



Project Name/Address: 130 E Gilman Street, Executive Residence

Application Type: Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations

Legistar File ID # [47422](#)

Prepared By: Amy L. Scanlon, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

Date Prepared: August 6, 2017

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Robert Klebba

Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to convert the former Governor’s Mansion to an 8-room hotel with an event space and café, including the addition of an accessible entrance on the west side of the building, and the creation of additional parking spaces at a landmark site in the Mansion Hill historic district.

Background Information

Parcel Location: The subject landmark site is located in the Mansion Hill Historic District.

Relevant Landmarks Ordinance Sections:

- 41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.** A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.
- (1) New construction or exterior alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
 - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City’s historic resources.

Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation

1. A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships.
2. The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.

3. Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.
4. Changes to a property that have acquired historic significance in their own right will be retained and preserved.
5. Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.
6. Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.
7. Chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible. Treatments that cause damage to historic materials will not be used.
8. Archeological resources will be protected and preserved in place. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures will be undertaken.
9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work will be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.
10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

Analysis and Conclusion

The proposal came before the Landmarks Commission on June 5, 2017 for an Informational Presentation to discuss the need to rezone the property to Planned Development (PD) to accommodate an 8 room hotel which is not permitted in the current zoning district. The Landmarks Commission discussed the rezoning and the action report of the discussion was forwarded to the Urban Design Commission and the Plan Commission.

The Applicant is now before the Landmarks Commission to request a Certificate of Appropriateness for the exterior alterations on a landmark site. The alterations to the landmark site include the addition of parking stalls and other landscape features, the construction of an accessible path to the side porch, and the installation of exhaust fans and mechanical equipment louvers. The proposed work requires minimal change to distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships.

The Applicant explained to staff that the proposed method to create an accessible path to the side porch is to make an earth berm and pour a concrete sidewalk on the berm to attach to the existing side porch. The berm can then be obscured with plantings. The Applicant will hold the concrete away from the original sandstone foundation and use geotextiles and other methods to protect the foundation from freeze thaw cycles and issues related to holding moisture against the building wall. The Applicant has not addressed how the earth berm will connect to the frame porch structure or if any alterations to the porch will be necessary to accommodate to different relationship with grade.

The majority of the bathrooms have exhaust vents that will exit the building through ganged eave penetrations. The first floor bathroom currently vents on the northeast elevation. The 2 new general restrooms, kitchen, laundry, and Caretaker's kitchenette and bathroom will require exhaust vents. The kitchen has a commercial exhaust hood that currently vents above a window on the northeast elevation.

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting the Certificate of Appropriateness for the exterior alterations may be met and recommends approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness with the condition of approval that the Applicant shall work with Staff on the side porch solution