



Project Name & Address: 1029 Spaight Street

Application Type(s): Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations in the Third Lake Ridge historic district

Legistar File ID # [65310](#)

Prepared By: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

Date Prepared: May 11, 2021

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Eugene Braaksma, Shorecrest East Condominium Association

Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the replacement of stairs, railings, and masonry piers.

Background Information

Parcel Location/Information: The subject site is located in the Third Lake Ridge Local Historic District.

Relevant State Statute Section:

Wisc SS 62.23(7)(em)2m. In the repair or replacement of a property that is designated as a historic landmark or included within a historic district or neighborhood conservation district under this paragraph, a city shall allow an owner to use materials that are similar in design, color, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities.

Relevant Ordinance Sections:

- 41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.** A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.
- (1) New construction or exterior alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
 - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City’s historic resources.
- 41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.**
- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.

- (a) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned residential use that are located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
 - 1. Height.
 - 2. Landscape treatment.
 - 3. Rhythm of mass and spaces.
- (b) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical proportion and rhythm of solids to voids.
- (c) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical materials.
- (d) Alterations of the roof of any existing structure shall retain its existing historical appearance.
- (e) Alterations of the street facade(s) shall retain the original or existing historical proportional relationships of door sizes to window sizes.

Analysis and Conclusion

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace stairs, railings, and extensive work to masonry piers. The existing multi-unit structure was constructed in 1964 and is of a simple Modern design. The floating concrete stairs and metal railings with geometric designs are character-defining features of the structure. The proposal is to repair failing brick piers, reconstruction of one of the piers, address areas of water infiltration with property flashing, reconstruct failing concrete stairs, and replacement of the railings with new railings.

As this is a post-WWII structure, it features modern brick, which is harder than the more porous brick found on other historic resources within the district. As such, the masonry repairs for this structure feature products not typically approved for historic structures, but are appropriate for this style of building. Most of the work will either repair or replace features in-kind. While the letter of intent states that the railings will have the same appearance as the existing railings, the style will not replicate the current geometric design and instead have simple horizontal balusters. Staff had previously asked for the replacement railings to replicate the existing design with modifications, such as a thin grill located on the interior of the railing, to make the railing code compliant while maintaining the distinctive character of the railings.

A discussion of the relevant ordinance sections follows:

41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.
 - (a) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned residential use that are located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
 - 1. Height. N/A
 - 2. Landscape treatment. The proposed scope of work includes regrading the site to introduce positive drainage. The changes will not significantly alter the character of the site.
 - 3. Rhythm of mass and spaces. N/A
 - (b) There are no proposed changes to proportion and rhythm of solids to voids.
 - (c) This property is addressed off of Spaight, but is accessed from Rutledge, which orients the length of the building as the primary façade facing the street. The proposal is to retain materials where possible, but much of the concrete, some of the brick, and most of the railings have failed to the point of requiring replacement. The proposal is to retain

original materials where possible. The character-defining railings are proposed to be replaced with a new design that does not replicate the current appearance.

- (d) The only proposed changes to the roof are to repair flashing and seal locations where water is infiltrating the wall system. Changes to the roof will not be apparent from the pedestrian line of site.
- (e) No proposed changes to door and window sizes.

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness could be met and recommends that the Landmarks Commission approve the project with the following conditions:

1. Final railing specifications to be approved by staff