

AGENDA # 3

City of Madison, Wisconsin

| | |
|---|---|
| REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION | PRESENTED: June 17, 2009 |
| TITLE: 602-630 East Johnson Street, 309-323 North Blair Street, 601-625 East Gorham Street – Modifications to a Previously Approved PUD(GDP-SIP) for the Renovation of Existing Residential Housing and New Residential Development. 2 nd Ald. Dist. (13998) | REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK: |
| AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary | ADOPTED: POF: |
| DATED: June 17, 2009 | ID NUMBER: |

Members present were: Bruce Woods, Marsha Rummel, Richard Slayton, Richard Wagner, Todd Barnett, Dawn Weber, Jay Ferm and Mark Smith.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of June 17, 2009, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL** of modifications to a previously approved PUD(GDP-SIP) located at 602-630 East Johnson Street, 309-323 North Blair Street, 601-625 East Gorham Street. Appearing on behalf of the project were Richard Arnesen and J. Randy Bruce, both representing Stone House Development; Ken Saiki, Ald. Bridget Maniaci, District 2; and Dave Glusick. The modified plans as presented featured the following:

- The site/landscape plan features a simplified walk network to the rear of the proposed structures and the existing residential housing to remain abutting Gorham Street.
- The modified plan features more greenspace and less hardscape, in combination with two proposed detention basins to facilitate on-site infiltration featuring a rain garden mix of plantings.
- A reduced size pergola/staired entry in rear garden area is provided between existing and proposed developments.
- Design maintains some of the raised gardens as previously proposed with a smaller raised terrace between housing types.
- A review of the modified building elevations emphasized the elimination of a use of brick above the first floor line with the incorporation of either the use of a renaissance stone or brick base treatment.
- Following a review of the material/color palette in context with building elevations, Glusick provided a review of the stormwater management plan including detention/rain garden details. Bruce further noted potential for the storage of gray water off of the northwest corner of the easterly building.
- The addition of electric and solar hot water with solar electric featured on the southwest faces of the roof and solar hot water atop roofs with the emphasis on the minimization of views.

Following the presentation the Commission noted the following:

- The building faces between buildings an issue with the lack of detailing that should pick up the verticality is down on the streetside elevation in order to resolve its blank appearance.
- Stagger window locations on the non-street side elevations, as well as consider adding more landscaping, corridors between the non-street side elevations.
- Add a slight break such as vertical elements and color to reduce bland effect on non-street side building elevations.

Ald. Bridget Maniaci spoke in favor of the project, noting her support of both site and building plan modifications.

ACTION:

On a motion by Barnett, seconded by Wagner, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a vote of (8-0). The motion required adjustments to the non-street side elevations of the buildings to resolve issues relevant to their bland and blank appearance as noted, with modifications to come back to staff for final approval.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 6, 6.5, 7, 7, 7 and 7.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 602-630 East Johnson Street, 309-323 North Blair Street, 601-625 East Gorham Street

| | Site Plan | Architecture | Landscape Plan | Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc. | Signs | Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular) | Urban Context | Overall Rating |
|-----------------------|-----------|--------------|----------------|--------------------------------|-------|-------------------------------------|---------------|----------------|
| Member Ratings | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | 7 |
| | 6 | 7 | 6 | 7 | - | 7 | 8 | 7 |
| | 6 | 6 | 6 | 7 | - | 6 | 7 | 7 |
| | 6 | 6 | 6 | - | - | 6 | 6 | 6 |
| | 6.5 | 6.5 | 6 | - | - | 6.5 | 7 | 6.5 |
| | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | 7 |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |

General Comments:

- Looks good but side elevations for buildings 2/3 are stripped down.
- Side elevations need more attention. Seems less well-designed and it is entry thru property. Handsome project, good design but loss of historic fabric of East Johnson changes character of signature central neighborhood.
- I would like more of a pedestrian connection from parking to Johnson Street. Simple vertical breaks or elements on the façades between buildings. Very nice dense urban infill project.