



**Project Name/Address:** 117 E Main, Philip Schoen Building  
**Application Type:** Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alteration of landmark  
**Legistar File ID #** [46227](#)  
**Prepared By:** Amy L. Scanlon, Preservation Planner, Planning Division  
**Date Prepared:** March 9, 2017

## Summary

**Project Applicant/Contact:** Stephen Mar-Pohl, InSite Consulting Architects, LLC

**Requested Action:** The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed exterior alterations which include the reconstruction of the parapet, future reconstruction of the decorative cornice, rehabilitation of the exterior stone, replacement of severely deteriorated stone, restore cast-iron storefront, wood window and panel repair, and cleaning of the exterior at the landmark site.

## Background Information

**Parcel Location:** The subject site is located on East Main Street in the Simeon Mills National Register Historic District.

### Relevant Historic Preservation Ordinance Sections:

- 41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.** A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.
- (1) New construction or exterior alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
    - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
    - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
    - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
    - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources.

### Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation

1. A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships.

2. The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.
3. Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.
4. Changes to a property that have acquired historic significance in their own right will be retained and preserved.
5. Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.
6. Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.
7. Chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible. Treatments that cause damage to historic materials will not be used.
8. Archeological resources will be protected and preserved in place. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures will be undertaken.
9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work will be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.
10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

## Analysis and Conclusion

As described in the submission materials, the applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the following work:

- Removal and reconstruction of the parapet. The submission materials indicate that the existing parapet has been previously altered and is deteriorated beyond repair. The existing parapet will be removed and reconstructed to replicate the known coursing and layout of the original cornice based on photographic and physical evidence.
- Reconstruction of decorative cornice. The materials indicate that the owner is interested in reconstructing the original cornice based on photographic evidence at a future date.
- Rehabilitation and preservation of the exterior stone. The submission materials indicate a specific treatment for stone rehabilitation and preservation. The majority of the existing stones will be reused in their existing locations. Some will be redressed and some will be patched or have an existing patch replaced. Very few stones will be removed and replaced with new material.
- Replacement of severely deteriorated stone. The submission materials indicate that 4 existing stones will be removed and replaced with new stone to match the existing stone in its treatment and appearance. The 4 stones to be replaced include 2 base stones that are squared and have not decorative tooling and 2 vertical "column" stones that have a paneled profile.
- Restoration of cast-iron storefront. The work involved with this item seems minimal and is mostly the appropriate preparation of the painted surface for repainting. The Applicant shall confirm the scope of the work for the storefront.
- Repair of wood windows and panels. The existing windows will be assessed and repaired as required. Window replacement is not part of this project. The existing wood panels of the storefront system will be removed and replaced in a configuration to match the existing. New flashing over the masonry sill will be installed.

- Reconstruction of masonry sill and flashing. The submission materials do not address the treatment of the existing masonry sill. The Applicant shall describe the scope of the proposed work related to the masonry sill, the materials used, and the proposed final appearance.
- Cleaning of the stone. The submission materials indicate that the exterior will be cleaned using the gentlest means possible.

While the work described above will remove some historic elements, the majority of the work preserves and rehabilitates existing historic materials and elements. In addition, the existing historic appearance will be retained and improved. The future reconstruction of the historically accurate cornice is a welcomed alteration and further improves the historic appearance of the landmark.

## **Recommendation**

The Landmarks Commission shall consider the following outstanding issues:

1. The Applicant shall confirm that the scope of the work for the cast iron storefront involves preparation of the surface and painting. If the scope is more detailed, the Applicant shall provide additional information.
2. The Applicant shall describe the scope of the proposed work related to the masonry sill, the materials used, and the proposed final appearance. Staff recommends that the existing masonry sill be removed and replaced with dolomitic limestone blocks to match the adjacent new stone material.

With confirmation and discussion of the above outstanding issues, Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed exterior alterations will be met and recommends that the Landmarks Commission approve the request.