



**Project Name & Address:** 1131 Jenifer Street

**Application Type(s):** Certificate of Appropriateness for an addition in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District

**Legistar File ID #** [61545](#)

**Prepared By:** Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

**Date Prepared:** August 11, 2020

## Summary

**Project Applicant/Contact:** James Merett, Innovative Carpentry LLC

**Requested Action:** The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a screened porch addition and deck.

## Background Information

**Parcel Location/Information:** The subject site is located in the Third Lake Ridge Local Historic District.

### Relevant State Statute Section:

**Wisc SS 62.23(7)(em)2m.** In the repair or replacement of a property that is designated as a historic landmark or included within a historic district or neighborhood conservation district under this paragraph, a city shall allow an owner to use materials that are similar in design, color, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities.

### Relevant Ordinance Sections:

- 41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.** A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.
- (1) New construction or exterior alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
    - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.
    - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.
    - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
    - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City’s historic resources.

**41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.**

- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.
- (a) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned residential use that are located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
    - 1. Height.
    - 2. Landscape treatment.
    - 3. Rhythm of mass and spaces.
  - (b) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical proportion and rhythm of solids to voids.
  - (c) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical materials.
  - (d) Alterations of the roof of any existing structure shall retain its existing historical appearance.
  - (e) Alterations of the street facade(s) shall retain the original or existing historical proportional relationships of door sizes to window sizes.

**Analysis and Conclusion**

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to add two new window openings with one on each side of the house, and replace an existing small balcony with an enclosed porch with second-story balcony on the back of the house. As part of enclosing the porch, the window, and siding within the enclosed area will change, but once that becomes an interior of the enclosed space, it is outside of the purview of the historic preservation ordinance as it is no longer an exterior alteration.

The two new windows are located near the rear of the building and significantly set back from the street façade. There are a variety of existing window sizes on the building and these two new windows are proportional to the taller windows that are the predominate style on the building.

The 12-foot by 12-foot porch will be enclosed with screens. The railings, tongue-and-groove deck boards, and posts will be wood. The style is one typically approved by the Landmarks Commission. While a railing on the front of the house would need to be painted, this porch and balcony are located out of view from the public right-of-way, so the proposed natural oil finish is not problematic. It is also comparable to the unfinished rear porches and balconies on the two adjacent properties.

Attached to the porch will be a new landing with stairs leading to the ground. It will be similar in style and of the same materials as the porch and balcony. The applicant is proposing to replace the existing rear exterior door with a full-light door.

A discussion of the relevant ordinance sections follows:

**41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.**

- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.
- (a) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned residential use that are located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
    - 1. The new porch and balcony are both similar in height to the existing balcony and of a similar height to the porch and balconies on the two adjacent properties.

2. N/A
3. This porch and balcony are comparable to the enclosed porch and balcony on one side and the open porch and balcony on the other side, which makes this porch proposal compatible with the nearby rhythm of masses and spaces. The new windows are of a similar size and placement on the sides of the building for the existing building and are comparable to the rhythm of window openings on other buildings in the vicinity.

- (b) N/A
- (c) N/A
- (d) N/A
- (e) N/A

## Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness are met and recommends the Landmarks Commission approve the project as proposed.