property.
- 22. The applicant shall work with Zoning and Planning staff to amend the deed restriction on the property to reflect the addition.
- 23. Provide a calculation and plan detail for lot coverage with the final submittal. The lot coverage maximum is 85%. Lot coverage is defined as the total area of all buildings, measured at grade, all accessory structures including patios, etc., and all paved areas as a percentage of the total area of the lot, with the following exceptions: sidewalks or paved paths no wider than five (5) feet, pervious pavement, green roofs and decks. If the existing site currently exceeds 85% maximum lot coverage, proposed site improvements may not further increase lot coverage above the maximum.

- 24. A vehicle parking reduction to be approved by the Director will be required per Section 28.141(5). Submit a request for a parking reduction with the final plan submittal including information to support the argument for reducing the required number of spaces.
- 25. Show the guest or customer drop off area and the accessible route to the accessible building entrance.
- 26. Provide a bike rack detail.
- 27. Required loading facilities shall comply with MGO Section 28.141(13). Provide two (10' x 50') loading areas with 14 feet of vertical clearance to be shown on the plan. The loading areas shall be exclusive of drive aisle and maneuvering space. The required number of loading spaces may be reduced through conditional use approval.
- 28. Submit the landscape plan and landscape worksheet stamped by the registered landscape architect. Per Section 28.142(3) Landscape Plan and Design Standards, landscape plans for zoning lots greater than 10,000 square feet in size must be prepared by a registered landscape architect. Identify and label existing as well as proposed landscaping and plantings.
- 29. Provide details of the existing outdoor plaza and proposed rooftop garden patio including layout of tables and chairs for outdoor eating areas and details of landscape planters and patio amenities.
- 30. Submit a rooftop plan showing the location of any proposed rooftop mechanical equipment and screening. All rooftop equipment shall be screened from view from adjacent streets and public rights-of-way per Sections 28.060(2)(f) and 28.142(9)(d). Screens shall be of durable, permanent materials that are compatible with the primary building materials.
- 31. Submit details of the existing trash enclosure and details of the proposed generator enclosure or screening.
- 32. The area of building expansion must comply with the building materials requirement, per Section 28.060(2)(g).
- 33. Exterior lighting provided shall be in accordance with MGO Section 10.085. Provide an exterior lighting plan and fixture cut sheets with the final plan submittal.
- 34. Per Section 28.186(4)(b), the property owner or operator is required to bring the property into compliance with all elements of the approved site plans by the date established by the Zoning Administrator as part of the site and building plan approval. Work with Zoning staff to establish a final site compliance date.
- 35. Signage approvals are not granted by the Plan Commission. Signage must be reviewed for compliance with Chapter 31 Sign Codes of the Madison General Ordinances. Signage permits are issued by the Zoning Section of the Department of Planning and Community and Economic Development.

<u>Fire Department</u> (Contact Bill Sullivan, 261-9658)

36. Parking stalls are not permitted to obstruct the exit paths. This condition is shown to exist on both the Alley and Sub-Alley Levels.

37. The Madison Fire Department will expect to see a construction/occupancy plan indicating the construction schedule and the times and areas the hotel will be vacated to limit the risk to the patrons during construction.

#### Water Utility (Contact Adam Wiederhoeft, 261-9121)

38. This property is in a Wellhead Protection District–Zone (WP-27). The owner shall provide the Madison Water Utility with evidence that no hazardous and/or toxic materials will be stored on site, and that all proposed uses of this site comply with the City of Madison Wellhead Protection Ordinance. Any future change in use for this property will require review by the Madison Water Utility General Manager or his designated representative. Contact Adam Wiederhoeft at awiederhoeft@madisonwater.org for additional information, including a summary of the submittal requirements.

## Parks Division (Contact Janet Schmidt, 261-9688)

The agency reviewed this request and has recommended no conditions or approval.

#### Metro Transit (Contact Tim Sobota, 261-4289)

39. In coordination with public works improvements, the applicant shall maintain or replace the concrete terrace at the existing Metro bus stop on the south side of Monroe Street, west of Regent Street (#0249). [See attachment "1501ms\_METRO.pdf"] The applicant shall include the location of these transit amenities on the final documents filed with their permit application so that Metro Transit may review and approve the design.