



Project Name & Address: 909-915 Jenifer Street

Application Type(s): Certificate of Appropriateness for an addition in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District

Legistar File ID # [61542](#)

Prepared By: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

Date Prepared: August 11, 2020

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Abby Davidson, RefineJenifer LLC

Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a rear addition and plinth to connect the two properties.

Background Information

Parcel Location/Information: The subject site is located in the Third Lake Ridge Local Historic District.

Relevant State Statute Section:

Wisc SS 62.23(7)(em)2m. In the repair or replacement of a property that is designated as a historic landmark or included within a historic district or neighborhood conservation district under this paragraph, a city shall allow an owner to use materials that are similar in design, color, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities.

Relevant Ordinance Sections:

- 41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.** A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.
- (1) New construction or exterior alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
 - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City’s historic resources.

41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.
- (a) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned residential use that are located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
 - 1. Height.
 - 2. Landscape treatment.
 - 3. Rhythm of mass and spaces.
 - (b) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical proportion and rhythm of solids to voids.
 - (c) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical materials.
 - (d) Alterations of the roof of any existing structure shall retain its existing historical appearance.
 - (e) Alterations of the street facade(s) shall retain the original or existing historical proportional relationships of door sizes to window sizes.

Analysis and Conclusion

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct an addition on the rear of the 909 Jenifer and a mostly below-grade connection between 909 and 911-915 Jenifer. Included in the application materials is the initial approval from the National Park Service as part of the preservation tax credit process. The rear addition would remove an existing open porch and stairs. The existing structure at 909 Jenifer has a wider area at the front of the building and then an inset single-story on the rear. The addition will add a second story to the inset area and then bump back out past the inset, which will allow the inset area to serve as the hyphen between the new and the old portions of the building and breaking up the wall plane.

The windows on the new structure follow a similar placement pattern and are of a compatible style. The roof form is compatible, and the height of the addition will be just below that of the historic house. The applicant suggests possible metal roofing or asphalt shingles, but the NPS approval specifies asphalt or architectural shingles without heavy shadow lines.

There is a discrepancy between the submitted plans, which show a 12" reveal on the clapboards, and the plans approved by the NPS, which show a 6" reveal. The 6" reveal would differentiate the historic from the new construction but be comparable to the historic resources. The 12" reveal would contrast with the historic resources.

The basement-level connector will be minimally visible from the public right-of-way as the two buildings 3'-7" apart at their midpoints and 4' apart at the point of the proposed connection on the rear of the buildings. The connection is noted on the plans as a plinth. It is unclear how the plinth will appear above grade.

A discussion of the relevant ordinance sections follows:

41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.
- (a) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned residential use that are located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:

1. The addition to 909 Jenifer is compatible with the height of other historic resources and it located below the height of the existing structure.
 2. The proposal calls for native landscaping to obscure the plinth.
 3. The proportion of the addition and the placement of the window and door openings maintains the rhythm of masses and spaces found on historic resources in the vicinity.
- (b) N/A
- (c) N/A
- (d) There are no changes to the roof of the existing structures and the roof on the addition will be of a similar style and orientation (front-facing gable).
- (e) N/A

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness can be met and recommends the Landmarks Commission approve the proposal with the following conditions:

Staff approval of:

1. Door and window specifications
2. ADA ramp and railing design
3. Roof shingle specifications
4. Above-grade cladding or landscaping treatment of the plinth connector