

AGENDA # 2

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: April 7, 2010
TITLE: 2702 Todd Drive – Comprehensive Design Review of Signage for United Brick & Tile. 14 th Ald. Dist. (17847)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: April 7, 2010	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Bruce Woods, Richard Slayton, Dawn O’Kroley, Todd Barnett, John Harrington, Jay Ferm, Marsha Rummel, Richard Wagner, Mark Smith and Ron Luskin.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of April 7, 2010, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL** of a Comprehensive Design Review located at 2702 Todd Drive. Appearing on behalf of the project was Mary Beth Growney Selene, representing Ryan Signs, Inc. Prior to the presentation staff noted that the signage package under consideration with a Comprehensive Design Review for Signage provides for the maintenance of a non-conforming site which was constructed on the property prior to its recent annexation to the City of Madison and as non-conforming and was required removed from the site upon discontinuance of the occupancy of the building on site. It is the applicant’s request to maintain the partial use of a non-conforming sign which currently features a 144 square foot sign panel, along with a 96 square foot sign panel for a total of 240 square feet of signage at an overall height of 37-feet; in addition the applicant is requesting a second free-standing sign at 24 square feet and 10-feet in height. The provisions of the code provide for a total cumulative square footage of 144 square feet on not more than 2 free-standing signs. In acknowledgement of the excessive amount of ground signage on the site the application proposes the removal of the existing 144 square foot panel on the primary free-standing ground sign on the site which will bring the sign by itself into compliance in regards to its square footage, along with providing for an additional 24 square feet of ground signage with the secondary free-standing sign. The primary free-standing ground sign will be reduced from 37-feet in height to 29-feet in height combined with the removal of the other existing sign panel. Growney Selene noted that the reduction in overall height to 29-feet was based on structural limitations on the sign, existing ground sign structure and catwalk. She further noted additional reduction of the height would eliminate the opportunity for visibility, as well as the sign’s inconsistency with the provisions of the Sign Control Ordinance as defined. Following the presentation, Matt Tucker, Zoning Administrator spoke on issues associated with the maintenance of the existing ground sign on the site as modified, as well as inconsistencies with the rewritten Street Graphics Control Ordinance, which provides for its removal if not for the current consideration of the provisions for comprehensive design review. Discussion by the Commission was as follows:

- Question narrowing of the stone around pole to not look so heavy.
- Agree that the lowering is not safe, as well as problems with the pole sign’s relationship to the adjacent overpass.
- Look at potential cantilevering to eliminate one column, uncomfortable with the height of stone columns as well as narrowing.

- Consider leaving one column exposed and wrap masonry on the other.
- Uncomfortable with the height of the sign as proposed but it appears necessary in order to provide for its reuse.
- Consider elimination of smaller sign as a trade-off where signage on the building works to off-set.
- Like off-set of column treatment but problem with height, bridges on billboard like quality, too tall, lower height to conform and reuse remaining structure in existing box.
- Ground sign existed when it was within the town, changed based on attachment now in the City; don't have problem with maintaining the use of the sign.

ACTION:

On a motion by Harrington, seconded by Slayton, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a unanimous vote of (8-0). The motion required the removal of the small monument ground sign, as well as a rethink of the stone wrapping to be more proportional to the old ground sign structure as a whole to be approved by staff based on the finding that the project merits approval based on the standards for “comprehensive design review” as contained within the ordinance.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 5, 5, 5, 5, 6.5 and 7.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 2702 Todd Drive

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	-	-	-	-	5	-	-	5
	-	-	-	-	6.5	-	-	6.5
	-	-	-	-	7	-	-	7
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	5
	-	5	-	-	5	-	5	5
	-	-	-	-	6	-	6	-
	-	-	-	-	5	-	-	5

General Comments:

- Nice improvements, unique and challenging site.
- Hardship has not been documented.
- 25' in height seems reasonable – even 22'!
- Proportions of columns need work.