

Regarding: 423 North Carroll Street – Mansion Hill Historic District – Installation of replacement windows. 2nd Ald. District
Contact: Jaclyn Skjervem, Steve Brown Apartments
Legistar #29257

Date: March 11, 2013
Prepared By: Amy Scanlon, Preservation Planner

General Information:

The Applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for window replacement at the property located at 423 North Carroll Street in the Mansion Hill Historic District. The property is also located within the Mansion Hill National Register Historic District.

Relevant Landmarks Ordinance sections:

- 33.19(10)(d) Regulation of Construction, Reconstruction, Exterior Alteration and Demolition.
 The Commission shall act in these matters specifically as they regard the Mansion Hill Historic District in the manner specified by Madison General Ordinance, Sections 33.19(5)(b) and (c).

- 33.19(5)(b) Regulation of Construction, Reconstruction and Exterior Alteration.
 - 1. [Not applicable for Landmarks Commission review.]
 - 2. [Not applicable for Landmarks Commission review.]
 - 3. [Not applicable for Landmarks Commission review.]
 - 4. Upon filing of any application with the Landmarks Commission, the Landmarks Commission shall determine:
 - a. Whether, in the case of a designated landmark or landmark site, the proposed work would detrimentally change, destroy or adversely affect any exterior architectural feature of the improvement upon which said work is to be done; and
 - b. Whether, in the case of the construction of a new improvement upon a landmark site, the exterior of such improvement would adversely affect or not harmonize with the external appearance of other neighboring improvements on such site; and
 - c. Whether, in the case of any property located in an Historic District designated pursuant to the terms of Subsection (6)(d) hereunder, the proposed construction, reconstruction or exterior alteration does not conform to the objectives and design criteria of the historic preservation plan for said district as duly adopted by the Common Council.
 - 5. [Not applicable for Landmarks Commission review.]
 - 6. [Not applicable for Landmarks Commission review.]

- 33.19(5)(c) Regulation of Demolition.
 [Not applicable for Landmarks Commission review.]

Staff Evaluation and Recommendations:

The Landmarks Commission typically requests that property owners repair the original wood sash and install new weather-stripping and new storm/screen units before seeking approval for replacement windows especially when the property is located in a National Register Historic District and tax credits

may be available for the repair. In this case, the property is an income producing property and the property owner would have to submit a project that is based on the financial formula specified by the State Historic Preservation Office which includes the adjusted value of the property.

Staff believes that the proposed window replacements will alter the exterior appearance of the building by removing presumably original wood sash. It is possible that the sash or windows are not original so this request may be to replace units that are already replacements. The proposed replacement units shall be one over one double hung units to match the existing windows, but they will fit differently in the frame and provide less glass (more frame) than the existing. In addition, the vinyl replacement units typically require replacement in 10-20 years.

In response to 33.19(10)(d) which references 33.19(5)(b) and (c), Staff finds that only 33.19(5)(b)4.c is applicable. Staff believes that the window replacements will be compatible with the overall historic appearance of the property which is in general conformance with the objectives and design criteria of the Landmarks Ordinance. Conversely, Staff believes that the window replacements will destroy potentially historic fabric by removing the windows and alter the appearance of the building by reducing the amount of visible glass which is not in conformance with the objectives and design criteria of the Landmarks Ordinance.

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the replacement of windows are not met and recommends that the Landmarks Commission not approve the request. However, if the Commission, after hearing from the Applicant, finds that the project meets the standards, they may grant a Certificate of Appropriateness.