

EVALUATION PANEL REPORT

RFP 10084-0-2021-AM
Madison Senior Center Courtyard
January 20th, 2022

Introduction

The City of Madison solicited proposals from qualified vendors. The following proposed:

1. Design Studio Etc.
2. GRAEF-USA Inc.
3. Saiki Design Inc.

Please reference the RFP for additional information.

Summary of Evaluation Panel Activity

1. Panel members first conducted evaluations of proposals independently based on the pre-established criteria determined by the panel. Then, the panel met to discuss all qualitative and quantitative aspects of the proposals and overall ratings as a group. Purchasing staff rated the cost section of the proposals.

Below is a summary of the scoring:

Section	Max Points	Design Studio Etc.	GRAEF-USA Inc.	Saiki Design Inc.
Project Qualifications	30	19.00	20.25	26.00
Technical Qualifications	35	26.38	26.75	34.63
Cost	30	24.87	30.00	20.32
Local Vendor	5	0.00	0.00	5.00
Total	100	70.24	77.00	85.94

Based on the scoring, the panel felt comfortable selecting the top scoring vendor, as the awarded vendor.

2. Final Selection of the Panel: Saiki Design Inc.
3. Local Preference

Was the outcome of this bid changed by the local purchasing ordinance? ___ Yes X No

4. Evaluation Panel Meetings:

12/13/2021	Distribution of Proposals
12/31/2021	Discussion of proposals and question clarification
01/04/2022	Review of scoring and selection of winning vendor
01/20/2022	Updated Calculations

5. Cost Proposal Scoring (Finance)

	30	Design Studio Etc	GRAEF	Saiki Design Inc
PHASE 1	COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT AND DESIGN DEVELOPMENT	\$36,450.00	\$24,424.00	\$36,030.00
PHASE 2	CONSTRUCTION DOCUMENTS AND PUBLIC WORKS BIDDING	\$ 36,435.00	\$41,347.00	\$55,260.00
PHASE 3	CONSTRUCTION OBSERVATION	\$ 26,485.00	\$16,602.00	\$30,350.00
NOT REQUIRED	STRUCTURAL ASSESSMENT AND DESIGN SUPPORT (CONSULTANT FIRM)		\$5,468.00	
NOT REQUIRED	IRRIGATION DESIGN			\$10,550.00
	Total	\$99,370.00	\$82,373.00	\$121,640.00
	Cost Score (Total \$)	24.87	30.00	20.32
	Total with extra costs:		\$87,841.00	\$132,190.00

6. Scoring (Finance)

A small error was found in the initial scoring calculations. This error affected all of the vendors' technical scores. Fixing it results in higher scores for all, but does not change the outcome of the RFP - Saiki Design, Inc. remains the highest scoring proposer.

**ATTACHMENT NO. 1
SCOPE OF SERVICES
MADISON SENIOR CENTER COURTYARD RECONSTRUCTION
RFP #10084-0-2021-AM**

In this Attachment No. 1; the word “City” means City of Madison, Wisconsin. The word “Consultant” means the licensed design professional consultant team and the word “General Building Contractor” means the entity responsible for the courtyard’s construction; and the word “Project” shall mean the Madison Senior Center Courtyard Reconstruction.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

PROJECT INTRODUCTION..... 2
GENERAL REQUIREMENTS..... 2
PHASE 1: PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT AND DESIGN DEVELOPMENT..... 4
PHASE 2: CONSTRUCTION DOCUMENTS AND PUBLIC WORKS BIDDING..... 6
PHASE 3: CONSTRUCTION ADMINISTRATION..... 8
PERSONNEL (CITY)..... 10
PROPOSED PROJECT MILESTONES..... 11
PAYMENT SCHEDULE..... 11
REQUIRED INFORMATION AND CONTENT OF PROPOSALS..... 12

PROJECT INTRODUCTION

The City of Madison Parks Division seeks proposals from qualified professional consultant teams for public engagement, design services, and construction oversight of the Madison Senior Center Courtyard Reconstruction project. The project is located at 330 W. Mifflin Street, and the City of Madison is transferring the Madison Senior Center courtyard to the Parks Division to serve as a public park. To function as a public park, the space requires reconstruction to address deferred maintenance issues.

The Madison Senior Center and associated courtyard were constructed in the early 1980s. The project area is approximately 20,400 square feet and includes planters, benches, tables, paving, bollard lights, pole lighting, existing trees, and shrubs. Multi-story buildings surround the courtyard - the Madison Senior Center to the east and south and the Capitol Centre apartment complex to the north. The Capitol Centre Market is west of the project area. Public access to the courtyard is via public access easements over private property with connections to W. Dayton Street and W. Mifflin Street. A City-owned, at-grade connection to the courtyard from the public right of way does not exist. An existing storm sewer system conveys stormwater captured in the project area to a structure on the Capitol Centre Market property.

Over the last several decades, the courtyard's paving and furnishings have deteriorated due to use and age. The pavement has cracked and settled. Site amenities are worn and in need of repair. In 2018, the Senior Center agreed to transfer the courtyard to the Parks Division as a public park. The change in use to a public park partially addresses the shortage of public green space in downtown Madison. The Madison Senior Center Courtyard reconstruction is an opportunity to improve the quality of the space and announce the courtyard as a new public park.

The Parks Division is seeking consultant teams with community engagement and public plaza design experience. The project includes site paving, amenities, furnishings, signage, lighting, stormwater management, storm sewer design, cost estimating, and construction observation. The following sections outline Consultant responsibilities for the three project phases:

- Phase 1 – Community Engagement and Design Development
- Phase 2 – Construction Documents and Public Works Bidding
- Phase 3 – Construction Observation

GENERAL REQUIREMENTS

1. The Consultant shall balance the goals of the community while also meeting City agency needs throughout all phases of the project.
2. Communication
 - a. The Consultant should have any ambiguities or conflicts in this document clarified in writing by the City Project Manager prior to beginning design.
 - b. All dealings between the City and the Consultant with respect to the subject matter of the Agreement shall be with the City's Project Manager.
 - i. The City's Project Manager shall inform the Consultant as to groups and staff with which it is to consult, provide prompt evaluation of requests of such groups, examine documents and receive inquiries submitted by the Consultant, refer information and requests submitted by the Consultant to appropriate officials, departments and bodies and obtain or render decisions promptly with respect thereto so as to avoid delays in the work of the Consultant.

agencies as necessary. Materials include storm water modeling calculations, erosion control permitting, stormwater permitting, and all necessary documentation for building permit issuance

- iii. The Consultant shall be familiar with the City of Madison Site Plan Approval process and the submittal standards. Information is found at:
<https://www.cityofmadison.com/development-services-center/other-residential/parking-lot-site-plan>

10. Program Space Standard

- a. The space standards to be utilized shall be common industry wide space standards.

11. Health and Safety

- a. The Consultant must take a systems approach to risk management, utilizing codes, regulations, guidelines, and best practices to identify and mitigate health and safety risks early in the design phases of the of the project.
- b. If a hazard cannot be eliminated, the associated risk must be reduced to an acceptable level through design, the risk must be reduced to an acceptable level using engineering controls, protective safety features, or devices.
- c. If safety devices do not adequately lower the risk of the hazard, cautions and warnings must be provided using detection and warning systems, as appropriate.
- d. Improvements must be designed for ease of operation and cost-effective maintenance and repair.
- e. The Consultant must collaborate with the City operations and maintenance personnel during design development to provide for optimal life-cycle performance.

PHASE 1 – COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT AND DESIGN DEVELOPMENT

Community engagement shall include public meetings (both virtual and in-person), comment cards, stakeholder group meetings, and an online public survey. The Consultant is responsible for preparing the overall engagement approach, timeline and design development materials. The project requires Urban Design Commission (UDC) and Plan Commission (PC) design review. The Consultant shall incorporate UDC and PC reviews in the project’s design development timeline, noting submittal deadlines and preparing the necessary submittal materials.

The City will assist with Alder and neighborhood association correspondence, postcard notifications, social media announcements, and managing the online survey. The Consultant shall be responsible for providing the following services as part of the Community Engagement and Design Development phase:

- 1. The Consultant shall collect and analyze all existing information pertinent to the project. The City shall provide the following:
 - a. Site survey in AutoCAD format
 - b. Existing tree inventory and assessment completed by a certified Arborist
- 2. The Consultant shall review and be familiar with the City of Madison Zoning Code requirements and standards.
- 3. The Consultant shall meet with City staff to review the initial list of potential improvements to the Madison Senior Center Courtyard, which includes, but is not limited to:
 - a. Replacement of all concrete walk, retaining walls and seating
 - b. Replacement of existing lighting fixtures; including pole and bollard lighting

- c. Signage and site features to identify the space as a public park
 - d. Replacement of existing courtyard storm sewer system; including all inlets, connections and piping
 - e. Protection and accommodation of existing building area wells (see Attachment 2 – Site Survey).
 - f. Providing emergency egress routes from building entrances to the courtyard
 - g. Evaluation of existing trees for preservation/removal
4. The Consultant shall provide a proposed project schedule and community engagement approach. The minimum number of engagement meetings includes:
 - a. Three (3) virtual community meetings
 - b. Two (2) in-person stakeholder meetings held at the Madison Senior Center
 5. The Consultant shall provide public meeting notes and presentation materials for posting to the Parks Division website after each engagement meeting.
 6. The Consultant shall provide materials and content for a corresponding online survey. The City will assist with managing the survey site and uploading materials.
 7. The Consultant shall prepare, develop and refine courtyard design options throughout the community engagement process. This includes all plans, details, perspectives and renderings necessary to convey the project design intent.
 8. The Consultant shall anticipate a minimum of two (2) submittals/presentations to the UDC (initial and final), and one (1) submittal/presentation to the Plan Commission. UDC and PC submittal requirements are located here:
<https://www.cityofmadison.com/dpced/planning/urban-design-commission/1578/>
 9. The project construction budget is anticipated to be \$700,000 to \$800,000. Construction funding is dependent on future City of Madison Common Council authorization, and shall be informed by cost estimates prepared by the Consultant. During design development, the Consultant shall maintain a running cost estimate of proposed improvements.
 10. At the completion of design development, the Consultant’s third-party estimator shall provide a final construction cost estimate (at DD stage) prior to Public Works bidding.
 11. The project is within a Planned Development (PD) zoning district. Planned Developments require recording final plans for proposed improvements with City Zoning. The Consultant shall prepare the necessary materials for project recording with Zoning, more information on recording requirements is found here:
<https://www.cityofmadison.com/dpced/planning/development/437/>

DELIVERABLES

The Consultant shall be responsible for providing the following deliverables as part of the Community Engagement and Design Development phase:

1. The Consultant shall prepare design presentation materials for: three (3) virtual community meetings, and two (2) in-person stakeholder meetings held at the Madison Senior Center.

2. The Consultant shall provide content and presentation materials for a corresponding on-line survey.
3. The Consultant shall prepare preliminary estimates and budget projections for the proposed improvements.
4. The Consultant shall describe the necessary improvements or reuse of site utilities (e.g. electrical, storm, etc) for the proposed improvements.
5. The Consultant shall provide public engagement and design development materials to the City in the following formats:

Programming and Facility Master Plan Required Submittals
Electronic file (Word, PDF format) of all design development materials
Electronic file (Word, PDF format) of all meeting notes
Electronic file (PDF format, AutoCAD format) of the final courtyard design
Estimate of Potential Cost for courtyard construction in Excel format (includes updates throughout design development)

PHASE 2 – CONSTRUCTION DOCUMENTS AND PUBLIC WORKS BIDDING

The Consultant shall develop all applicable plans and specifications necessary for the bidding and construction of the proposed courtyard improvements. The Consultant shall provide all necessary materials for construction permitting.

The Consultant shall be responsible for providing the following services as part of the Construction Documents and Public Works Bidding:

1. Design services shall include but not be limited to the following:
 - a. Hardscape improvements for pedestrian, bicycle and service vehicles.
 - b. Courtyard amenities (seating, signage, planters, potential playground feature, etc).
 - c. Water service design (piping, connections, fixtures, etc.).
 - d. Lighting design (fixture schedules, timers and controls, footing design, load requirements, etc.).
 - e. Electrical design (connections, transformers, etc.).
 - f. Stormwater drainage and collection (inlets, structures, piping, connections, volume calculations, etc.).
 - g. Landscape design (plant species, locations, hardiness, root condition, container size, etc.).
 - h. Potential playground installation (equipment, surfacing, drainage system, border timbers, etc.).
2. The Consultant must coordinate with the applicable utility entities (Madison Gas and Electric, City Water Utility, etc.) to determine capabilities, structure options, and associated costs to the project.
3. The Consultant shall provide review plans to the City at approximately 75%, and 100% completion of the construction documents.
 - a. At each review submittal stage, the Consultant shall provide a revised estimate of construction costs in Excel format.

- b. Plans shall be prepared in strict compliance with all local and state codes, ordinances, laws and policies, and in accordance with City of Madison Public Works Contracts.
- c. The Consultant is responsible for coordinating with other City of Madison agencies during the design process.
- d. Requirements and coordination with other agencies includes but is not limited to City Engineering, Zoning, Traffic Engineering and Real Estate.
- e. 75% plans shall include both plans and specifications for review.

DELIVERABLES

The Consultant shall be responsible for providing the following deliverables as part of the Construction Documents and Public Works Bidding phase:

1. Site Drawings and Specifications
 - a. Site demolition and erosion control plans.
 - b. Construction staging and access plans.
 - c. Dimensioned layout plans (limits of construction, new pavement, planting areas, site amenities, light pole and bollard locations, etc).
 - d. Site details (walls, benches, curbs, playground equipment, etc.)
 - e. Site restoration plan (landscape design, plant schedule, erosion control, irrigation system, etc).
 - f. Emergency access plan (fire access lanes, emergency egress routes, clear zones, hose pull extents, etc.)
2. Civil Drawings and Specifications
 - a. Site grading and drainage plan (existing and new contours .5 ft. interval minimum, spot elevations at all entrances and elsewhere as necessary, percent slopes and cross slopes, elevations for walls, all surface drainage structures).
 - b. Storm sewer (demolition, new connections, piping, structures and inlets)
3. Structural Drawings and Specifications
 - a. Demolition plans.
 - b. Wall and footing details
 - c. Full set of structural construction drawings (Drawings must be fully dimensioned, noted and detailed for accurate bidding and construction).
4. Electrical Drawings and Specifications:
 - a. Single-line diagram of primary and secondary power distribution.
 - b. Site plan (service connections, manholes, piping and fixture locations).
 - c. Equipment schedules (fixtures, control equipment, panel boards.)
 - d. Layout of electrical equipment
 - e. Grounding diagram.
 - f. Voltage drop calculations.
5. The Consultant shall provide the final construction plans sealed by a Professional Engineer and/or Architect, as appropriate, registered in the State of Wisconsin, and suitable for bidding the project and obtaining any necessary permits to construct the project.
6. The Consultant shall provide the final construction documents to the City in the following formats:

Required Submittals
Electronic .pdf copy of all permit applications and submittal materials
Electronic .pdf copy of plans at the 75%, 100% and final construction bid documents, final construction bid documents shall include both 11"x17" .pdf plans and 22"x34" .pdf plans
Auto CAD file of the final site plan, including utility locations
Microsoft Word 2007 copy of final construction bid specifications
Microsoft Excel file of quantities and proposal information for incorporation into the final bid package
Electronic Word and .pdf file of all addenda

PUBLIC WORKS BIDDING

The Consultant shall be responsible for providing the following services as part of the project bidding process:

1. The Consultant, following the City's approval of the Construction Documents and the latest construction estimate; and the City's declaration of its intent to put the project out for bidding, shall assist the City in preparation and assembly of the final standard City contract specifications.
2. The BPW contract front end will be prepared by the City's Project Manager and shall include statements relating to advertising for bid, instructions to bidders, small business enterprise program information, bid bond, agreement, payment bond, performance bond, prevailing wage rates, and Best Value Contracting.
3. The Consultant shall prepare the contract Special Provisions, including all specifications necessary for construction of the proposed improvements.
4. The Consultant shall develop the proposal page, including all bid quantities. The format shall follow the City of Madison - Standard Specifications for Public Works Construction, including bid items, numbers and quantity measurements.
5. The City will provide printing and distribution of documents to prospective bidders.
6. The Consultant shall attend pre-bid conference meeting.
7. The Consultant shall answer questions during contract posting and contract negotiations and develop addendums promptly in order to give bidders sufficient time to adjust bids. No design-related addendum shall be submitted past one week before bids are received.
8. Upon receipt and acknowledgment of lowest responsible bidder the Consultant will update the bidding set to incorporate all changes that occurred during the bid set. The revised set must be completed in an expeditious manner.
9. The Consultant shall provide electronic digital drawing files for the General Building Contractor and its subcontractors to use as may be necessary during design and construction of the project.
10. Contract posting, bid opening, and General Contractor selection will be provided by the City and the Board of Public Works.

11. Should the total bid for all work exceed the estimated probable costs of construction by more than fifteen (15) percent, the City shall have the discretion to require the Consultant to revise the design at no additional cost to the City, whether or not the City ultimately decides to complete the project according to the redrafted plans or the original plans.

PHASE 3 - CONSTRUCTION ADMINISTRATION

The Consultant shall be responsible for providing the following services as part of the Construction Administration phase:

1. The construction phase will commence with the award of the construction contract and will terminate when the Common Council accepts the construction.
2. The Consultant shall attend a pre-construction meeting held by the City with the General Contractor and their sub-contractors.
3. All communication and filing shall be primarily electronically. The City will receive a set of all submittal documents in electronic and hard copy form. Electronic files shall be in universal format (i.e. PDF) and in the design tool specific file format.
4. The Consultant, and when appropriate to the progress of the project any sub-consultants, shall attend field project meetings. The Consultant shall conduct the meetings and shall prepare minutes of the meetings. Such meetings shall be held at regular intervals (bi-weekly minimum) and as required by the City.
5. The Consultant shall make periodic visits to the site at least once per week and more often as necessary to maintain familiarity generally with the progress and quality of the work and to determine in general if the work is proceeding in accordance with the contract documents.
6. The Consultant shall inspect field installation of critical design features and elements were installed as intended per design. This includes pre-installation meetings, inspection of mockups, and inspection of partial builds during construction.
7. The Consultant shall review (for conformance with the construction documents) and take other appropriate action upon the General Building Contractor's submittals such as shop drawings, product data, and samples and make recommendations regarding such to the City.
8. The Consultant shall work with the General Contractor, City, and Madison Senior Center to resolve questions, conflicts and unforeseen situations. The Consultant shall prepare, reproduce, and distribute supplemental drawings, specifications, and interpretations in response to requests for clarification by General Building Contractor or the City.
9. The Consultant shall prepare, reproduce, and distribute drawings and specifications with revisions to describe work to be added, deleted, or modified.
10. The Consultant shall review all change order requests, provide determination to City, and present proposed changes to the board of public works for approval. Such documents shall be prepared in a timely manner.

11. The Consultant shall communicate with the City on design and construction related issues and shall not issue documents or give instructions to the General Building Contractor without knowledge and approval of the City. Documents received by the Consultant from the General Building Contractor shall be shared with the City. The City maintains the right to object to instructions or approvals.
12. Based on construction observations at the site and on the General Building Contractor's applications for payment, the Consultant shall assist the City to determine the amount owing to the General Building Contractor by verifying and approving quantities of work put in place on the General Building Contractor's application for payment. The Consultant shall assist in determining the dates of completion, substantiated by creation and distribution of punch lists.
13. The Consultant shall report to the Board of Public Works and other entities on all claims of the City or General Building Contractor relating to the execution and progress of the work and on all other matters or questions related thereto.
14. The Consultant shall receive and review written guarantees and related documents assembled by the General Building Contractor, and shall transmit said data to the City's designated representative who will prepare the final certificate for payment.
15. The Consultant's punch list review shall be conducted with the City Project Manager to check conformance of the construction work with the requirements of the contract documents and to verify the accuracy and completeness of the list of submitted items by the General Building Contractor of construction work to be completed or corrected.
16. The Consultant shall review and approve for accuracy and completeness, the General Building Contractors submission of "record" drawings and operations and maintenance manuals and transmit same to the City prior to certification of the General Building Contractors application for final payment.
17. At the end of the project the Consultant will prepare electronic as-built drawings based on field observations and the General Building Contractor's markup.
18. Warranty period is considered construction phase for the purpose of the Consultant assisting in resolving issues that are design or installation related.

Required Submittals
Electronic .pdf copy of all construction observation reports and submittal reviews
Auto CAD file of the final plans with as-built revisions

PERSONNEL (CITY)

A core group of City staff will comprise the main design team for the City of Madison. Each staff member represents specific areas of design or construction knowledge and also includes the prime contact for the owner agency. In addition the owner agency may provide additional staff as needed for design and functionality requirements of specific areas. The Consultant may be directed to other City staff regarding specific requirements of the design including but not limited to storm water management, fire protection, safety, facility maintenance, enclosure, and finishes.

Additional consultants may be hired by the City to perform independent verification of various aspects of the design or provide support to the design as needed.

The Consultant shall transmit all PROJECT information to the following City Project Manager:

Name: Michael Sturm, Landscape Architect
 Address: Parks Division
 City-County Building, Room 104
 210 Martin Luther King, Jr. Blvd.
 Madison, WI 53703
 Phone: (608) 267-4921
 E-mail: msturm@cityofmadison.com

PROPOSED PROJECT MILESTONES

Consultant Contract Award	January 3, 2022
Phase 1 - Start of Community Engagement and Design Development	January 17, 2022
Phase 2 – Start of Construction Documents	July 1, 2022
Phase 2 75% Construction Documents Due	September 1, 2022
Phase 2 100% Construction Documents Due	October 1, 2022
Phase 2 Bidding	Oct - Nov, 2022
Phase 3 Start of Construction	March 15, 2023
Phase 3 Construction Completion	November 15, 2023

PAYMENT SCHEDULE

Each month, the Consultant may submit for payment of those services defined in the “Scope of Services” section of this Agreement that have been satisfactorily completed. The Consultant shall provide a statement listing the names of individuals who worked on the services provided pursuant to this Agreement, the category of work, the number of hours worked and their hourly rates. The Consultant’s invoice shall be calculated in accordance with the submitted fee schedule, which shall be attached and made part of the Agreement. After review and acceptance by the City Project Manager, the City shall issue a payment for those invoiced services. All cost records by the Consultant including, but not limited to, payroll time sheets, payroll receipts, invoices and vouchers shall be available for inspection by a representative of the City upon request. Final payment shall be withheld (not less than 10 percent) until all deliverables have been completed and accepted by the City.

The amount listed in Section 23, COMPENSATION, shall not be exceeded without prior written approval of the City Project Manager.

No itemized expenses. Expenses including but not limited to travel, telephone, data communications, reproductions, postage and delivery, and other similar direct project-related expenditures by the Consultant, are included in the total contract price under Paragraph 23 of the Contract for Purchase of Services.

REQUIRED INFORMATION AND CONTENT OF PROPOSALS

To assist the City with the evaluation of the proposals, each proposal shall use the following format:

Statement of Qualifications

A brief description of the firm submitting the proposal, including: full business name, legal status (corporate, partnership or sole proprietor), number and type of employees, specialties, and longevity. List similar projects and the specific personnel who worked on them that are proposed to work on this project. Include past projects name and client, year completed, dollar amount and contact information of a person at the entity the work was performed for that possess direct knowledge of the referenced project.

Project Team Members

List any specialties and or strengths that make the Consultant and the personnel assigned to this project uniquely suited to the task of performing the work as outlined in the RFP. Provide an organizational chart of employees proposed to work on this project, including the City Project Manager who would be assigned to the project and who shall be the City's main point of contact with the Consultant. This shall include a listing of each individual's relevant experience in regard to the tasks and responsibilities they would perform in this project.

Project Schedule and Approach

The Consultant shall provide a detailed proposed project schedule based upon the draft schedule provided in the RFP, depicting the start and completion time for each of the work scope items. This shall include a detailed description of the Consultant's proposed approach, scope of services, and timeline to complete each task.

Cost and Payment Schedule

The Consultant shall provide an itemized fee proposal for the work, including estimated hours per task and billing rates for all personnel to be assigned to the project. The City retains the right to omit or negotiate changes to work pending final.

Scoring will be weighted as follows:

- 5% for Local Vendor Preference
- 30% for Project Overview Qualifications
- 35% for Technical Qualifications
- 30% for Cost

End of Attachment No. 1