

AGENDA # 4

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION

PRESENTED: August 22, 2012

TITLE: 306 West Main Street – PUD(GDP-SIP) –
11-Story Apartment Building. 4th Ald. Dist.
(27412)

REFERRED:

REREFERRED:

REPORTED BACK:

AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary

ADOPTED:

POF:

DATED: August 22, 2012

ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Richard Wagner, Richard Slayton, Marsha Rummel, Dawn O’Kroley, John Harrington, Cliff Goodhart, Dawn O’Kroley and Melissa Huggins.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of August 22, 2012, the Urban Design Commission **RECEIVED AN INFORMATIONAL PRESENTATION** for a PUD(GDP-SIP) located at 306 West Main Street. Appearing on behalf of the project were Joe Alexander, John Seamon, Jeremy Frommelt and Adam Winkler, all representing The Alexander Company; Bill White, representing 306 West Main, LLC; Jonathan Cooper, representing the Bassett District Neighborhood Steering Committee; and Rosemary Lee. The Secretary stated that the City Design Team had issue with the building being primarily metal (various types) and would recommend a broader palette of materials, as well as a diversity of unit types. Alexander began the presentation of this decades-old project by giving a brief history of the neighborhood and what has been built in recent times. The concrete structure has been ripped down to its skin, widened with steel towards West Washington and Henry Street, and built a steel annex. Underground parking extends all the way from 309 West Main Street to 306 West Main Street. The building is proposed for 176 units with changes being sought in zoning for the massing. Changes include condominiums to apartments; number of units from 146 to 176; and the removal of the proposed pedestrian bridge for lack of function. He further stated that one way to attract young professionals is to offer 1 and 2-bedroom units, that way you are not renting to 6 unrelated individuals. In their experience at 309, the 3-bedrooms have not attracted families; they have mostly chosen the 2-bedrooms. They have had one neighborhood meeting and two steering committee meetings on this project with the Bassett Neighborhood and the owners of Capitol West. Suggestions from those groups included an electric car port, a dog washing station and a bicycle maintenance area, all of which are now being looked at. There are disagreements over the bridge, and questions about how many street lights will be put in, and concern about parking large tractor trailers when people move in or out. Seamon further detailed design elements of the project including a private terrace for guests and residents. He also reiterated that the massing for the project has not changed and has already been approved. The massing for the project would be at 11-stories, two at 5-stories, and the annex at 7-stories. He showed access points for vehicular ingress and egress which include two levels of underground parking and tie into the existing parking structure. The terrace is accessed via a ramp from the sidewalk as well as stair access. There is a community room and a fitness room, and will accommodate 142 one-bedrooms and 34 two-bedrooms. As of now there are no plans for the roof. Four primary materials (not including the fenestration) will

include burnished masonry block in large size with some degree of reflectivity, a corrugated metal panel, horizontal metal panel and a joint lap horizontal metal panel in slightly different color schemes and textures. The balconies are articulated in a play with light and shadow, as well as the three types of metal panels. All the units have balconies with 70% as walk-outs and 30% as French balconies with the intent of being crisp and clean. The balconies will also include natural gas for grills. The interiors will all be hardwood floors, stainless steel appliances, granite countertops and gas fireplaces. The large screens from the Catholic church property next door are being reincorporated into the exterior elements particularly at the terrace and the flip side.

Comments and questions from the Commission were as follows:

- How do the metal panels relate to 309, in terms of texture and color?
 - 309 has corrugated metal panel in a terra cotta bronze/copper. That profile is an example here. One of the panels we're using here is like a lap siding but it's flush, so it's not typical. 309 has a hardi-lap, so we're getting that kind of look but using panel instead of what was on 309. It would be really helpful next time if we could see them together.
- The lower roof decks, the terraces, they look strong enough to hold smaller trees.
 - Potted plants for sure. Along with that, because they're so visible will you have guidelines for plantings or is that completely up to the tenant? It's almost a feature of the building. The greater likelihood is that we'll end up with built-in planters. Is there any thought on a green roof? It's been kicked around but at this moment it's not fully planned.
- How do you anticipate using your building to capture water?
 - This building still is within the original GDP. The original stormwater management plan that was done for the whole block, we're just tying into exactly that. It would be good to bring that back for a refresher.
- The balconies – are they concrete floor slab or separate material?
 - Separate, we're not exactly settled on what material. We've been looking at a few different options. So they'll appear somewhat more hung on the building than an extension? Yes. There's a tie here.
- The one-bedrooms with the office/den extra space is great. It would distinguish it from other unit types.
- I think this project is nice, I really like it. I like the metal skin, the different panels. One thing I would like is to see the cost of doing a green roof. Heat is one factor, but stormwater is a huge thing. Mitigating that green vegetation really helps the City. Have you looked at gray water?
 - We have looked at tying in some of the roof water for irrigation, it's still in process.
- The moving vans, I don't know what the statistics are for turnaround in a normal year, but be prepared for down the road that you know where people will load and unload so all of the sudden you don't have traffic problems.
 - We plan to rent to professionals who will not all have the same lease dates. Turn over for poorly run housing is at about 50-60% turnover per year. Well-run housing is 40-50% per year.
- I think a lot has changed since your GDP was originally approved. If you're appealing to that luxury market and want to be cutting edge, I'd ask you to look at LEED and see what the differences are. Everyone is doing Silver; look beyond. It seems like some of those first floor units – what are the screening options? Look at the Henry Street experience at the first floor.
 - I would encourage you to walk the 309 property, as well as Washington Place. You really get a flavor for what that street experience is and this basically mimics that. It's close, pedestrian-friendly, an urban experience.

- 309 was featured on a tour when the Congress of New Urbanism was here. It's tough challenge, knowing your neighbors and the passers-by, versus not wanting to know them. You'll see landscaping here, whether it's tall grasses or something else to provide some screening here.
- The all metal versus all brick – if this were all brick we wouldn't question that. Maybe it's because the window openings aren't yet articulated. There are things you can do with metal to bring a little depth or shadow to it. Look at articulation of window openings; heads and sills to offset metal versus brick issue, including adding heft in door openings and strategize openings for utilities.
- The idea of balconies, do you want people to control the idea of pulling down a screen on their balcony that allows people control of their own environment?
 - That's really tricky from a management standpoint.
 - The fenestration becomes visually minimized based on perspective. But when you look at the elevation and the sheer number of openings there it tells a different story.
- I would suggest maybe you don't need so many different proportions of windows.
- Be careful about how much exposed fastener metal you have.
- Regarding the balconies, let's say I want to sit out there but I want shade. Do I buy a market rate umbrella that doesn't do the building justice, or will you incorporate some type of arbor that's in keeping with the building that I can sit under. Think about that in your next steps.
- That's strong sunlight coming from the southeast and that's just the windows.
 - Other than double glazing, that's where we're at. Window blinds will help.

Rosemary Lee spoke in support. She stated that there is no reason to think that tenants are going to be moving in and out all on the same date, thereby blocking the street from vehicles (emergency or otherwise). How many apartment dwellers need a tractor trailer to move their items? In terms of the bridge construction, some of the neighborhood steering committee members think The Alexander Company should be forced to build the bridge; she does not. The area's Alder has spoken with residents at 309 and they don't feel the bridge is necessary. This will bring "good tenants downtown that will help to stabilize the neighborhood," she thinks the plans are wonderful and downtown needs more residents to add to the tax base.

Jonathan Cooper spoke in support. The proposal has been very well received by the neighborhood so far. They are still working on some details, but by and large it's been well received. Things they like include use of materials, the building recognizes 309 without trying to replicate it. The bridge has come up in discussions; the issue at this point is for steering committee members who have been involved with this project since the beginning. He recognized that the bridge doesn't really work and may not be necessary.

ACTION:

Since this was an **INFORMATIONAL PRESENTATION** no formal action was taken by the Commission.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 7, 7 and 8.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 306 West Main Street

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	7	6	6	7	7	7	8	7
	6	7	-	-	-	6	7	7
	6	8	-	-	-	7	9	8
	-	7	-	-	-	-	-	-

General Comments:

- Pay attention to differing proportions of openings, exercise restraint in number of different metal panel types (avoid exposed fasteners). Look to previous phase for integration of magicpak exterior grilles.
- Good start and discussion.
- Nice project at informational but needs a green roof.
- Like it so far; concerned about final look of hung balconies and material contrast.